New Contree is an interdisciplinary focussed peer reviewed journal within the Historical and Human Sciences published by the School of Basic Sciences, Vaal Triangle Campus, North-West University. To accommodate more articles from a variety of Historical and Human Sciences disciplines (that especially reflects a fundamental historical approach), this Journal has slightly altered its name from 2008.

Opinions expressed or conclusions arrived at in articles and book reviews are those of the authors and are not to be regarded as those of the North-West University or the editorial staff of New Contree. Two editions of New Contree are annually published.

Articles appearing in New Contree are abstracted and/or indexed in Index to South African periodicals, Historical Abstracts, and America: History and Life. The Journal is also listed in The Bowker International Serials Database (New York), The Serials Directory (Birmingham, USA), The International African Bibliography (London) and Ebsco Host.

Notes for contributors

Manuscripts, in any of the official languages, not exceeding fifteen pages, (one and a half spacing, 12 font) and on a CD disk or send via electronic mail to the editor as an attachment in WORD are welcome. A summary/abstract must also be included in a different language to that of the manuscript. Contributors are asked to write clearly and simply and to avoid technical terms as far as possible. Please note: The language of both the summary/abstract and the article must be professionally edited before sending the article for peer reviewing to New Contree. Sufficient proof must be provided in this regard when presenting the article to New Contree for peer reviewing. Also provide six to ten keywords.

The use of informative subheadings is important. For general style and reference techniques of articles, contributors are recommended to refer to the latest New Contree issue (and the last pages of this publication). One copy of the entire issue will be sent to a contributor of an article. Page fees will be charged. As New Contree is an accredited journal, the cost of an article can be recouped from the earnings on research outputs. Authors employed by South African Universities and other tertiary institutions will be requested to subsidise their articles. Authors are not expected to pay for articles themselves. Approach the institution on your behalf.
Editorial Advisory Committee

Prof. Patrick Furlong (Alma College, USA)
Prof. Albert Grundlingh (University of Stellenbosch, Western Cape)
Prof. Louis Grundlingh (University of Johannesburg, Aucklandpark)
Prof. Karen Harris (University of Pretoria, Pretoria)
Prof. Ackson M Kanduza (University of Botswana, Botswana)
Dr. Simon Maile (Director, Human Science and Research Council, Pretoria)
Prof. Eric Nealer (North-West University, Potchefstroom Campus)
Prof. Robert C-H Shell (University of the Western Cape & Commissioner of Truth and Justice for Mauritius)
Mr. Nick Southey (University of South Africa, Pretoria)

Book Review Editor

Vacant

Editor

Prof. Elize S van Eeden (North-West University, Vanderbijlpark Campus)

Layout & Coverdesign

Artz Studio +27 (0)82 553 6463 / +27 (016) 423 5412 / Email: yolandi.yevents@gmail.com

Postal address - New Contree

The editorial staff New Contree
School of Basic Sciences
North-West University
PO Box 1174
Vanderbijlpark
1900

Telephone: (016) 910 3451 or (016) 910 3469
Email for enquiries or article presentations:
elize.vaneeden@nwu.ac.za

Subscription fees for 2010
(A subscription form is available on the last page of this journal)
R 200.00 (Local institutions)
R 170.00 (Individual members - local)
R350.00 (Africa)

Overseas subscribers
R550.00
ISSN 0379-9867
Contents / Inhoud

Pieter de Klerk
Streeksgeskiedskrywing en koloniale verhoudinge: Die 1
Wes-Kaapse platteland en die Karoo

Elize S van Eeden, Eric J Nealer & Mariette Liefferink
A historiography on past scientific research and references to 37
environmental health concerns in the Merafong gold mining
region of South Africa

Shelley Farrington & Elmarie Venter
A historical overview of the study of family business as an 57
evolving field

Grietjie Verhoef
Entrepreneur, social capital and the survival of Afrikaner 75
business on the Witwatersrand, 1930–2007: The case of
Burgers Brothers Clothing enterprise

Hanlie dos Santos
Fashion and family business entrepreneurs: Jaff and Company, 107
1931 – 1980

Elmarie Venter & Shelley Farrington
The nature of family businesses and their importance for 131
economic development

Leandie Maritz, Ingrid Thorius & Grietjie Verhoef
“Your satisfaction, not mere profit is our aim”: A traditional 155
English family enterprise and the textile industry – Arthur
Bales and Son, from 1902

Pieter Warnich, Elize S van Eeden & Lukas Meyer
‘n Vergelykende internasionale perspektief op die historiese 183
verloop en invloed van Uitkomsgebaseerde Onderwys (UGO)
op Geskiedenis as skoolvak in Suid-Afrika (Deel Een)
Book Review

Lewis Jonker & Emmanuel Manzungu

Playing the Water Dance

A guide to conducting and reporting interdisciplinary research in water resources management (Reviewed by Elize S van Eeden, Sun Press, AFRICAN SUN MeDIA, Stellenbosch, 2008)

New Contree guidelines for writing an article 213
New Contree references and footnotes 215
New Contree subscription 220
Streekgeskiedskrywing en koloniale verhoudinge: Die Wes-Kaapse platteland en die Karoo

Pieter de Klerk
Vaaldriehoekkampus
Noordwes-Universiteit

Abstract

Scholars who specialize in local or regional history study the characteristics and development of a society on a micro-level. These characteristics include demographic, economic, social, political, juridical, cultural and religious aspects. Historical writing on the relations between the indigenous Khoisan and the Western colonizers in the Cape Colony during the period before 1900 has a strong socio-economic focus. Furthermore, regional differences have received little attention in these texts. Therefore a regional approach may provide a fuller and more nuanced perspective. A provisional examination of historical studies on rural areas in the western part of the Cape Colony and the Karoo was done for the purpose of this article and only seventeen studies were found that contain significant research results regarding the relations between the colonizers and the colonized peoples. In the article these results are evaluated. It appears that, although the seventeen studies provide important information, none of them deal with the whole spectrum of relations between the indigenous peoples and the colonizers. The available source material inevitably puts restrictions on the results that can be achieved. However, in none of the studies optimal use was made of all the relevant sources. There is a strong need for more research in the field of regional history with a focus on colonial relations.

Keywords: Regional history; Rural areas; Colonial relations; Cape Colony; Boland; Karoo; Khoisan; Stock farmers; Western Cape.

Inleiding

Die ingypende verskille wat tussen historici bestaan ten opsigte van die interpretasie van kernaspekte van die Suid-Afrikaanse geskiedenis, hang nou
saam met verskille in filosofiese ideologiese uitgangspunte, maar is ook meegebraai deur die besondere wyse waarop die Europese kolonisasie van Suid-Afrika verloop het. In die Verenigde State van Amerika is ’n Westerse samelewing gevestig waarin die oorspronklike inheemse groepe heeltemal verdring is en die geskiedenis van hierdie land word tans deur die meeste historici vanuit ’n Westerse perspektief beskou en beoordeel. Ten opsigte van Suid-Afrika, daarenteen, moes aanvanklik wyd aanvaarde interpretasies vanuit die gesigspunt van die Westerse koloniseerders plek maak vir beskouings waarin die inheemse bewoners in die sentrum staan. ’n Belangrike hulpmiddel om ’n meer gebalanseerde beeld van die Suid-Afrikaanse geskiedenis te vorm, is om dit binne die wyer konteks van die wêreldgeskiedenis te bekry. Aan die ander kant kan die studie van kleiner geografiese eenhede binne Suid-Afrika, soos streke of stede, ook help om ’n meer ewewigtige beeld van die groter geheel te vorm.

’n Verdere faktor wat tot verskille in historiese interpretrasie lei, is dat historici soms eensydig klem le op óf politieke óf ekonomiese óf sosiale ontwikkelinge. Om ’n goeie begrip te vorm van die aard en kompleksiteit van die Suid-Afrikaanse samelewing, en ook van die verhoudinge wat daar vanaf die sewentiende eeu tussen die Europese koloniseerders en die inheemse bevolkingsgroep in Suid-Afrika geheers het, moet al die aspekte, polities, ekonomies, sosiaal, kultureel, godsdienstig, ensovoorts, in oënskou geneem word. Wanneer ontwikkelinge in die hele Suid-Afrika, of in ’n groot deel daarvan, bestudeer word, is dit moeilik om aan al die relevante aspekte deeglik aandag te gee. As navorsing tot ’n klein geografiese gebied beperk word, is die moontlikheid groter om die verschillende aspekte tot hul reg te laat kom en integrale geskiedenis te skryf. Die bestudering van plaaslike geskiedenis bied

1 Die verskillende denkrigtinge onder Suid-Afrikaanse historici word onder meer bespreek in: FA van Jaarsveld, Omstrede Suid-Afrikaanse verlede: geskiedenisideologie en die skuldvraagstuk (Johannesburg, Lex Patria, 1984); K Smith, The changing past; trends in South African historical writing (Johannesburg, Southern, 1988); P Maylam, South Africa’s racial past; the history and historiography of racism, segregation and apartheid (Aldershot, Ashgate, 2001); HE Stolten (ed), History making and present day politics; the meaning of collective memory in South Africa (Uppsala, Nordska Afrikainstitutet, 2007).

2 Die term koloniseerders eerder as die term koloniste word meesal in die artikel gebruik, omdat onder koloniste (soms ook setlaars genoem) gewoonlik verstaan word mense wat hulle permanent in ’n land vestig as boere, handelaars, ensovoorts, terwyl koloniseerders ook, onder meer, amptenare, soldate en sendelinge insluit wat nie noodwendig permanente inwoners van die land is nie.

3 Vergelyk P de Klerk, “Van ’n Eurosentriese na ’n Afroentriese geskiedenis; is daar ’n alternatief?”, Koers, 59(1), 1994, pp 53-68.

besondere moontlikhede om ‘n samelewing op mikrovlak in al sy fasette te ondersoek.\(^5\)

In hoeverre het streekgeskiedskrywing daartoe bygedra om kennis van en insig in die verhoudinge tussen koloniseerders en inboorlinge in Suid-Afrika te bevorder? In hierdie artikel word gepoog om die vraag gedeeltelik te beantwoord. Daar word net gelet op streekgeskiedskrywing wat gedoen is ten opsigte van die westelike helfte van Suid-Afrika, die gebied wat deur die Khoikhoi en die San bewoon is voor die begin van Europese kolonisasie. In die oostelike helfte van die land was die inboorlinge hoofsaaklik Bantoesprekende stamme en dié gebied was oor die algemeen digter bevolk as die westelike dele vir die deur koloniseerders van Europese afkoms binnegedring is. Studies oor plaslike geskiedenis betreffende die oostelike helfte van Suid-Afrika verg daarom ‘n aparte ondersoek. In hierdie artikel word gekonsentreer op die geskiedskrywing van plattelandse streke, waar die Europese koloniseerders hulle hoofsaaklik as boere gevestig het, in die tydperk voor 1900.

As agtergrond tot die bespreking van die streekhistoriese studies word enkele algemene opmerkinge rakende streeksgeskiedskrywing en die geskiedskrywing van die verhoudinge tussen inboorlinge en koloniseerders in die Kaapkolonie gemaak.

**Streekgeskiedskrywing**

Plaaslike geskiedenis word reeds eeue lank in die Westerse wêreld beoefen.\(^6\) Vanaf die 1950s was daar ‘n oplewing in die belangstelling in hierdie vertakking van die geskiedkunde en is onder meer verskeie verenigings vir plaaslike geskiedenis in Noord-Amerika, Groot-Brittanje en Duitsland opgerig, wat daartoe bygedra het om dit as ‘n akademiese dissipline uit te bou.\(^7\) Die Franse Annalesskool het die wyse waarop streekgeskiedenis beoefen is sterk beïnvloed.\(^8\) Onder die Annalesskrywers is dit veral E le Roy Ladurie wat ‘n nuwe

---

rigting in die streeksgeskiedenis aangedui het met sy Les paysans de Languedoc,9 waarin hy ‘n “totale” geskiedenis van die kleinboersamelewing in die Franse landstreek Languedoc van die vyftiende tot die agtiende eeu probeer skryf.10 Hy maak gebruik van dokumente soos grondbelastingregisters en lyste van pryse en hone wat hy statisties verwerk om ‘n groot verskeidenheid afleidings te maak. Le Roy Ladurie bied egter nie net ‘n ekonomiese geskiedenis nie, maar ook ‘n geskiedenis van die leefwyse en kultuur van die boerebevolking in die betrokke gebied. Meer onlangs het AT van Deursen met sy boek oor die samelewing in ‘n sewentiende-eeuse Nederlandse boere- en vissersdorp, waarin onder andere heelwat statistiese afleidings uit dokumentêre gegewens gemaak word, ‘n navolgenswaardige voorbeeld gestel vir streekshistorici.11

Le Roy Ladurie en Van Deursen se navorsing handel oor die tydperk toe die oorgrote meerderheid Europeërs op die platteland gewoon en ‘n bestaan as landbouers gemaak het. Die Industriële Omwenteling, wat in die agtiende eeu in Europa begin het, het die geleit tot ‘n ingrypende verandering in die aard van die samelewing. Daarom kan plaaslike geskiedenis ondervinde word in die geskiedenis van plattelandse streke en dorpe, wat soms kortweg streeksgeskiedenis genoem word, en stedelike geskiedenis, waarin hoofsaaklik die geskiedenis van geïndustrialiseerde gebiede bestudeer word.

Soos uit bibliografieë van die Suid-Afrikaanse geskiedenis blyk, het daar reeds ‘n hele aantal werke op die terrein van die plaaslike geskiedenis van Suid-Afrika verskyn.12 Baie van hierdie geskrifte is in opdrag van stadsrade gelever, ander is die produkte van skrywers wat plaaslike geskiedenis as ‘n stokperdjie beoefen het, en daar is ook verskeie studies gedoen met die oog op die verwerwing van meesters- en doktorsgrade in geskiedenis. Die werke is dan ook van wisselende wetenskaplike gehalte. In 1975 het die Raad vir Geesteswetenskaplike Navorsing (RGN), ‘n regeringsestelling, ‘n afdeling vir streeksgeskiedenis gestig en in 1977 begin om ‘n eie tydskrif, Contree, uit te gee.13 As ‘n uitvloeisel van ‘n onderzoek na navorsingsprioriteite het die RGN besluit dat navorsing oor tussengroepverhoudinge ‘n belangrike prioriteit is en dat streekhistoriese navorsing ‘n waardevolle bydrae tot navorsing op

11 AT van Deursen, Een dorp in de polder; Graaf in de zeventiende eeu (Amsterdam, Bert Bakker, 1994).
Streekgeskiedskrywing en koloniale verhoudinge

hierdie terrein kan lewer.\textsuperscript{14} Die Afdeling vir Navorsing oor Streek- en Sosio-ekonomiese Geskiedenis, soos dit amptelik bekend gestaan het, is egter in 1991 gesluit. Gedurende die sestien jaar van sy bestaan is daar verskeie studies gedaan, wat hoofsaaklik handel oor gedeeltelik of volledig geïndustrialiseerde dorpe en stedelike gebiede. Benewens kort bydraes in \textit{Contree}, is net een groter studie oor ‘n bepaalde landstreek in die toenmalige Kaapprovinsie, naamlik die Drakensteinvallei, gepubliseer.\textsuperscript{15} Uit die bibliografieë in die \textit{South African Historical Journal} blyk dit daar in die periode na 1990 maar baie min publikasies op die terrein van streekgeskiedenis verskyn het. Dit wil voorkom of die belangstelling in hierdie afdeling van die geskiedkunde in Suid-Afrika afgeneem het.

Beskou teen die agtergrond van die werke van Le Roy Ladurie en Van Deursen en die riglyne van die RGN,\textsuperscript{16} sou die vernaamste aspekte rakende die verhouding tussen inboorlinge en koloniseerders wat in ‘n streekhistoriese studie na vore behoort te kom, kortliks so saamgevat kan word:

- demografiese aspekte: die getalsverhoudinge tussen inboorlinge en koloniste, maar ook tussen, onder meer, slave en Khoisanplaaswerkers (in die vroeë periode), plaas- en dorpsbewoners en inwoners van sendingstasies en van ander dele van die streek;
- sosiale aspekte: die aanwesigheid van rasse- en ander sosiale skeidslyne; meester-kneegverhoudings op plase en in dorpe; huwelike en seksuele verhoudinge tussen lede van verskillende groepe; interaksie tussen groepe in kerke, skole en verenigings;
- ekonomiese aspekte: die verhouding tussen verskillende groepe in landboubedrywighede; die vergoeding van plaaswerkers; die rol van lede van die onderskeie groepe in handel en sakebedrywighede op dorpe; die invloed van sendingstasies en hul inwoners op die ekonomie van die streek;
- kulturele aspekte: die tale en dialekte van die streek en verskille tussen groepe in hierdie verband; onderwysstoestande en verskille in hierdie opsig tussen die groepe; die geletterdheidspeil van elke groep; die invloed van kerk en sending op die godsdiensstige beskouwing en praktieke van die inboorlinge en op verhoudinge tussen die groepe; die invloed van Khoisankultuur op die

\textsuperscript{14} CC Eloff, \textit{Streekhistoriese navorings en die SAPGN}, p. 9.
\textsuperscript{15} AG Oberholster & P van Breda (reds.), \textit{Paarlvallei, 1687-1987} (Pretoria, Raad vir Geesteswetenskaplike Navorsing, 1987). PHR Snyman se werke oor die geskiedenis van Daniëlskuil, Kuruman, Olifantskloof en Postmasburg handel oor dorpe wat tot landbou- en mynbousentums ontwikkel het en die hoofklem val op die ontwikkelinge van die twintigste eeu.
koloniseerders; verskille en ooreenkomsstreek tussen groepe in kulturele gebruik, lewenstyl en beskouinge;

- politieke en juridiese aspekte: die betrokkenheid van elke groep by plaaslike en ander owerhede; die regstelsel en hoe dit die verskillende groepe raak; misdaad en konflik tussen boere en werkers.

**Geskiedskrywing oor die verhoudinge tusken koloniseerders en inboorlinge in die Kaapkolonie**

In werke wat in die laat negentiende en vroeë twintigste eeu verskyn het, staan die blanke bevolkingsgroep in die sentrum van die geskiedskrywing. Die eerste band van die bekende oorsigwerk van GM Theal handel oor die leefwyse van die inheemse groepe, maar verder word in sy reeks van elf bande, waarin hoofsaaklik net historiese gebeure in kronologiese volgorde behandel word, nie besondere aandag gegee aan die verhoudinge tusken koloniseerders en inboorlinge nie. Vroeë Afrikaanse historici was in die eerste plek geïnteresseerd in die geskiedenis van die (blanke) Afrikaners. PJ van der Merwe het byvoorbeeld deeglike navorsing gedoen oor die verspreiding van die veeboere in die Kaapkolonie en die verhouding met die inboorlinge kom in sy geskryfte telkens ter sprake, maar word nie in besonder bespreek nie.

WM Macmillan en JS Marais kan as pioniers met betrekking tot die geskiedskrywing oor die bruin mense van die Kaapkolonie beskou word. Eers heelwat later is daar indringende studie gedoen oor, onder meer, die invloed van die Europese vestiging op die Khoikhoi in die periode voor ongeveer 1715, sendingwerk onder die Khoisan, die totstandkoming van ’n kleurskeidslyn en die hervestiging van Khoikhoi- en Griekwagroepe

---


19 Vergelyk FA van Jaarsveld, *Wie en wat is die Afrikaner?* (Kaapstad, Tafelberg, 1981), pp. 149-152.

in die oostelike grensgebied van die Kaapkolonie.\textsuperscript{21} Navorsing wat tot in die tagtigerjare gedoen is oor die Khoisan, die slawe en die koloniseerders is saamgevat in ‘n belangrike sintesewerk oor die vroeë ontwikkeling van die samelewing in die Kaapkolonie.\textsuperscript{22} Hierdie publikasie, wat tans nog die status van ‘n standaardwerk geniet, gee ‘n taamlik ewewigtige beeld van veral die sosiale en ekonomiese verhoudinge tussen die verskillende groepe in die Kaapkolonie voor 1840. Dit is egter nie ‘n diepgaande ontleiding van die verhoudinge tussen inboorlinge en koloniste wat alle aspekte daarvan betref nie en handel ook nie oor ontwikkelinge in die tweede helfte van die negentiende eeu nie.

In sommige resente geskiedwerke oor die verhoudinge tussen die Khoikhoi en die veeboere in die oostelike dele van die Kaapkolonie gedurende die agtiende eeu word aangevoer word dat die boere in dié gebied hulle werkers feitlik soos slawe behandel het,\textsuperscript{23} ’n beskouing wat deur ander historici bevraagteken word.\textsuperscript{24} Daar het ook ‘n aantal studies verskyn waarin bepaalde aspekte van arbeidsverhoudinge op die Kaapse platteland gedurende die negentiende eeu bespreek word.\textsuperscript{25}

In die afgelope twee dekades is ‘n hele aantal werke gepubliseer oor sendelinge en sendingstasies in die Kaapkolonie. Onder invloed van materialistiese beskouing word sendelinge deur sommige skrywers gesien as agente van die

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{enumerate}
\item R Elphick & H Giliomee (eds), \textit{The shaping of South African society, 1652-1840} (Cape Town, Maskew Miller Longman, 1989; revised edition).
\item C Crais, \textit{The making of the colonial order; white supremacy and black resistance in the Eastern Cape, 1770-1865} (Johannesburg, Witwatersrand University Press, 1992), pp. 9-54; S Newton-King, \textit{Masters and servants on the Cape eastern frontier, 1760-1803} (Cambridge, University Press, 1999).
\end{enumerate}
\end{footnotesize}
koloniseerders en die kapitalistiese stelsel.\(^{26}\) In verskeie resente studies word die invloed van sendingstasies op die voorsiening van arbeid aan die boere bespreek.\(^{27}\) In ‘n belangrike bydrae tot die geskiedskrywing oor die sending toon E Elbourne aan dat sendelinge van die Londense Sendinggenootskap juis gepoog het om die inboorlinge teen ekonomiese uitbuiting te beskerm en dat die Khoikhoi die Christendom gebruik het in hulle weerstand teen aspekte van kolonialisme.\(^{28}\) Soos die geskiedskrywing oor arbeidsverhoudinge is resente werke oor die sending onder die Khoisan dikwels sterk beïnvloed deur ideologiese uitgangspunte.

’n Baie belangrike resente studie is dié van N. Penn oor, soos hy dit noem, die noordelike grensgebied van die Kaapkolonie.\(^{29}\) Hy beskryf daarin die botsings tussen die veeboere en die Khoisan in die loop van die agtiende eeu, waarby die inboorlinge al verder teruggedring en gedeeltelik onderwerp is deur die koloniseerders, totdat al die Khoisan wat oorgebly het in die Kaapkolonie (wat intussen uitgebrei is tot aan die Oranjerivier) heetemal onder die gesag van die koloniseerders gebring is.

Karel Schoeman, wat ook bekendheid verwerf het as romanskrywer, het in die afgelope jare ’n hele aantal werke oor die geskiedenis van die Kaapkolonie, veral in die Kompanjiestyd, die lig laat sien.\(^{30}\) Hoewel die koloniseerders in die meeste van sy boeke oor die Kaapse samelewing in die sentrum staan, gee hy baie aandag aan die slave en die Khoikhoi en probeer hy die verhouding tussen hierdie groepe belig. Ook oor die sending in die laat agtiende en vroeë negentiende eeu het hy verskeie werke gepubliseer. In sy geskryfde speel ideologiese uitgangspuntes geensins ’n prominente rol nie en, gesien in die konteks van die uiteenlopende interpretasies van die koloniseerder-inboorlingverhouding in die Kaapkolonie, toon hy oor die algemeen ’n ewewigtige benadering in sy sterk beskrywende studies van die vroeë Kaapse samelewing.

---


\(^{28}\) E Elbourne, Blood ground; colonialism, missions, and the contest for Christianity in the Cape Colony and Britain, 1799-1853 (Montreal, McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2002).

\(^{29}\) N Penn, The forgotten frontier; colonists and Khoisan on the Cape’s northern frontier in the 18th century (Athens, Ohio, University Press, 2005).

Daar is duidelik nog baie ruimte vir verdere navorsing oor verhoudinge tussen die koloniseerders en die inboorlinge in die Kaapkolonie. In resente werke word klem gelê op sosiaal-ekonomiese aspekte en min aandag aan kulturele faktore gegee. Streekgeskiedskrywing kan dus ‘n belangrike bydrae lever om perspektief op die volle spektrum van verhoudinge tussen die verskillende groepe te verkry en ook die verskille tussen streke na vore te bring.

**Besondere steekshistoriese studies**

Ouer historiese studies oor streke en dorpe in die Kaapkolonie handel feitlik uitsluitend oor die blanke element van die bevolking. HJH Vermeulen begin byvoorbeeld sy werk oor die geskiedenis van Middelburg met die noordwaartse beweging van die "blanke pioniers."31 Hy toon aan dat die veediefstalle deur die San daartoe geleë het dat die boere hulle probeer uitroei het, maar dat dit in 1798 vervang is met ’n beleid van versoening, waar gepoog is om vee aan hulle uit te deel en hul vertroue te wen.32 Daar is verder ’n hoofstuk oor sendingwerk deur die Nederduits Gereformeerde (of NG) gemeente Middelburg, maar dit bevat hoofsaaklik gewens oor die (blanke) sendelinge.33 Selfs in afdelings oor die plase en landboubedrywighede in die distrik word nie na die bruin plaaswerkiers verwys nie. ELP Stals se beknopte oorsig oor die geskiedenis van George en distrik verwys net in enkele sinne na Khoikhoigroepe wat aanvanklik in die gebied gewoon het34 en bevat ook ’n paragraaf oor sendingwerk,35 maar in hoofstukke oor onderwys en boerdery word nie na die posisie van die Khoikhoi, slave en bruin mense verwys nie. Ook in Engelstalige publikasies, soos werke oor die Sondagsriviervallei en Knysna en Plettenbergbaai, word feitlik net oor die blanke inwoners geskryf.36 Daar is ook baie latere boeke en artikels wat oor streke en dorpe in die Wes-Kaap en die Karoo handel en min of geen aandag gee aan die verhouding tussen die verskillende bevolkingsgroep nie.

Alle streekhistoriese werke wat moontlik van belang kon wees en opgespoor kon word, is deurgegaan. Sewentien studies is gevind wat resultate van navorsing

---

34 ELP Stals, *George; die verhaal van die dorp en distrik* (George, Munisipaliteit en Afdelingsraad van George, 1961), pp. 2, 15.
36 J Meiring, *Sundays River valley; its history and settlement* (Cape Town, Balkema, 1959); W Tapson, *Timber and tides; the story of Knysna and Plettenberg Bay* (Cape Town, Juta, 1961).
oor verhoudinge tussen die verskillende bevolkingsgroepe bevat. Meer as die helfte van dié werke gee geen besondere aandag aan die verhoudinge tussen koloniseerders en inboorlinge nie, maar dra tog by om wetenskaplike kennis oor hierdie tema uit te brei. Die geskripte word in ‘n geografiese volgorde behandel, veral omdat daar oor die geskiedenis van sommige streke meer as een studie verskyn het en dit daarom voor-die-hand-liggend is om hulle saam te groepeer. By die besprekings van dié studies word gefokus op die verhouding tussen blanke boere en dorpsmense aan die een kant en die Khoikhoi, San en bruin mense aan die ander kant, maar die slawe, wat saam met Khoisan en Europeërs die voorouers van die bruin mense vorm, kon nie heeltemal buite beskouing gelaat word nie. Daar word gepoog om in die bespreking na vore te bring aan watter aspekte van die verhoudinge tussen die verskillende bevolkingsgroepe aandag gegee word, hoe deeglik dit gedoen word en watter gevolgtrekkinge in dié verband gemaak word.

**Stellenbosch**

Die proefskrif van A Biewenga is gegrond op dokumente in die Kaapstadse staatsargief, die argief van die NG Kerk en die argief van die Verenigde Oos-Indiese Kompanjie (VOC) in Den Haag, asook op verskeie wetenskaplike studies wat al oor die onderwerp gedoen is. Hy probeer vasstel in hoeverre die samelewing in die Kaapkolonie gedurende die periode van 1680 tot 1730 ooreenkom met dié in Nederland gedurende dieselfde tydperk. Biewenga doen onder meer vergelykings met die toestande in Graft, soos beskryf deur Van Deursen, en hy is duidelijk deur Van Deursen se benadering beïnvloed. Hy het sy studie beperk tot die distrik Stellenbosch, wat in daardie periode byna die hele kolonie, uitgesonder die Kaapse skiereiland, uitgemaak het, en die drieonderdjarige bestaan van Stellenbosch te gedenk, is ’n omvattende oorsig oor die geskiedenis van die dorp gepubliseer waaraan ’n hele aantal wetenskaplikes meegewerk het: F Smuts (red.), *Stellenbosch drie eeu* (Stellenbosch, Stellenbosse Stadsraad, 1979). Die verhouding tussen koloniseerders en inboorlinge word daarin glad nie bespreek nie. Daar word selfs baie min na die bruin bevolkingsgroep verwys. JL Hattingh, *Die eerste vryswartes van Stellenbosch, 1679-1720* (Bellville, Universiteit van Wes-Kaapland, 1981) handel, soos die titel aandui, oor vrygestelde slawe en die Khoikhoi kom daarin feitlik nie ter sprake nie. H Giliomee skryf in sy *Nog altyd hier gewees; die storie van ’n Stellenbosche gemeenskap* (Kaapstad, Tafelberg, 2007) oor die bruin mense van Stellenbosch, maar hoofsaaklik wat die twintigste-euse periode betref. Die eerste gedeelte van sowat sewentig bladsye, oor die periode voor 1900, is hoofsaaklik op ander geskiedwerke gegrond en kan dus nie as ’n nuwe bydrae tot die streekgeskiedskrywing beskou word nie.

37 Daar het verskeie studies oor die geskiedenis van Stellenbosch verskyn wat nie hier bespreek word nie. Om die driehonderdjarige bestaan van Stellenbosch te gedenk, is ’n omvattende oorsig oor die geskiedenis van dié dorp gepubliseer waaraan ’n hele aantal wetenskaplikes meegewerk het: F Smuts (red.), *Stellenbosch drie eeu* (Stellenbosch, Stellenbosse Stadsraad, 1979). Die verhouding tussen koloniseerders en inboorlinge word daarin glad nie bespreek nie. Daar word selfs baie min na die bruin bevolkingsgroep verwys. JL Hattingh, *Die eerste vryswartes van Stellenbosch, 1679-1720* (Bellville, Universiteit van Wes-Kaapland, 1981) handel, soos die titel aandui, oor vrygestelde slawe en die Khoikhoi kom daarin feitlik nie ter sprake nie. H Giliomee skryf in sy *Nog altyd hier gewees; die storie van ’n Stellenbosche gemeenskap* (Kaapstad, Tafelberg, 2007) oor die bruin mense van Stellenbosch, maar hoofsaaklik wat die twintigste-euse periode betref. Die eerste gedeelte van sowat sewentig bladsye, oor die periode voor 1900, is hoofsaaklik op ander geskiedwerke gegrond en kan dus nie as ’n nuwe bydrae tot die streekgeskiedskrywing beskou word nie.

38 A Biewenga, *De Kaap de Goede Hoop; een Nederlandse vestigingskolonie, 1680-1730* (Amsterdam, Prometheus, 1999).

39 AT van Deursen, *Een dorp in de polder*…
meer in besonder die direkte omgewing van die nedersettings Stellenbosch en Drakenstein. Oor die Khoisangroepe wat aanvanklik die enigste inwoners van die gebied was, bied hy geen inligting nie. In ’n grafiek dui hy die grootte van die vryburgerbevolking aan; daaruit blyk dat die hierdie groep in die sewentiende eeu veral deur immigrasie gegroeí het, maar dat daar ook in die agtiende eeu sterk groei was as gevolg van natuurlike bevolkingsaanwas. Die vryburgerbevolking in 1688 was 132 waarvan slegs 32 vroue was.40 Hy toon aan dat in die totale bevolkingsgroei tot 1730 die aantal manlike vryburgers afgeneem en die aantal manlike slawe toegeneem het, en lei daarvan af dat die Stellenbosche samelewing al meer op slawe-arbeid gebaseer is. In 1726 het die slawe 57% van die bevolking in hierdie streek uitgemaak.41

Biewenga bereken die gemiddelde aantal persone per huishouding, waarby ook slawe ingesluit is.42 Hy gee net ‘n kort beskrywing van die aard van die boerderybedrywighede, maar dui wel aan dat daar steeds meer van Khoikhoi-arbeid, naas slawe-arbeid, gebruik gemaak is. Verder word die lewensomstandighede van die slawe en die verhouding met hul eienaars behandel. Hy dui aan dat daar maar min slavinne en gevolglik min slawekinders in die distrik was.43 Hy vermeld voorbeelde van bloedvermenging tussen blankes en persone van slaweafkoms, egskeidings, huweliksontrou en losbandigheid in die Stellenbosche samelewing.

In sy laaste hoofstuk skenk Biewenga aandag aan sosiale verhoudinge onder die verskillende groepe en toon aan dat daar, wat die vryburgers betref, groot verskille tussen ryk en arm was en dat dit met statusverskille saamgehang het. Hy meen dat rasbebewussyn in die tydperk wat hy behandel feitlik nie aan die Kaap voorgekom het nie. Die status van vrygestelde slawe en mense van gemengde rasseherkoms is dan ook nie deur hul ras bepaal nie en die vryburgers was geensins ’n suiwel blanke groep nie. Boere van slaweherkoms het byvoorbeeld soms blanke knegte gehad.44

Biewenga probeer hoofsaaklik aantoon dat die samelewing ’n sterk Nederlandse karakter gehad het en gee nie veel aandag aan die kulturele verskcheidenheid wat daar wel in die Stellenbosche distrik moes geheers het nie. Oor die Khoikhoi word baie min geskryf. Daar was in die sewentiende eeu

---

40 A Biewenga, De Kaap de Goede Hoop..., p. 29.
42 A Biewenga, De Kaap de Goede Hoop..., pp. 89-91.
43 A Biewenga, De Kaap de Goede Hoop..., pp. 196, 289.
waarskynlik heelwat selfstandige Khoikhoi in die streek wat in krale tussen die plase gewoon het en, hoewel Biewenga aandui dat baie van hulle werkers op blanke plase geword het, word die plek wat hulle daarna binne die samelewing beklee het nie in besonderhede bespreek nie.

Die verhandeling van W Dooling oor die distrik Stellenbosch in die periode 1760-1820 handel hoofsaaklik oor die regspraak en die invloed daarvan op die slawe en die Khoikhoi. In 1760 het die distrik Stellenbosch ’n baie groot deel van die kolonie, insluitende dele van die Karoo, beslaan, terwyl dit in 1820 ’n baie kleiner gebied (hoofsaaklik die dorpe Stellenbosch, Somerset-Wes en Paarl) omvat het. Dooling baken nie die gebied wat hy ondersoek nader af nie en gee dan ook net ‘n vae beeld van wat hy noem “the contours of the settler community” van die distrik. Hy dui nie aan of hierdie samelewing ook, soos in die tydperk wat Biewenga behandel, vryswartes ingesluit het nie. Dooling toon aan dat daar in die setlaarsamelewing taamlik noue bande tussen die verskillende lede, ryk en arm, bestaan het en dat die mate van solidariteit wat tussen die setlaars voorgekom het ’n invloed gehad het op die kanse op sukses van slawe en Khoikhoiwerkers wat klagtes teen hul meesters by die landdros aanhangig gemaak het. Hy kom tot die slotsom dat die VOC-bewind toegesien het dat die regstelsel nie heeltemal ’n instrument in die hande van die setlaars word nie. Indien magsmisbruik van meesters teenoor slawe en knegte hande uitruk, sou dit nie in belang van die breër samelewing wees nie. Dooling meen ook dat, volgens die morele waardes wat in die setlaargemeenskap gegeld het, wreedheid teenoor slawe en werkers as afkeurenswaardige gedrag beskou is; sodoende is die mishandeling van werkers aan bande gelê. Hoewel Dooling veral in die slawe geïnteresseerd is, verskaf hy tog interessante voorbeelde van hofsake waarby Khoikhoiwerkers betrokke was. Hy meen dat die Khoikhoi meesal in ’n beter posisie teenoor die boere was as die slawe omdat daar dikwels ’n arbeidskaarste op plase was en hulle na ’n ander plaas kon verskuif as hulle dit wou doen. Hierdeur is die moontlikheid van samewerking tussen Khoikhoi en slawe om weerstand teen hul meesters te bied beperk.

45 A Biewenga, De Kaap de Goede Hoop…, p. 92.
Die studie van P Scully sluit nou aan by dié van Dooling en handel oor regspraak en plaaswerkers in die distrik Stellenbosch in die periode 1870-1900. Scully se opvatting is, anders as Dooling se meer genuanseerde beskouing van die werking van die regstelsel in die tweede helfte van die agtiende eeu, dat die regstelsel van die laat negentiende eeu só gestruktureer was dat dit die mag van die boere oor hul werkers verstewig het. Dit blyk volgens haar onder meer daaruit dat verskeie bekleërs van openbare ampte ook plaasienaars was. Sy meen dat die dokumente rakende kriminele sake in die Stellenbosche magistraatskantoor toon dat boere die hof gebruik het, hoewel net as ‘n laaste uitweg, om hul werkers te dissiplineer. Uit diefstalsake wat teen werkers aanhangig gemaak is, kom, volgens Scully, na vore dat daar verskillende persepsies oor bestreg by boere en werkers was. Werkers het byvoorbeeld soms gemeen dat hulle die reg het om druwe op die plaas te pluk. Sy is verder van mening dat diefstal gesien kan word as ‘n manier om vir ongelykhede en onderdrukking te kompenseer. Scully skryf dat ‘n paternalistiese stelsel op die plase geheers het waarvolgens die bruin werkers soos onmondige kinders behandel is. Sy meen dat nuwe werkgeleenthede wat die ontdekking van diamante aan bruin mense gebied het hulle ‘n paar dekades lank groter bedingingsmag teenoor die boere gegee het, maar dat die beëindiging van regeringsprojekte wat aan baie bruin mense werk verskaf het en die invloei van swart mense uit die Oos-Kaap meegebring het hulle posisie teen 1900 weer verswak het. Scully verwys net kortliks na ‘n aantal hofsake en dui byvoorbeeld nie aan of daar plase is wat dikwels in diefstalsake gefigureer het nie en of daar ook plase was waar min of geen diefstal volgens die hofrekords voorgekom het nie. Die artikel wek die indruk dat in die dokumente na voorbeelde gesoek is om by ‘n vooraf bepaalde raamwerk te pas.

**Die Overberg**

Die proefskrif van EJ Prins handel, soos die skrywer self in die voorwoord

---


aandui, slegs oor die blanke inwoners van die westelike Overberg. Dit bevat
tog ‘n baie lang hoofstuk oor die invloed van die sendingstasie Baviaanskloof
(later bekend as Genadendal) op die omliggende gebied en die verhouding
tussen die Khoikhoi van Baviaanskloof en die boere van die omgewing,
in die periode voor 1806. Die twee vernaamste redes vir die boere se
teenkanting teen die vestiging van groot getalle Khoikhoi op Baviaanskloof in
die laat agtiende eeu was volgens Prins dat hulle as gevolg daarvan probleme
ondervind het om Khoikhoi-arbeid te bekom en dat dit die uitbreiding van
hul plase in die Riviersonderendvallei verhinder het. Sy bespreek kortliks
die “ewigdurende getwis tussen die Hottentotte en die koloniste oor grond,
vee wat op mekaar se eiendom oortree, ensovoorts.” Volgens haar het sowel
die Khoikhoi as die boere se optrede tot die onmin bygedra. Daar was soms
“trouelose” handelinge van Khoikhoiwerkers teenoor die boere, maar die boere
het ook nie altyd die besoldiging waarop ooreengekoms is aan die werkers
betaal nie. Dit het aanleiding geleë tot plundertogte van die Khoikhoi teen die
boere. Sy gee ook voorbeelde van skedingsmaatreëls wat deur die landdros
van Stellenbosch ten opsigte van die sendingstasie se gebied en spesifieke plase
getref is, maar soms deur die boere en soms deur die Khoikhoi oortree is. Die
opleiding wat die Khoikhoi op Baviaanskloof in boerderymetodes en
in die beoefening van ambagte ontvang het, het groot voordele vir die boere
ingehou. Verder het die sendelinge die Khoikhoi meer bewus gemaak van die
waarde van hul arbeid en boere moes hul werkers daarna hoër lone betaal as
wat vroeër die geval was.

’n Beknopte studie deur R Viljoen handel oor aspekte van dieselfde
onderwerp. Hy bespreek ook redes vir die boere se teenkanting teen die
sendingstasie Baviaanskloof en die metodes wat hulle aangewend het om te
verhoed dat hul werkers hulle daar vestig. Viljoen vermeld gevalle waar boere
hul werkers sleg behandel het en bespreek die optrede van sendelinge om
die misbruike te beëindig. Hierdie optrede het bygedra tot die vorming van
’n positiewe gesindheid van die Khoikhoi teenoor die sendelinge en het die

56 EJ Prins, “Die kulturele en ekonomiese ontwikkeling van die westelike Overberg in die agtiende en vroeë
60 EJ Prins, “Die kulturele en ekonomiese ontwikkeling van die westelike Overberg…”, pp. 326-327.
63 R Viljoen, “Moravian missionaries, Khoisan labour and the Overberg colonists at the end of the VOC era,
1792-1795”, H Bredekamp & R Ross (eds), Missions and Christianity…pp. 49-64.
verspreiding van die Christendom onder die Khoikhoi bevorder.\textsuperscript{64}

I Balie bied ’n oorsig oor die geskiedenis van Genadendal oor ’n tydperk van 250 jaar.\textsuperscript{65} Sy werk is hoofsaaklik gebaseer op bronne in die Morawiese argief. Hy dui kortliks aan watter Khoikhoigroepe voor die vestiging van die sendingstasie in die Baviaanskloofgebied gewoon het. Hy meen dat die ruilhandel met die koloniste hierdie groepe verarm het en dat botsings met die boere oor vee en grond gelei het tot heelwat bloedvergieting.\textsuperscript{66} Balie bespreek die werk van die eerste sendeling, Georg Schmidt, en dui aan dat hy gepoog het om die Khoikhoi te laat afsien van tradisionele rituele, onder meer ten opsigte van begrafnisse.\textsuperscript{67} Khoikhoikapteins wat op die sendingstasie gewoon het, het, teen vergoeding, die Kaapse bewindhebbers gehelp om gedroste slawe te vang en werkers vir openbare projekte te vind.\textsuperscript{68} Wanneer nuwe Khoikhoikapteins aangewys moet word, het die owerheid gewoonlik op advies van die sendelinge opgetree.\textsuperscript{69} In 1824 was twee derdes van die sendingstasie se inwoners volgens Balie nie meer suier Khoikhoi nie, maar die kinders van blanke vaders. Dit dui op grootskaalse seksuele omgang tussen blanke mans en Khoikhoi vroue.\textsuperscript{70} Teen die middel van die negentiende eeu het die sendelinge nog probleme gehad met jong boere wat in die dag na die sendingstasie gekom het en “hulle aan onsedelike gedrag skuldig gemaak het”.\textsuperscript{71} Voor 1800 het die meeste inwoners van Baviaanskloof nog die tradisionele Khoikhoikaros en velskort gebruik, maar skenkings van klere uit Europa het meegebring dat vanaf die negentiende eeu Westerse kleredrag algemeen voorgekom het.\textsuperscript{72} Ook die woonhuisies en meubels het ’n hoofsaaklik Westerse karakter gehad.\textsuperscript{73} Die sendelinge het ambagsopleiding bevorder met die oog daarop om die sendingstasie selfonderhoudend te maak. Hierby het die omliggende gemeenskap ook gebaat. Houtkappers, wadrywers

\begin{footnotes}
\footnote{64 R Viljoen, “Moravian missionaries…, p. 60.}
\footnote{65 I Balie, \textit{Die geskiedenis van Genadendal, 1738-1988} (Kaapstad, Perskor, 1988). Dit is die gepubliseerde weergawe van Balie se verhandeling “Die twee en ’n half eeu van Genadendal: ’n kultuur-historiese ondersoek” (MA, US, 1986). Die gepubliseerde werk bevat, anders as die verhandeling, geen voetnote nie, maar wel ’n bronnelys. Omdat die publikasie meer geredelik beskikbaar is as die manuskrip, word verwysings hier na eersgenoemde geskryf gedoen. Balie het ook ’n proefskrif getiteld ”’n Kultuurhistoriese beeld van Kaapse Morawiese sendingstasies, 1808-1919” (Ph.D., US, 1992) gelever, waarin vertal oor die sendingstasies Mamre (Groenekloof), Enon en Elim gehandel word. Die werk kan, streng gesproke, nie as streekgeskiedskrywing beskou word nie en word daarom nie in hierdie artikel bespreek nie.}
\footnote{66 I Balie, \textit{Die geskiedenis van Genadendal…, pp. 10-11.}}
\footnote{67 I Balie, \textit{Die geskiedenis van Genadendal…, p. 19.}}
\footnote{68 I Balie, \textit{Die geskiedenis van Genadendal…, p. 29.}}
\footnote{69 I Balie, \textit{Die geskiedenis van Genadendal…, p. 31.}}
\footnote{70 I Balie, \textit{Die geskiedenis van Genadendal…, p. 40.}}
\footnote{71 I Balie, \textit{Die geskiedenis van Genadendal…, p. 82.}}
\footnote{72 I Balie, \textit{Die geskiedenis van Genadendal…, pp. 41-42.}}
\footnote{73 I Balie, \textit{Die geskiedenis van Genadendal…, p. 42.}}
\end{footnotes}
en vroedvroue was veral in aanvraag in die Overberg. Gedurende oestyd het baie inwoners van Genadendal op plase gaan werk, maar die kom van landboumasjinerie vanaf ongeveer 1870 het meegebraai dat hierdie soort werk skaarser geword het. Sommige inwoners is tot kerkwerk en leraars opgelei. Genadendal het uitgegroei tot 'n dorp waar teen die middel van die eeu veral bruin mense maar ook blankes ondernemings bedryf het.

**Die Drakensteinvallei**

'n Hele aantal kundiges het bydraes gelewer tot 'n versamelwerk waarin 'n oorsig van die geskiedenis van die Drakensteinvallei (of Paarlvallei) oor 'n periode van drie eeue verskaf word. Soos verwag kan word, word in hierdie boek geen deeglike ontleding van verhoudinge tussen verskillende groepe in 'n bepaalde periode gedoen nie. GC de Wet skryf dat die Paarlvallei geen permanente inwoners gehad het voordat die eerste blanke koloniste hulle daar gevestig het. Khoikhoistamme wat in daardie tyd in die Wes-Kaap gewoon het, het die gebied net van tyd tot tyd as weiveld gebruik. Daar was ook Sangroeple in die omgewing waarmee daar nog diep in die agtiende eeu botsings voorgekom het. In die periode 1685 tot 1699 is 120 plase aan vryburgers toegeken, en in 1700 het 360 vryburgers in die vallei gewoon. Hierdie mense het ook 'n aantal vrygestelde slawe of vryswartes ingesluit, hoewel hulle presiese getal nie vasgestel kan word nie. Aanvanklik is persone wat in die diens van die VOC was, tydelik deur boere as werkers gehuur. Hulle aantal het waarskynlik afgenem terwyl die getal slawe toegeneem het. Teen 1700 was daar 80 slawe: 70 mans, ses vroue en vier kinders.

Die afdeling oor “kulturele interaksie in die Drakensteinvallei” deur WA de Klerk, is slegs op gepubliseerde werke gegrond en handel hoofsaaklik oor sosiale verhoudinge tussen blank en bruin. Die verhouding tussen boere en

---

74 I Balie, *Die geskiedenis van Genadendal…*, pp. 61, 70.
75 I Balie, *Die geskiedenis van Genadendal…*, p.102.
76 I Balie, *Die geskiedenis van Genadendal…*, p. 92.
78 AG Oberholster & P van Breda (reds.), *Paarlvallei, 1687-1987*.
werkers (aannemelijk veral slawe) op die plase kan volgens De Klerk as ‘n feodale verhouding beskryf word, met die plaaseienaar as feodale heer, direk onder hom blanke knechte en bywoners en op die laagste vlak die bruin werkers. Die boer het die werkers van behuising en dikwels ook kos voorsien en hulle en hul families was heetemal van hom afhanklik. Op die wyn- en vrugteplase het die werkers die besondere vaardighede aangeleer wat nodig is om die hierdie soort boerdery te bedryf. Ook die vroulike werkers het vaardighede verwerf om in die huise as kokke, oppassers van kinders, ensovoorts, te werk. Onder die vrygestelde slawe was die Kaapse Maleiers veral bekend vir hul werk as goed geskoolde ambagsmanne en hulle het ‘n eie stempel op die Kaapse argitektuur geplaas. In Paarl het ‘n aparte Maleierwoonbuurt tot stand gekom.83

Aanvanklik het die blanke koloniste en hul werkers saam kerkdienste bygewoon en skool gegaan.84 P Coertzen verskaf verdere inligting oor sendingaktiwiteite. Hy meld onder meer dat in 1796 begin is met sendingwerk onder die Khoikhoi in die Wamakersvallei (Wellington) en dat in 1813 ‘n sendingkerkgebou skuins oorkant die (blanke) NG kerkgebou in Paarl opgerig is.85 In ‘n verdere hoofstuk word gehandel oor die verteenwoordiging van die Paarlvallei in die Kaapse parlement vanaf 1854. Daar was altyd ‘n aantal bruin stemgeregtigdes in die Paarlomgewing; in 1909 het hulle byvoorbeeld 580 uit ‘n totaal van 2390 uitgemaak. In 1892 was daar ‘n beweging om steun te monster vir ‘n bruin kandidaat vir die parlement, maar hy is nie verkies nie.86

_Tulbagh_

A Böeseken en M Cairns, beide outeurs van ‘n hele aantal wetenskaplik historiese geskrie, se studie oor die Tulbaghkom in die agtiende eeu87 is hoofsaaklik gebaseer op dokumente in die Kaapse argiewe. Ongelukkig het hulle in groot mate slegs die inhoud van die dokumente weergegee en
min verdere interpretasie gedoen. ‘n Baie feitlike oorsig van die botsings tussen die boere en die Khoisangroepe word verskaf en daar word aangedui dat die Kompanjiesowerheid die vryburgers teen aanvalle van inheemse groepe beskerm het, maar tegelykertyd probeer verhoed het dat inboorlinge onregverdig deur burgers behandel word.88

Böeseken en Cairns beskryf die omstandighede op enkele plekke, en dit blyk dat baie boere slawe gehad het, maar dat die aantal slawe per plaas deur die loop van die agtende eeu telkens gewisel het.89 In die periode na 1770 is kinders van gemengde slawe- en Khoikhoiherkoms in diens geneem.90 Uit die gegewens oor kerklike werksaamhede, blyk dit dat daar in die agtende eeu nog min sprake was van rasseskeidslys. Baie kinders en ook volwassenes van gemengde afkoms is gedoop en het kerklidmate geword.91

Die Onder-Olifantsriviergebied

PL Scholtz behandel in sy proefskrif die ontwikkeling van die Onder-Olifantsriviergebied (wat later as die distrik Vanrhynsdorp bekend sou word) in ‘n tydperk toe daar nog maar min sprake van dorpsontwikkeling in die streek was.92 Hy het ‘n groot aantal dokumente in die versameling van die Kaapse staatsargief en die argief van die NG Kerk asook gepubliceerde reisbeskrywings gebruik. Scholtz gee ‘n baie beknopte oorsig van die leefwyse van die inheemse Khoisangroepe wat in die streek voor die koms van die blankes gewoon het93 en toon dan aan dat oorbylfsels van die Grigrikwastam, saam met nakomelingne van blankes en slawe, in die eerste dekades van die agtende eeu uit die Onder-Olifantsriviergebied verhuis het.94 Toe die blanke veeboere hulle vanaf ongeveer 1730 in die gebied gevestig het, was die streek dus grotendeels onbewoon.95 Daar was nog wel Khoisangroepe in die nabye

89 A Böeseken, & M Cairns, *The secluded valley*, p. 72.
90 A Böeseken, & M Cairns, *The secluded valley*, pp. 74-75.
93 Volgens N Penn, *The forgotten frontier*..., p. 57, was daar in die vroeë agtende eeu in die Olifantsriviervallei en omliggende gebiede Khoikhoi- en Sangroepe aanwezig en was dit moeilik om die groepe van mekaar te onderskei. Hy verwys daarom meeral na Khoisangroepe. Scholtz maak wel ‘n onderskeid tussen Khoikhoi- en Sangroepe, of Hottentote en Boesmans, soos hy hulle noem.
omgewing, met wie die boere in 1739 in ‘n oorlog betrokke was. Die “ferme optrede van die kommando’s en patrollies” het daartoe gelei dat etlike honderde Khoisan gedood is, waarna hulle uit die gebied verdwyn het.96 Teen die einde van die agtiende eeu het daar sowat 150 blankes in die streek gewoon. In hierdie geïsoleerde gebied was die gevaar groot dat die boere sou “verbaster en verheiden”, maar hy meen dat hulle sterk godsdienssin verhinder het dat dit gebeur.97

Daar het volgens Scholtz in die negentiende eeu bruin mense op plase in blanke besit gewoon,98 maar oor hulle aantal en lewensomstandighede bied hy geen inligting nie. Hy gee ‘n deeglike beskrywing van die ontwikkeling van die Ebenesersendingstasie. Dwardeur die negentiende eeu het die Khoikhoi wat daar gewoon het in baie armoedige omstandighede gelewe.99 Hy verskaf ook inligting oor die sendingskool, waar hoofsaaklik net algemene onderrig en maar min ambagsopleiding plaasgevind het.100 Scholtz kom tot die slotsom dat na 1830 “baie kleurlinge van die Onder-Olifantsrivier… kerklik en opvoedkundig selfs beter daaraan toe as die blankes” was. Die verhouding tussen die sendingstasie en die omliggende boeregemeenskap word egter nie bespreek nie. Hy dui aan dat tot diep in die negentiende eeu blank en bruin saam kerkdienste bygewoon en soms ook saam op skool was en maak dan die vreemde opmerking dat “die toepassing van die apartheidsgedagte… nie tot die verwaarlose van die kleurling” gelei het nie.101 Scholtz bespreek egter nie die tostandkoming van ‘n kleurskeidslyn in die gebied nie.102

96 PL Scholtz, “Die historiese ontwikkeling van die Onder-Olifantsrivier, 1660-1902”, Argiefjaarboek vir Suid-Afrikaanse geskiedenis, 29(1), 1966, p. 40. Scholtz verwys na hierdie groepe as Boesmans, maar volgens N Penn, The forgotten frontier..., was dit nie net Sangroepie wat in die oorlog betrokke was nie. Penn se weergawe van die gebeure toon dat Scholtz vanuit ‘n sterk blanke perspektief oor hierdie botsings skryf, terwyl Penn veral die redes vir die Khoisan se optrede en die gevolge wat die oorlog vir hulle gehad het, na vore bring.


98 PL Scholtz, “Die historiese ontwikkeling van die Onder-Olifantsrivier, 1660-1902”, Argiefjaarboek vir Suid-Afrikaanse geskiedenis, 29(1), 1966, p. 120


102 K Schoeman, dui in sy Die moord op Hesje van der Merwe 19 Oktober 1837 (Calvinia, Die Hantam Huis, 1995) aan dat daar nie skerp rasseskeidslyne in die Hantamstreek gedurende die vroeë negentiende eeu aanwezig was nie en dit lyk waarskynlik dat die omstandighede in die nabgeleë Olifantsriviergebied nie baie anders was nie. Vergelyk ook Schoeman se beskrywing van die omstandighede in die Roggeveld, wat hieronder bespreek word.
**Die Roggeveld**

K Schoeman se boek oor Sutherland, die Roggeveld en die kinderjare van die digter NP van Wyk Louw bied, wat die eerste 140 bladsye daarvan betref, ’n redelik beknopte maar tog duidelike beeld van die ontwikkeling van hierdie landstreek vanaf die vroeë agtiende eeu tot ongeveer 1900.103 Hy het slegs beperkte argiefnivorsing gedoen, maar ook baie goed van reisbeskrywings, dagboeke en gepubliseerde dokumente gebruik gemaak. Hy maak enkele opmerkings oor die leefwyse van die Khoisangroepe wat aanvanklik die gebied bewoon het en toon dan aan dat die eerste leningsplase in die Roggeveld in 1746 en die dekade daarna uitgereik is. Daar was dikwels botsings tussen die boere en inheemse bewoners. Verskeie kommando’s is teen die Khoisan uitgestuur en talle van hulle is gedood; vroue en kinders is dikwels buitgemaak en het werkers op plase geword.104 In die vroeë negentiende eeu het slegs enkele klein Khoisangroepies in die gebied oorgebly met wie die boere, onder invloed van die Britse bestuur aan die Kaap, ‘n ooreenkoms aangegaan en vee verskaf het.105

Schoeman skryf dat die eerste blanke inwoners van die Roggeveld hoofsaaklik met skape geboer en ‘n feitlik selfonderhoudende bestaan gevoer het. Tot in die negentiende eeu het boere soms nog blanke knegte gehad, maar die meeste plaasarbeiders was slawe, “mak Boesmans” en veral Khoikhoi.106 Blank en gekleurd was in groot mate op mekaar aangewese en van die Khokhoi in blanke diens het ook aan oorloë met Khoisangroepe deelgeneem. In die agtiende eeu het sommige blanke mans ook Khoivroue of -bywywe gehad.107 Omdat baie van die Khoikhoi, deur dwang of omdat hul geen ander heenkome gehad het nie, onder die gesag van blanke boere gekom het, was daar ook dikwels spanning en konflik tussen boere en hul werkers; Schoeman beskryf kortliks enkele opgetekende gevalle van geweld.108 Voortvlugtige misdadigers en gedroste soldate en matrose van die Kaap, maar ook klein groepies Xhosas, wat uit hul tradisionele woongebiede verdryf is, het in die laat agtiende en vroeë negentiende eeu na die Roggeveld uitgewyk en soms by die boere in...

103 K Schoeman, *Die wêreld van die digter; ’n boek oor Sutherland en die Roggeveld ter ere van N P van Wyk Louw* (Kaapstad, Human & Rousseau, 1986).
104 Die verhouding tussen die koloniste en die Khoisangroepe in die Roggeveld gedurende die agtiende eeu word vollediger behandeld deur N Penn, *The forgotten frontier*, veral pp. 91-107, 224-236.
105 K Schoeman, *Die wêreld van die digter…*, p. 21.
106 K Schoeman, *Die wêreld van die digter…*, pp. 53-55.
107 K Schoeman, *Die wêreld van die digter…*, p. 55.
108 K Schoeman, *Die wêreld van die digter…*, pp. 55,56.
Terwyl die Roggeveld tot in die vroeë negentiende eeu 'n voorpos van blanke vestiging was, het verdere uitbreiding van die kolonie daartoe geleid dat dit al meer deur ander gebiede wat deur blanke koloniste bewoon is omring is. Volgens die sensus van 1891 was daar toe 1963 blankes en 1639 bruin mense in die distrik. Laasgenoemde groep het waarskynlik hoofsaaklik plaaswerkers en hul gesinne ingesluit. Vroeër in die eeu was daar in die Roggeveld 'n hele aantal “basters” (kinders van blanke boere by Khoisan- of slavevroue) wat 'n onafhanklike bestaan gevoer, grond besit en 'n grotendeels Westerse lewenstyl gevoer het, maar wat onder druk van die blanke bevolking, wat hulle nie goedgesind was nie, met verloop van tyd na ander gebiede uitgewyk het. Bruin mense en blankes het tot diep in die eeu dieselfde kerke en skole gebruik. Schoeman is van mening dat dit veral die invoed van “wellewendheidsideale van die Victoriaanse Engeland” was wat tot groter verfyndheid onder die blankes gelei het, maar daarmee is “latente vooroordele en angste van die Blankes ten opsigte van kleurverskille… toenemend tot uiting gebring en versterk”. Dit het tot die houding van die blanke bevolking geleid dat die bruin mense wat kerk en skool betref van die blankes geskei moet word. Op Sutherland het die bruin mense hoofsaaklik in 'n aparte woonbuurt gewoon. Die oorgrote meerderheid bruin mense in die distrik was teen die einde van die eeu nog ongeletterd (teenoor sowat 40% ongeletterdheid onder die blankes). Op plase in die distrik het hulle 'n armoedige bestaan gevoer, en Schoeman gee in hierdie verband 'n insiggewende beskrywing van omstandighede op die plaas Gunsfontein. Hy kom tot die gevolgtrekking dat die bruin mense van die Roggeveld in die laat negentiende eeu deur die blankes slegs as knegte en ondergeskiktes geduld is en op die rand van die blank gedomineerde samelewing geleef het.

Oudtshoorn

Die proefskrif van A Appel berus veral op ‘n uitgebreide studie van

---

110 K Schoeman, *Die wêreld van die digter…*, p. 84.
111 K Schoeman, *Die wêreld van die digter…*, p. 88.
112 K Schoeman, *Die wêreld van die digter…*, pp. 81, 89.
113 K Schoeman, *Die wêreld van die digter…*, p. 90.
dokumente in die Kaapstadse argiefbewaarplek en van verskeie kerklike argiewe. Volgens Appel is daar min bekend oor die Khoikhoistamme wat aan die begin van die agtiende eeu in Kannaland (die latere Oudtshoorn-distrik) woonagtig was. Botsings met San- en Xhosagroepe het tot groot ontwrigting geleid en teen die helfte van die eeu was hulle in ’n verarmde en verstrooide toestand. Veeboere het teen hierdie tyd die gebied binnegedring. Gedurende die agtiende eeu het die meeste boere egter net ’n paar jaar op dieselfde plaas gebly en dan weer weggetrek. Hy beraam dat daar teen 1816 1500 blanke boere en hul gesinne in die streek woonagtig was.\textsuperscript{115} Die meeste boere het Khoikhoiwerkers gebruik, en teen 1816 was daar gemiddeld waarskynlik sowat tien op elke plaas. Klein Khoikhoigroepe het teen daardie tyd nog buite die plase gewoon.\textsuperscript{116} Die meeste boere het ook slawe gehad, maar Appel bereken dat daar teen 1816 slegs 675 slawe in die gebied was, wat ’n gemiddeld van drie slawe per plaas gee.\textsuperscript{117} Gedurende die periode tot ongeveer 1850 het die Khoikhoi hul oorspronklike leefwyse en kultuur grotendeels verloor en is, soos Appel dit stel, “die omvorming van ontstamde Khoikhoi tot Agterbergse Kleurling” voltrek.\textsuperscript{118} Dit het gepaard gegaan met bloedvermenging tussen Khoikhoi, slawe en blankes, maar Appel kon nie voldoende gegewens vind om die omvang van hierdie vermenging te bepaal nie.\textsuperscript{119}

Teen die einde van die eeu het blankes en bruin mense albei ongeveer die helfte van die bevolking van ongeveer 24 000 uitgemaak. Die swart mense het ’n klein minderheidsgroep gebly. ’n Groot deel van die blankes en die bruin mense het teen die einde van die eeu van die plase na die dorpe Oudtshoorn en Calitzdorp verhuis. Hulle leefwyse is hierdeur waarskynlik ingrypend beïnvloed. Hieroor wei Appel nie uit nie.

Persone van gemengde herkoms is in die eerste helfte van die negentiende eeu as lidmate van die NG Kerk aanvaar, maar dit het volgens Appel net in uitsonderlike gevalle gebeur.\textsuperscript{120} In 1820 is begin met aanvoerwerk vir die stigting van ’n sendingstasie van die Londense Sendinggenootskap by Dysselskraal (later bekend as Dysseldorp), en teen 1843 was sowat 1500 persone betrokke by die godsdienstige aktiwiteite wat daar plaasgevind het.\textsuperscript{121}

\textsuperscript{115} A Appel, “Die distrik Oudtshoorn…”, Argiefjaarboek vir Suid-Afrikaanse geskiedenis, 51(2), 1988, pp. 29, 80.
\textsuperscript{117} A Appel, “Die distrik Oudtshoorn…”, Argiefjaarboek vir Suid-Afrikaanse geskiedenis, 51(2), 1988, pp. 34, 80.
\textsuperscript{120} A Appel, “Die distrik Oudtshoorn…”, Argiefjaarboek vir Suid-Afrikaanse geskiedenis, 51(2), 1988, p. 125.
\textsuperscript{121} A Appel, “Die distrik Oudtshoorn…”, Argiefjaarboek vir Suid-Afrikaanse geskiedenis, 51(2), 1988, p. 128.
Eiendomsreg is aan die inwoners van Dysselsdorp toegeken en ‘n dorpsraad het in 1892 daar tot stand gekom. \(^{122}\) Appel behandel die geskiedenis van die sendingstasie net in twee afdelings van hoofstukke oor kerklike sake en gee nie veel aandag aan die plek wat die spreitekening van die bruin mense van die streek gehad nie. Ook die verhouding tussen die inwoners van die sendingstasie en die boere word nie bespreek nie.

Gedurende die agtiende eeu was onderwysvoorwaardes baie swak. In 1858 is met owerheidsteun ‘n skool op Oudtshoorn opgerig waar ‘n honderd kinders onderrig is, hoofsaaklik blankes maar onder meer ook enkele kinders van vrygestelde slawe.\(^{123}\) Daarna is verskeie ander skole in die dorp en die distrik gestig, waaronder sendingskole, wat by geleenheid ook deur blanke kinders bygewoon is. Aan laasgenoemde skole het hoofsaaklik slegs elementêre onderrig plaasgevind.\(^{124}\) Die geletterdheidspeil het hierdie hierdie lede verhoog, hoewel teen 1891 39\% van die blankes en 91\% van die bruin mense in die distrik nog ongeletterd was.\(^{125}\)

Appel dui aan dat daar in die laat negentiende eeu ‘n goed ontwikkelde verenigingslewe op Oudtshoorn was. Daar was onder meer debats- en musiekverenigings en verskeie sportklubs. Hoewel hy dit nie eksplisiet stel nie, kan uit sy oorsig afgelei word dat dit hoofsaaklik die blanke inwoners was wat by die verenigings betrokke was.

**Die Langkloof**

JJ Swiegers het vir sy verhandeling\(^ {126}\) navorsing gedoen in die Kaapstadse staatsargief en die argief van die N.G. Kerk en ook reisbeskrywings gebruik. Hy toon aan dat die Khoikhoi en die San in die Langkloof aanwesig was voor die eerste veeboere hulle daar omstreeks 1760 gevestig het. Daar was slegs klein groepe Khoikhoi, oorlyfsels van verschillende stamme, wat ook deur die San bedreig is en wat min weerstand teen die blankes gebied het. Die meeste van hulle het in die loop van die eeu plaaswerkers geword, maar ‘n minderheid het nog as aparte groepe volgens stamgewoontes gelewe.\(^ {127}\)

\(^{122}\) A Appel, "Die distrik Oudtshoorn…", *Argiefaarboek vir Suid-Afrikaanse geskiedenis*, 51(2), 1988, p. 231.
\(^{126}\) JJ Swiegers, "Die geskiedenis van die Langkloof tot 1795" (M.A., US, 1994).
\(^{127}\) JJ Swiegers, "Die geskiedenis van die Langkloof…", pp. 41, 154.
Die feit dat die Khoikhoi nie verenig teen die boere opgetree nie, het dit vir laasgenoemdes moontlik gemaak om hul baasskap oor die Khoikhoi te vestig. Hulle het arbeiders nodig gehad en dit was te duur om meer slawe aan te skaf.128 Botsings tussen die San en die boere het daartoe geleid dat die San in groot getalle doodgeskiet is, hoewel daar teen die einde van die eeu nog San in die Langkloof woonagtig was.129 Daar het tot 1795 nie meer as 95 blanke persone in die Langkloof gewoon nie.130 Alhoewel sommige van die blanke gesinne enkele slawe- (en moontlik Khoi-) voorouers gehad het, was daar volgens Swiegers gedurende die agtiende eeu net een opgetekende geval van bloedvermenging tussen ‘n blanke en ‘n Khoikhoi in die Langkloof.131 In ‘n hoofstuk oor rasseverhoudinge toon Swiegers aan dat sommige boere ook slawe gehad het, maar dat die aantal nie presies vasgestel kan word nie.132 Wat betref die Khoikhoiwerkers skryf Swiegers dat die boere hulle gesien het as heidene en dat ‘n beskouing onder hulle ontwikkel het dat dit die lotsbestemming van die inboorlinge is om sulke werk te doen. By die boere het ‘n afkeer ontstaan om self hande-arbeid te verrig.133 Sommige boere het hul werkers swak behandeld en hy meld ‘n geval waar ‘n boer ‘n Khoikhoi-arbeider so mishandel het dat hy gesterf het.134

**Uitenhage en Bethelsdorp**

‘n Resente werk oor die dorp Uitenhage gee aandag aan die geskiedenis van al die bevolkingsgroepe, maar dit is ‘n baie feitelike oorsig waarin die verhoudinge tussen die groepe nie werklik bespreek word nie.135 Boonop word die tydperk voor 1900 maar baie kortliks behandel. Dit blyk dat dwarsdeur die negentiende eeu sowat die helfte van die dorp se inwoners blankes was.136 Hulle was teen 1870 grotendeels Engelssprekend.137 In 1831 het die Khoikhoi byna die helfte van die bevolking van die destydse Uitenhagedistrik uitgemaak, maar in 1911 was minder as ‘n kwart van die dorpsinwoners

---

129 JJ Swiegers, “Die geskiedenis van die Langkloof… ”, p. 150.
131 JJ Swiegers, “Die geskiedenis van die Langkloof…” , p. 204.
132 JJ Swiegers, “Die geskiedenis van die Langkloof…” , p. 152.
135 O Terblanche (ed), Uitenhage 200, 1804-2004 (Uitenhage, Bicentenary Committee, 2004). Die werk bevat nie voetnote of ‘n bronnyele nie, maar dit is duidelik dat dit wel op ‘n studie van oorspronklike bronne gegrond is.
136 O Terblanche, Uitenhage 200…, pp. 17, 121. Die skrywers van die hoofstukke word in die meeste gevalle nie aangedui nie.
137 O Terblanche, Uitenhage 200…, p. 20.
bruin mense.138 Daar was van die begin af ook ‘n aantal Kaapse Maleiers in die dorp woonagtyg.139 Verskillende rasse- en etniese groepe het saam in die dorp gewoon, hoewel Xhosasprekende swart mense, wat in die loop van die negentiende eeu na Uitenhage verhuis het, vanaf 1844 in aparte lokasies gehuisves is.140 Dit wil voorkom of daar min sprake was van rasseskeiding in die verskillende kerklike denominasies wat gedurende die negentiende eeu in Uitenhage en omgewing bestaan het.141

In bogenoemde boek word daar dikwels verwys na die nabygeleë sendingstasie Bethelsdorp. Hierbenewens het twee studies oor die geskiedenis van Bethelsdorp verskyn.142 Albei is op deeglike argiefnavorsing gebaseer. AJF Meijers toon aan dat die eerste sendeling, JT van der Kemp, in die beginjare (vanaf 1803) nie gepoog het om die Khoikhoi op die sendingstasie op te lei in, byvoorbeeld, die aanleg van tuine en handwerk nie. Onder leiding van latere sendelinge is daar wel landbou beoefen, hoewel die landboubedrywighede nooit baie suksesvol was nie.143 Tog kon Bethelsdorp homself teen 1814 self onderhou en was daar toe twee skole en ‘n tehuis vir armes op die sendingstasie.144 In die skole is gepoog om die Khoikhoi te leer lees en teen 1829 was twee honderd inwoners sover gevorder dat hulle die Bybel kon lees.145 Na 1820 is Nederlands met Engels as voertaal in die skool vervang.146 Soos op Genadendal het kontak met die omliggende boere geleidelik tot prostituërs. Verder was dronkenskap ‘n groot probleem.147 Sommige Khoikhoi het soldate vir die koloniale overheid geword en ander het by boere in diens getree.148 Van die inwoners het vakleerlinge vir skoenmakers, kleremakers, ensovoorts, op omliggende dorpse gebiede gewerk en is so opgelei om ambagte te beoefen.149 Die komers van die Britse setlaars in 1820 het ‘n belangrike bydrae gelewer om werkgeleenthede te skep en die sendingstasie ekonomies meer lewenskrachtig te maak.150 Meijers meen tog dat faktore soos die oorbevolking van die sendingstasie en ‘n gebrek aan mense wat die inwoners vir die landbou en die ambagte kon oplei daartoe geleit is.

138 O’Terblanche, Uitenhage 200..., pp. 17, 121.
139 O’Terblanche, Uitenhage 200..., pp. 20, 60.
140 O’Terblanche, Uitenhage 200..., p. 121.
141 Vergelyk O’Terblanche, Uitenhage 200..., pp. 39, 43.
142 AJF Meijers, “Die geskiedenis van Bethelsdorp tot 1830” (M.A., UPE, 1972); A. Appel, Bethelsdorp, 1828-1945: van sendingstasie tot stadperiferie (Port Elizabeth, UPE, 1994).
144 AJF Meijers, “Die geskiedenis van Bethelsdorp tot 1830”, p. 80.
145 AJF Meijers, “Die geskiedenis van Bethelsdorp tot 1830”, pp. 95, 106, 112.
146 AJF Meijers, “Die geskiedenis van Bethelsdorp tot 1830”, p. 111.
147 AJF Meijers, “Die geskiedenis van Bethelsdorp tot 1830”, pp. 102, 103.
149 AJF Meijers, “Die geskiedenis van Bethelsdorp tot 1830”, p. 121.
150 AJF Meijers, “Die geskiedenis van Bethelsdorp tot 1830”, p. 122.
het dat op Bethelsdorp nie die sukses behaal is wat op Genadendal en ander Morawiese sendingstasies die geval was nie.\textsuperscript{151} Hy skryf ook dat die sendelinge Khoikhoi wat vanaf plase na die sendingstasie uitgewyk het, se klaugs van mishandeling te maklik geglo het en hulle dan in hul beskerming geneem het; hiermee het hulle die “mooi verhouding tussen baas en bediende” op die omliggende plase versteur.\textsuperscript{152} Hy verskaf egter nie veel gegewens om hierdie gevolgtrekking te staaf nie. Meijers spreek ook sy twyfel daaroor uit oor die Khoikhoi van Bethelsdorp goed verstaan het wat die Christendom behels het en of daar werklike bekerings plaasgevind het.\textsuperscript{153}

Die grootste deel van Appel se werk handel oor ontwikkelinge na 1900, en wat die negentiende eeu betref, wil hy veral aantoen dat die bekende Ordonnansie 50 van 1828 aanvanklik geen belangrike veranderinge in die ontwikkeling van Bethelsdorp meegebring het nie.\textsuperscript{154} Soos in sy werk oor Oudtshoorn verskaf hy insiggewende statistiese gegewens. Hy dui aan dat die bevolking tot aan die einde van die negentiende eeu feitlik konstant gebly het.\textsuperscript{155} Die beperkte bestaansmoontlikhede op Bethelsdorp het daartoe gelede dat daar steeds verhuising na die omliggende gebiede plaasgevind het waar daar beter werksgeleenthede was.\textsuperscript{156} As gevolg van wetgewing deur die Kaaps koloniale regering in 1873 kon inwoners hul eie grond besit en het ‘n eie dorpsbestuur tot stand gekom.\textsuperscript{157} Hoewel veebesit belangrik gebly het, is die vroeë nomadiese Khoikhoi geleidelik omvorm tot gevestigde landbouers, loonarbeiders en klein ondernemers.\textsuperscript{158} Die inwoners het teen die einde van die eeu hoofsaaklik in strukture wat bestaan het uit hout en sinkplate gewoon.\textsuperscript{159} Swak skoolbywoning het veral daartoe gelede dat in die negentiende eeu nie baie vordering met skoolopleiding gemaak is nie; steeds is net elementêre onderwys verskaf.\textsuperscript{160}

\textsuperscript{151} AJF Meijers, “Die geskiedenis van Bethelsdorp tot 1830”, p. 134.
\textsuperscript{152} AJF Meijers, “Die geskiedenis van Bethelsdorp tot 1830”, p. 153. Sy beskouing van die sendelinge se optrede verskil heelwat van dié van E Elbourne, \textit{Blood ground…}
\textsuperscript{154} A Appel, \textit{Bethelsdorp, 1828-1945…}, p. 3.
\textsuperscript{156} A Appel, \textit{Bethelsdorp, 1828-1945…}, p. 25.
\textsuperscript{157} A Appel, \textit{Bethelsdorp, 1828-1945…}, pp. 52, 55.
\textsuperscript{158} A Appel, \textit{Bethelsdorp, 1828-1945…}, pp. 73, 75, 79.
\textsuperscript{159} A Appel, \textit{Bethelsdorp, 1828-1945…}, pp. 193-195.
\textsuperscript{160} A Appel, \textit{Bethelsdorp, 1828-1945, …} pp. 164, 166.
**Graaff-Reinet**

KW Smith se studie is veral gebaseer op amptelike dokumente, maar hy het ook van reisbeskrywings en brewe gebruik gemaak. Hy sien die geskiedenis van die Graaff-Reinet-distrik veral as die geskiedenis van verhoudinge tussen individue, groepe en ouwerhede. Toe die distrik Graaff-Reinet in 1786 geproklameer is, het dit die hele gebied tussen die Gamtoos- en Visriviere ingesluit, dus byna die helfte van die destydse Kaapkolonie. In die loop van die negentiende eeu het die distrik al verder ingekrimp. Smith het in sy proefskrif die geskiedenis van die steeds kleiner wordende distrik behandeld. Wat die eerste jare betref, handel sy studie dus eintlik oor die geskiedenis van Oos-Kaapland en word aandag aan sake gegee wat reeds in ander historiese werke behandel is. Teen 1837 het die distrik ‘n heelwat kleiner gebied beslaan wat, soos Smith dit stel, ‘n deel van die Oos-Kaapse middellande uitgemaak het. As ’n studie oor streekgeskiedenis is die werk dus veral van belang wat betref die tydperk 1837 tot 1910.

T erwyl daar in die laat agtiende eeu nog heelwat botsinge tussen die blanke boere en Khoisangroepe voorgekom het, was daar beter verhoudinge vanaf ongeveer 1800 en het die meeste Khoisan werkers op plase onder blanke beheer geword. In die loop van die negentiende eeu het die aantal Xhosasprekende arbeiders op die plase en in die dorp steeds toegeneem. In 1911 was die aantal swart mense in die distrik ongeveer 5000, teenoor 7000 bruin mense en 7400 blankes. Daar was ook ‘n hele aantal arm blankes wat nie hul eie grond besit nie. Die meeste van hulle het ‘n bestaan in die dorp probeer maak, maar daar was ook blanke bywoners en enkele huisbediendes op die plase. Die meeste arm blankes het ten alle koste probeer om nie gewone handearbeiders te word nie en dit het daartoe bygedra dat hulle hoofsaaklik apart gebleef het van die arm bruin bevolking.

---


162 KW Smith, *From frontier to midlands; a history of the Graaff-Reinet district, 1786-1910* (Grahamstown, Rhodes University, 1976).

163 KW Smith, *From frontier to midlands…*, p. xvii.

164 KW Smith, *From frontier to midlands…*, p. 46.

165 KW Smith, *From frontier to midlands…*, pp. 185, 186.

166 KW Smith, *From frontier to midlands…*, p. 188.

167 KW Smith, *From frontier to midlands…*, p. 189.
Hoewel die boere oor die algemeen nie groot probleme gehad het om arbeiders te bekom nie, het hulle tog van tyd tot tyd ‘n tekort aan arbeid ondervind. Bruin mense het, veral in die periode na 1875, na die dorp verhuis weens die beter onderwysgeleenthede en groter moontlikhede vir sosiale verkeer.\textsuperscript{168} Op grond in die distrik wat aan die regering behoort het, het daar, veral tot in die 1870s, plakkers, meesal bruin mense, maar soms ook blankes, gewoon; dit het daartoe geleli dat die koloniale regering die meeste van hierdie grond verkoop of verhuur het.\textsuperscript{169} Plaaswerkers het aanvanklik hul loon hoofsaaklik in die vorm van goedere, veral skape, bokke en klere, ontvang, maar teen die einde van die eeu is die werkers in die distrik en op die dorp ‘n loon in die vorm van geld betaal. Hierbenewens het plaaswerkers ook die reg gehad om hul vee op plase te laat wei.\textsuperscript{170} In die dorp was daar oor die algemeen geen verskil in die lone wat blank en bruin vir soortgelyke werk ontvang het nie.\textsuperscript{171}

Volgens Smith was daar op die plase ‘n skerp skeiding tussen meesters en werkers, wat hoofsaaklik saamgeval het met ‘n rasseskeiding, maar in die dorp was die verhouding tussen meesters en ondernemings meer gekompliseer. Daar was bruin mense, veral vakmanne, wat hul eie ondernemings gehad het, terwyl blankes soms as winkelbediendes en klerke gewerk het.\textsuperscript{172} Op Graaff-Reinet het sommige bruin mense hul eie erwe besit, maar ook dikwels in gehuurde kamers op erwe gewoon.\textsuperscript{173}

Smith gee heelwat aandag aan politieke ontwikkelinge. Hoewel daar geen rasseskeendinge ten opsigte van stemreg vir lede van die parlement, die afdelingsraad en die stadsraad gegeld het nie, was die bruin kiesers steeds ‘n heelwat kleiner groep as die blanke stemgeregtigdes, ten spyte van pogings deur politiek bewuste bruin mense om meer bruin kiesers geregistreer te kry. Veral in plaaslike verkiesings het hulle stemme soms wel ‘n deurslaggewende rol gespeel.\textsuperscript{174}

\textbf{Colesberg}

T Gutsche, wat ‘n doktorsgraad in sosiale geskiedenis verwerf het, is die

\textsuperscript{168} KW Smith, \textit{From frontier to midlands\ldots}; p. 193.
\textsuperscript{169} KW Smith, \textit{From frontier to midlands\ldots}; pp. 199, 200.
\textsuperscript{170} KW Smith, \textit{From frontier to midlands\ldots}; pp. 212, 213.
\textsuperscript{171} KW Smith, \textit{From frontier to midlands\ldots}; p. 243.
\textsuperscript{172} KW Smith, \textit{From frontier to midlands\ldots}; p. 218.
\textsuperscript{173} KW Smith, \textit{From frontier to midlands\ldots}; p. 219.
\textsuperscript{174} KW Smith, \textit{From frontier to midlands\ldots}; p. 241.
ouuteur van ‘n aantal werke van ‘n hoofsaaklik populêr-historiese aard. The microcosm handel oor die Cis-Gariep, of Toverberg, wat later die distrik Colesberg sou word, in die periode van ongeveer 1775 tot 1900 en is ook in populêre trant geskryf.\(^{175}\) Sy gebruik nie voetnote nie, maar die boek is tog gebaseer op ‘n groot aantal brone wat in ‘n slotafdeling vermeld word. Sy het veral baie van reisverslae, dagboeke en brieue gebruik gemaak.

Gutsche identifiseer die San en die Khoikhoi as die vroegste inwoners van die streek. Daar was voortdurend botsings tussen die San en die veeboere wat hulle in hierdie gebied gewaag het. Gutsche beskryf aan die hand ‘n verslag deur veldkorporaal Adriaan van Jaarsveld hoe ‘n boerekommando in 1775 op die San jag gemaak het soos op wilde diere en talle gedood het.\(^{176}\) Aanvanklik het slegs enkele boere hulle dan ook in hierdie streek gevestig. Wanneer die San ‘n tekort aan kos gehad het, het hulle soms met die boere onderhandel en hul kinders aan hulle oorhandig "confident that they would be safe and well maintained, perhaps absconding later".\(^{177}\) By hierdie kinders het sommige boere geleer om die San se taal te praat en verskeie San het werk op plase geword. Die San was oor die algemeen betroubare plaaswerkers wat soms in beheer van ‘n plaas gelaat is as die boer op soek na weiveld met sy vee na ander gebiede getrek het.\(^{178}\) Die San is in hul jaggebied eger nie net deur die boere nie, maar ook deur Khoikhoi, "basters" en Bantoesprekende groepe bedreig en dit het tot verdere aanvalle van die San op veelplase gelei. Tot in die 1860s was daar nog San in die streek wat veral ten tye van droogtes skape en perde op die plase gesteel het. Daarna het hulle as aparte groep uit die distrik verdwyn.\(^{179}\)

Oor die Khoikhoi word nie veel vermeld nie. Dit blyk dat daar vroeg reeds Khoikhoi op plase en ook in hutte op die rand van die dorp gewoon het.\(^{180}\) Hulle is onder meer deur sendelinge van die Londense Sendinggenootskap bearbei en en het soms kerkdienste saam met die blanke dorpsinwoners bygewoon.\(^{181}\) In verskeie reis- en ander verslae word gemeld dat dronkenskap dikwels onder die plaaslike bruin bevolking voorgekom het, hoewel daar ook soms aangedui word dat blanke inwoners hulle aan hierdie euwel skuldig

---

175 T Gutsche, The microcosm (Cape Town, Timmins, 1968).
176 T Gutsche, The microcosm, pp. 10, 11.
177 T Gutsche, The microcosm, p. 19.
178 T Gutsche, The microcosm, p. 44.
179 T Gutsche, The microcosm, pp. 131, 145, 190.
180 T Gutsche, The microcosm, pp. 78, 84.
181 T Gutsche, The microcosm, p. 75.
gemaak het.\textsuperscript{182} Die getal Khoikhoi en bruin mense in die distrik het na ongeveer 1850 ‘n dalende neiging getoon; volgens sensusopnames het die getalle van 1855 tot 1865 van 4400 tot 3700 gedaal.\textsuperscript{183} Daarenteen het al meer swart mense (waarskynlik Xhosa- sowel as Sothosprekendes) hulle in die distrik gevestig en teen 1865 meer as 5000 getel.\textsuperscript{184} Daar was toe ongeveer 7000 blankes in die streek.\textsuperscript{185} Die ontdekkings van diamante het egter geleë tot ‘n uittog van blankes na die diamantvelde in die 1870s.\textsuperscript{186} Gutsche skryf onderhoudend oor die sosiale lewe van die hoofsaalklik Engelssprekende blanke inwoners van Colesberg, maar oor hul verhouding met die bruin mense maak sy nie veel meer as terloopse opmerkings nie.

\textbf{Gevolgtrekkings}

Dit blyk dat nie een van die sewentien studies wat in die vorige afdeling bekyk is ‘n geheelbeeld verskaf waarin al die belangrike aspekte rakende die verhoudinge tussen koloniseerders en inboorlinge voldoende aandag ontvang nie. Dit is duidelik dat die skrywers almal uitgebreide navorsing gedoen het. Vyf van die werke is dan ook doktorsproefskrifte en vier magisterverhandelings. Slegs ses oueurs, Dooling, Scully, Viljoen, Schoeman, Swiegers en Smith, beskou die verhouding tussen die verskillende groepe egter as ‘n hoofstema in hul geskiedskrywing. Die feit dat Smith byvoorbeeld heelwat inligting oor die sosiaal-ekonomiese verhouding tussen die boere en hul bruin werkers verskaf, dui daarop dat ‘n gebrek aan bronne nie die hoofrede kan wees waarom die meeste ander historici min aandag aan hierdie aspek gee nie.

As die bronne wat die verskillende skrywers gebruik het vergelyk word, blyk dit dat in geen geval alle bronne wat van belang behoort te wees ten volle benut is nie. Terwyl navorsers soos Scholtz en Appel ‘n deeglike studie van amptelike bronne gedoen het, het hulle min gebruik gemaak van dagboeke en briefe. Gutsche en Schoeman se werke toon dat waardevolle inligting in hierdie bronne te vinde is. Slegs Appel en Biewenga het heelwat statistiese verwerking van gegewens gedoen en belangrike afleidings daaruit gemaak. Oor feitlik al die streke waaroor daar in die sewentien studies gehandel word, kan meer navorsing waarskynlik lei tot ‘n vollediger behandeling van die

\textsuperscript{182} T Gutsche, \textit{The microcosm}, pp. 78, 84, 105, 116.
\textsuperscript{183} T Gutsche, \textit{The microcosm}, p. 145.
\textsuperscript{184} T Gutsche, \textit{The microcosm}, pp. 145, 190.
\textsuperscript{185} T Gutsche, \textit{The microcosm}, p. 145.
\textsuperscript{186} T Gutsche, \textit{The microcosm}, pp. 169, 186.
verskillende aspekte.

Daar kom tog belangrike historiese gegewens uit die studies na vore wat nie geredelik in ander wetenskaplike werke te vinde is nie. Dit blyk byvoorbeeld dat in geen van die streke wat ondersoek is die blanke koloniseerders ‘n klein minderheid was nie, maar aan die ander kant was hulle in geen van die gebiede ‘n oorweldigende meerderheid nie. Teen die einde van die negentiende eeu was daar in die distrikte Graaff-Reinet, Sutherland en Oudtshoorn ongeveer ewe veel blankes as bruin mense. In die distrik Colesberg en ook in Uitenhage (waar, soos in Colesberg en Graaff-Reinet, teen daardie tyd ook ‘n hele aantal swart mense gewoon het) het die getal bruin mense blykbaar verminder en was hulle in albei gevalle teen 1900 slegs die helfte so groot as die blanke bevolkingsgroep. Geen van die skrywers verskaf inligting oor geboorte- en sterftesyfers of gesinsgroottes van die onderskeie groepe nie. Slegs indien sulke gegewens beskikbaar is, kan byvoorbeeld bepaal word of die aanwyseryer onder die verschillende groepe in die grootste deel van die Kaapkolonie ongeveer dieselfde was en of daar distrikte was wat afgewyk het van die algemene patroon. Oor migrasie van blankes en bruin mense in en uit die verschillende streke word ook min inligting verskaf. Slegs Schoeman verwys na gedrooste matrose, misdadigers, onschulds, wat in die agtiende en vroeë negentiende na die Roggeveld uitgewyk het, sonder om ‘n idee te gee van die getal mense wat hierby betrokke was, terwyl Gutsche daarop wys dat die blanke bevolking van die distrik Colesberg verminder het ná die ontdekking van diamante, ook sonder om spesifieke getalle te noem. Dit blyk dat oor demografiese ontwikkelinge in die Kaapkolonie nog min navorsing gedoen is.

Oor die sosiaal-ekonomiese verhoudinge tussen boere en werkers op die plase verskaf die sewentien studies ongelukkig ook baie min inligting. Soos Biewenga, De Wet en Schoeman aandui, was die boere aanvanklik nie almal blankes en die werkers nie almal swarte of Khoikhoi nie. Wat betref die sosiale verhoudinge tussen die swarte en die Khoikhoiwerkers, wat in verskeie distrikte tot in die vroeë negentiende eeu saam op die plase gewerk het, is daar feitlik geen gegewens nie. Die studie van Smith bied die meeste besonderhede oor die ekonomiese verhoudinge tussen die blanke boere en die bruin werkers op die plase gedurende die negentiende eeu, altans wat die Graaff-Reinet-distrik betref. Scully maak enkele opmerkings oor die bestaan van ‘n paternalistiese stelsel in die Stellenbosch-distrik. WA de Klerk se beskrywing van “feodale” verhoudinge in die Drakensteinvallei toon bepaalde ooreenkomste met Scully se beskouing. Dooling, Schoeman en Swiegers vermeld gevalle van geweld
waarby boere en werkers betrokke was. ’n Deeglike studie van die argiewe van die magistraatskantore kan help om vas te stel hoe wyd sulke misdade in die verskillende streke voorgekom het en in hoeverre die regstelsel die boere of die werkers bevoordeel of benadeel het.\(^{187}\) Soos in vorige afdelings aangedui, beskou sommige resente historici dwang as ’n belangrike kenmerk van die verhouding tussen boere en werkers. Daar is egter nog veel meer navorsing nodig om ’n duidelike beeld van hierdie verhoudinge in al die streke van die Kaapkolonie te vorm.

Dit blyk dat in al die streke dorpsentums tot stand gekom het, hoewel die stigting van die dorp Stellenbosch al voor 1700 plaasgevind het, terwyl daar in die Onder-Olifantsriviergebied nog tot laat in die negentiende eeu nie veel sprake was van dorspontwikkeling nie. Smith en Appel skryf dat in die loop van die negentiende eeu al meer bruin mense van die plase na die dorpe in die betrokke distrikte getrek het. Ander skrywers gaan nie op hierdie saak nie. Smith toon aan dat die sosiale en ekonomiese verhoudinge tussen blankes en bruin mense op die dorpe in baie opsig anders was as op die plase en nie noodwendig saamgeval het met ’n meester-knegverhouding nie. Dit blyk uit sy studie dat, terwyl die boere oor die algemeen meer welvarend was as die werkers (hoewel daar ook onder blanke boere en bywoners armoede voorgekom het), die verskille tussen ryk en arm in die dorpe nie in so ’n groot mate met rasseverskille saamgeval het as op die plase nie. Schoeman skryf tog dat die bruin mense op ’n dorp soos Sutherland in aparte woonbuurte gewoon en op die rand van die samelewing geleef het. Dit is jammer dat die ander skrywers baie min aandag aan tussengroepsverhoudinge op die dorpe gee. Verskeie outeurs wys daarop dat bruin mense in die Kaapkolonie vanaf die middel van die negentiende eeu stemreg in verkiesings vir plaaslike owerhede en die koloniale parlement gehad het, maar blankes het blykbaar deurgaans die leiding in plaaslike besture geneem. Oor hierdie en verwante vraagstukke, soos of plaaswerkers deur boere beïnvloed is om vir bepaalde kandidate te stem,\(^{188}\) kan waarskynlik nog meer navorsing gedoen word.


\(^{188}\) Oor hierdie kwessie word onder meer gehandel in S Trapido, “‘The friends of the natives’: merchants, peasants and the political and ideological structure of liberalism in the Cape, 1854-1910”, S Marks & A Atmore (eds), *Economy and society in pre-industrial South Africa*, pp 247-274.
Soos uit baie bronse bekend is, het daar heelwat bloedvermenging tussen blankes, slawe en Khoikhoi in die sewentiende en agtiende eeue in die Kaapkolonie voorgekom. Volgens Balie en Schoeman geld dit ook vir die Overberg en die Roggeveld. Appel is huiwierig om hom uit te laat oor die omvang van bloedvermenging in die Oudtshoorn-distriek. Swiegers is van mening dat daar in die laat agtiende eeu baie min sprake van gemengde huwelike of ander vorme van bloedvermenging in die Langkloof was. Ander skrywers swyg oor hierdie onderwerp. Swiegers skryf dat daar teen die einde van die agtiende eeu reeds sterk rassevooroordele by die blanke boere van die Langkloof aanwesig was en dat die Khoikhoi deur hulle beskou is as voortbestem om handearbeiders op blanke plase te wees. Schoeman meen dat in die Roggeveld “Victoriaanse” beskouinge van verfyndheid veroorleel daartoe geleë het dat in die laat negentiende eeu die blankes hulle as verhewe bo die bruin mense beskou het en dat klaseverskille daar dus tot kleurskeidslyne geleë het. Soos die meeste skrywers aandui, was daar in verskeie distrikte soms nog tot diep in die negentiende eeu baie min sprake van gemengde huwelike of ander vorme van bloedvermenging in die Langkloof.

Soos die meeste skrywers aandui, was daar in verskeie distrikte soms nog tot diep in die negentiende eeu baie min sprake van gemengde huwelike of ander vorme van bloedvermenging in die Langkloof.
Verskeie skrywers verskaf inligting oor die geletterdheidspeil van die bevolking, wat in die meeste gebiede teen die einde van die negentiende eeu onder die blankes taamlik hoog was, maar heelwat laer was onder die bruin mense. Tog, soos Scholtz opmerk, het sommige bruin mense op sendingskole waarskynlik goeie opleiding ontvang, terwyl daar veral op die plase blankes was wat feitlik geen skoolonderrig gekry het nie. Engels was in die negentiende eeu die amptelike taal van die Kaapkolonie en is op skole onderrig, maar waarskynlik was groot getalle blankes en bruin mense op die platteland hierdie taal glad nie of in baie beperkte mate magtig. Hieroor is daar geen gegewens in die sewentien studies nie. Geen skrywer bespreek die vraagstuk wanneer die Khoikhoitale in ‘n distrik verdwyn het en wanneer die bruin mense Afrikaans as moedertaal begin gebruik het nie. Soos uit taalkundige studies blyk, het verskillende variëteite van Afrikaans vanaf die agtiende eeu ontwikkel. Khoikhoitale het in sommige gebiede ‘n sterker invloed op die Afrikaans van die bruin mense as op die Afrikaans van die blankes gehad, maar in ander gebiede het die vorm van Afrikaans wat blank en bruin gepraat het dieselfde streekskenmerke gehad. Hierdie onderwerp kom nie in een van die sewentien studies aan die orde nie. Daar is heelwat oor die argitektuur, meubels, kleding en kulturele gebruiken van die bruin mense van die Kaapkolonie geskryf, ook in sommige van die studies wat in die vorige afdeling bespreek is, maar oor die invloed van kulturele gebruikte van die Khoisan op die bruin mense is baie min inligting in streekhistoriese werke te vinde. Balie toon aan dat teen die begin van die negentiende eeu Westerse kulturele gebruikte reeds algemeen onder die bruin mense van Genadendal voorgekom het. Uit Meijers en Appel se werke wil dit voorkom of hierdie posisie op Bethelsdorp eers ‘n paar dekades later bereik is. In sommige streke is hierdie veranderinge waarskynlik eers nóg later in die eeu voltrek.

Selfs as alle bronne intensief benut word, sal kennis oor baie aspekte waarna hierbo verwys is maar taamlik beperk bly. Dit hang waarskynlik daarmee saam dat die Khoikhoi en bruin mense die onderste laag van die koloniale samelewing gevorm het, waaroor in historiese bronne minder gegewens gevind kan word as oor die elite. Verder is daar, soos verwag kan word, minder bronse oor die agtiende eeu beskikbaar as oor die negentiende eeu. Die agtiende eeu was, veral in die Karoo, ‘n periode van botsings tussen boere en Khoisan groepe, en

190 Vergelyk CP van Oordt, “Die ontwikkelingsgeskiedenis van Afrikaans: ’n inklusiewe perspektief en implementering in ’n lesreeks” (Ph.D., NWU, 2008).
in die streekgeskiedenisse wat hierbo bespreek is, word nie veel meer inligting hieroor verskaf as in die werk van Penn nie. Die proses waarin die Khoisan in die Kaapkolonie hul tradisionele leefwyse en kultuur verloor en ‘n Westerse taal, godsdiens, kleding, gebruik, ensovoorts, aanvaar het, het, het in die agtiende eeu begin, maar is, wat die grootste deel van die kolonie betref, in die loop van die negentiende eeu voltooi. Hieroor kan waarskynlik nog baie meer navorsing gedoen word.

Die sewentien studies wat in hierdie artikel bekyk is, bevat waardevolle inligting, maar dit is duidelik dat daar nog veel meer navorsingswerk nodig is alvorens ‘n goeie begrip van die ontwikkeling van die samelewing, en in besonder van die verhoudinge tussen inboorlinge en koloniseerders, in die verskillende streke van die Kaapkolonie verkry sal kan word. Om so ‘n begrip te vorm is dit seker nie nodig dat die geskiedenis van elke streek of distrik intensief bestudeer moet word nie. Deeglike navorsing oor een of twee distrikte in verskillende dele van die Kaapkolonie, byvoorbeeld die Boland, die Suid-Kaap, die Groot Karoo en die noordwestelike streke, kan moontlik voldoende wees om ‘n goeie geheelbeeld te vorm van ontwikkelinge in die hele gebied waar die Khoisan en die Westerse koloniseerders met mekaar in aanraking gekom het.
A historiography on past scientific research and references to environmental health concerns in the Merafong gold mining region of South Africa

Elize S van Eeden¹  Eric J Nealer
Vaal Triangle Campus  Potchefstroom Campus
North-West University  North-West University

Mariette Liefferink
Federation for a Sustainable Environment
Johannesburg

Samevatting

Goudmynbedrywighede is sinoniem met die hoofstroom ekonomiese aktiviteit in die Merafong Munisipale gebied. Die omgewing van Merafong (Carletonville), geleë in die verre westelike dele van die Gauteng Provinsie, is al vir dekades wetenskaplik nagevors en bepraat in konferensies, in regeringskantore, die parlement, op voetsoolvlak en in die media. Die geologies gevormde dolomiet (karst) kompartemente gevul met natuurlike ondergrondse water en gouddraende riwwe – het algaande geblyk nie net positief tot die Suid-Afrikaanse ekonomie te wees nie, maar uiteindelik negatief inwerkend op die omgewing te wees, menslike gesondheid te beïnvloed en zelfs vrae te wek oor die haalbaarheid van plaaslike ekonomieë in die lang termyn. Navorsingsuitsette en individue se besorgde stemme oor tyd rakende die omgewing het nie noodwendig duidelik genoeg na vore gekom in resultate en verslae wat beskikbaar gemaak is nie. Waar dit wel duidelik en ondubbelsinnig was, is dit van Jan Publiek weerhou omdat navorsingsopdragte dikwels deur die goudmynbedryf (as synde die besoedelaar) of die Regering getaak is en as vertroulik hanteer is. Sommige navorsingsverslae sluit in amptelijke dokumentasie aangaande radio-aktiewe besoedeling, ander gevaarlike afvalstowwe asook sediment neerslae se gevare in die fisiese en die mens-veranderde omgewing. Hierdie artikel fokus hoofsaaklik op ´n bepaalde faset van die Merafong-omgewing se navorsingshistoriografie binne die konteks van gesondheidsgerigte verslae en navorsingsverslae wat indirek op die kenmerke van die fisiese omgewing gesinspeel het as synde fasette wat impakte om eko-gesondheid in die breë sou kon hê. In vele opsigte kan die etiese aspek

¹ To whom correspondence should be addressed.
Keywords: Environmental Health; Environmental Historiography; Research; Scientist; Merafong; Environmental Remediation; Water Pollution; Environmental ethics.

Introduction

In the Merafong Local Municipality’s responsibility area, the existence of gold mines since especially the 1930s has played a decisive role in influencing the environment, the economy, the people and most probably their health. The biggest environmental destructor in the area seems to be water and the way in which it has been managed in the process of exploring gold. The region is geologically notable for its complex system of dolomite compartments. The terrain of the area is relatively flat with elevations ranging from 1750 m above mean sea level in the southeast to 1400 metres at the confluence with the Mooi River. The topography of the area is dominated by the Gatsrante, a series of east to west trending cuestas with an average height of approximately 100 m above the footslopes.

Due to extensive gold mining in most parts since the 1930’s the topography of the Wonderfontein Spruit has been drastically altered in its upper reaches. The main impact has been the physical presence of mine tailing dams, rock dumps and surface infrastructure. Man-made sinkholes also formed in this catchment area as a result of the dewatering of the dolomite compartments by the gold mines since gold mining exploration started. Amongst others, the

---

Mooi River downstream was and still is contaminated.\textsuperscript{8}

The Merafong and broader area has been explored by many scientists from a variety of disciplines.\textsuperscript{9} The study area has been the catchment of the Wonderfonteinspruit from the continental divide near Mogale City, its source, to the confluence with the Mooi River, east of the Boskop Dam. Approximately 7 km downstream of the confluence the surface water and some groundwater from the Gerhard Minnebron (natural fountain flowing) gravitate, flow and are collected in the Boskop Dam. This ‘reservoir’ supplies potable water to Potchefstroom (city with close to 200 000 inhabitants) located another mere 12km downstream (See Figure 1 for the locality of the Merafong area).

\begin{center}
\textit{Figure 1: Locality map of Wonderfonteinspruit area (Source: Le Roux, 2009)}
\end{center}

\textsuperscript{8} ES van Eeden, F Winde & EJ Stoch, “Multi-perspectives and perceptions on water quality, and related health issues, as impacted on by the mining activities in the Carletonville catchment (Gauteng Province, South Africa), 1964-2004” (Paper, 5th International Congress, Water History Association, Paris, France, 1-3 December 2005).

Recorded economic activity in the area can be retrieved from the 1850s. Due to gold mine activity several towns were founded in the area. Before the cementation process was introduced in South Africa in 1916, goldmining in dolomitic areas in South Africa was regarded as taboo. This economically inspired decision reached the present day Merafong area (formerly known as Carletonville and part of the West Rand area) by the 1930s. The pumping out of the surplus water gradually destroyed the local water resources. Sinkholes, related to dewatering, manifested in the Venterspost area by 1940. The Venterspost Eye already stopped flowing during 1947. Mines were then tasked to distribute the pumped underground water through a channel pipeline to farmers. Large scale environmental impacts on the local communities eventually necessitated an involvement of government as mediator. However, it was felt that government is selective in its actions to solve concerns. It was the agricultural sector that was the first to raise concerns regarding the effects of the water quality in the area on crops and animals. Because of the pumping of slimes (residue of gold mining activities) into the sinkholes the impact on the physical environment was severe.

During all these events, scientists from various institutions were commissioned on a regular basis to do research on the environment for specific purposes and reasons. The possible physical effects of environmental destruction on people were no serious agenda point at any stage up to the early 21st Century. A political manifestation during this process was that in 1994, basing its policy on the premise that environmental dysfunction was rooted in apartheid and white domination, the incoming African National Congress (ANC) government

10 ES van Eeden, “Die geskiedenis van die Gatsrand vanaf die vestiging van die Trekkergemeenskap omstreeks 1839 tot die proklamering van Carletonville in 1948” (MA., PUvCHO, 1988).
11 R Macnab, Gold their touchstone: Gold Fields of South Africa, 1887-1987, a centenary story..., pp. 64-161; Interim Archive [IA], Carletonville Municipality [MCV], file 22/1(b)(2), Dorpe: memorandum i.v.m. die verskynsel van sinkgate en grondbeweging in dolomitiese gebiede en die uitwerking wat dit vir die toekomstige ontwikkeling van Carletonville inhou, 17.4.1976, p. 6.
13 It was the Frenchman M Albert Francois that came from abroad to apply his knowledge and experience in the technique to the “water fault” encountered at the ERPM. See JS Crawhall, “Control of underground water by cementation”, Optima, 3(1), 1953, p. 19; See also RA Pelletier, “Contributions to the geology of the West Rand”, Transactions of the Geological Society of South Africa, XL”, July 1937; WM Walker, “The West Wits Line”, South African Journal for Economics, 18(1), March 1950; WP de Kock, “The geology and economic significance of the West Wits Line”, The Geological Society of South Africa, I, 1964, p. 375; R. Macnab, Gold their touchstone...:
14 EJ Stoch, Personal collection, 1 Aug 2006.
responded by eventually adopting new environmentally focussed acts. These acts are theoretically impressive to look at but basically harmless by 2009 in a practical application regarding environmental constraints in specifically the Merafong area. To follow is a historiographical discussion on the research of scientists in its variety in understanding the environmental distortions of this area and a wider environment regarding its possible effects on the environment and people’s health due to century old gold mining activities.

Gold mining, environment and health: Scientific indicators since the 1900s

During the 19th and 20th century a vast network of scientific institutions ranging from centres of research and training to regional and national conferences were developed. In the British colonial era in South Africa it appears that some effort was made to ensure that the wide range of natural sciences interacted with the social sciences such as demography and anthropology. So a web of knowledge was produced to facilitate efficient exploitation of the natural resources. This approach gradually changed to reflect agendas by “many colonial scientific officials”. Trends in the history of most natural sciences in for example Southern Africa have been to “subsume science within wider processes such as the political economy of imperialism. In doing so, scholars base their work on the assumption that science and scientific ideas were deeply embedded in imperial rule and not an independent lever externally brought to bear on contemporaneous political and economic events”. As science then was regarded as one of the “tools of empire” so scientists were seen as “servants of the colonial state”. Social reformer RO Polanyi’s argument was that in modern societies the economy was “disembodied” from its social base because in these societies nature and human labour were exploited to satisfy economic goals under the assumption that economic growth would in turn yield societal benefit.


From a 20\textsuperscript{th} and early 21\textsuperscript{st} century perspective this colonial and imperial labelling scenario\textsuperscript{17} in many ways even fits the present day shoe. As for the Merafong area, scientific research by the natural sciences and other observation recordings that reflect glimpses from a social science perspective, provide the present day scientist and community with valuable environmental footprints of knowledge and evidence that existed at a certain point in time. These valuable “chambers” of knowledge were not necessarily utilized to benefit the environment or to efficiently address environmental pollution matters that could possibly lead to a continuous lack of health and to fatal illnesses.

The reality that possible health concerns, as a result of the century old gold mining operations in the former West Rand area, currently dominate issues in the whistleblowing focus is because it is realized that mines have already closed and many more may face closure soon and that communities will be left with the environmental and physical scars. If one turns back the clock many examples of scientific research regarding the environmental knowledge of the time in the West Rand comes to mind as a kind of a rehearsal as to what was known regarding the specific area in which gold mines operated.

\textit{The content and outcome of some first scientific surveys, 1902-1935}

Some of the first geological surveys related to the Wonderfonteinspruit Catchment date from 1902 to 1939.\textsuperscript{18} Perhaps one of the most important analyses to be made from these surveys as viewed from a socio-historical perspective is that the Department of Mines (DM) of the national government also commissioned some research surveys on the wider West Rand environment. These research reports mainly were assignments to assist the mineral exploration companies at the time to identify and efficiently explore the underground mineral richness, and to proceed towards retrieving the country’s gold resources effectively for a long term in order to benefit


developers, government and for the sake of economic progress for all.\textsuperscript{19}

In 1935 JE Schnetler was the first to produce an unpublished dissertation on “The dolomite plain of the South-Western Transvaal”. The research data Schnetler reported must have been available to the gold mines and the Government. It is interesting to note the level of the knowledge that scientists were supposed to have by 1935 on the chemical features of dolomite. On limestone’s visibility in the dolomite areas of the West Rand Schnetler remarked on the following:\textsuperscript{20}

Secondary limestone is extensively developed in the South-Western Transvaal dolomite area. The limestone is derived from the dolomite…The limestone is formed by the slow evaporation of water containing carbonate of lime in solution…

From a 21\textsuperscript{st} century perspective and with a wider knowledge regarding limestone in dolomite it is said that limestone can be used for the treatment of acid mine water pollution which is a common feature in gold mining activities, even since the early days of mining and also indirectly affects people’s health.

\textbf{A slow beginning for environmental research on gold mining impacts}

After Schnetler’s dissertation it took more than 35 years for new research foci to be launched and made available in unpublished form. Furthermore university academics were in a position to be exposed to local, regional and international conferences on geology,\textsuperscript{21} geography, engineering and other environmental related issues with the intention to understand and deal with local issues and constraints, and even to be able to make groundbreaking contributions. It is ironical that apparently nothing constructive to prevent environmental exploitation evolved from these actions as information applicable to the South African scenario. This was despite the fact that some publications at that point in time indicated the serious detrimental effects of mining in dolomitic areas.

\textsuperscript{19} See DM, Geological Survey, LT Nel, HF Frommurze, J Willems & SH Haughton, “The geology of Ventersdorp and adjoining country”…1935, pp. 43, 66-70,73 as a typical example.

\textsuperscript{20} JE Schnetler, “The dolomite plain of the South-Western Transvaal”, (MA dissertation, University of the Witwatersrand, 1935), pp. 17; 51-52;72;105.

That new environmental research was conducted by tertiary institutions up to the early nineties can imply that the information needs, after the dewatering and sinkhole escapades of the fifties and the decades to come, still required more analysis and understanding of a dolomitic environment such as the Merafong area. In some of these studies the sponsorship of gold mines is acknowledged that may, in some way or another, signal warning lights to some present day researchers and environmentalists. Several post graduate treatise was done on the geological features of the broader western parts of the present day Gauteng Province, as well as the general development potential of the environment.22

Heavy metal pollution in water receives more attention from the 1970’s onwards

Apart from research on the stability of sites a possible pollution due to heavy metals received attention from upcoming academics by at least the late seventies, and was most of the time based on extensive research data from abroad. For example, JJ Malan in 1981 stated that Radium -226 is a transformation product in the uranium -238-decay series, and is present in both uranium and gold ore. As a consequence radium-226 appears in all mine tailings and it is traceable in all mine sand dumps and slimesdams of South Africa. What does Malan inform us on as far as what mines and government knew and did not know by 1981? Definitely they must have been aware of the maximum Radium concentration in environmental water set by the International Committee on Radiological Protection in 1967. Malan also mentioned that hazardous material like sand heaps and slimesdams close to goldmining activities necessarily impacts on an ecological system. These remarks definitely were not a brain storm resulting from 1981 research but from given facts long before Malan’s observation. During 1979-1980 Malan also tested the average presence of the Radium-226 concentration of slimesdams in the Bank-Randfontein area (part of the West Rand) and found

---

22 See for example B Krapez, “A sedimental study of the Ventersdorp contact reef at East Driefontein Gold Mine, Carletonville, South Africa” (MA., University of the Witwatersrand, 1979); AN Clay, “The Geology of the Malmani Dolomite subgroup in the Carletonville area, Transvaal” (MA., University of the Witwatersrand, 1981); JJ Malan, “Die bepaling van radium-226 in die uitskot van goudmyne en hulle omgewings” (MA., UP, 1981) (this is a study on radion impacts from gold mining on the immediate environment); CB Schoeman, “Die beplanningsimplikasies van die proses van funksieverandering by myndorpe met spesiale verwysing na die Witwatersrand (D.Phil., PUvCHO,1986); (This is a study on town planning and management research regarding mining towns that include parts of the West Rand); DB Butrick, Characterisation and appropriate development on sites of dolomite (DPhil, UP, 1992).
that it was substantially higher than in the former Central and the East Rand (namely 1.18 + 0.80 Bq/g).  

Some other scientists confirmed Malan’s findings afterwards. Years later Wymer (1995) advised the affected members “that we have little choice but to accept that some of the radioactivity levels measured may indeed be cause for some concern”. It was recommended that the mining industry should establish a proactive and open strategy for addressing the issue. Another year later scientist H Coetzee of the Council for Geo Science investigated the relative radio-isotope composition of the accumulated surface water transport and deposited sediment as well as the inflorescence around the Turffontein Eye and concluded that there was an elevated level of radioactivity and that the source was most likely the gold mines. Nothing seriously happened to address these research findings. History simply continued to repeat itself with no serious learning curve and remediation efforts on the horizon.

Another scientist, AN Clay, also mentioned that numerous theories had been proposed to explain the mode of origin of dolomite, but that it was only with the discovery of recent and modern dolomite “that any progress in understanding these rocks has been made”. If Clay refers to findings in for example the 1970s one might have some understanding – from a mining perspective – on why it took close to 40 years of environmental destruction to actually understand the full implications of past ignorance in the solo process of public decision making. A higher than usual chemical analysis of the dolomite water in the former West Rand (part of the Merafong municipal area) was the finding of Clay in water samples from mining boreholes that were taken in 1981. The presence of a few heavy metals was also analysed.  


24 Obtained from Prof EJ Stoch, Memorandum, Krugersdorp Game Reserve: Animal mortality, 2, 13 May 2005, pp. 5-6.


26 Henk Coetzee was also part of the controversial 2006 WRC report 1214/0/06.

Water pollution? Most fingers point to one direction

Research in the nineties marked a more proactive approach (as in the sixties by farmers) in accentuating that the gold mines are the main polluters of the local environment. After for example some investigation in 1993 it was found that the bacteriological pollution of the water issuing from the pipeline at Oberholzer was severe and recommended that this water be removed from the irrigation reticulation. Also the problems of the members of the Oberholzer Irrigation Board were investigated in September, 1992. It was found that a major management problem encountered by the Oberholzer Irrigation Board was the accumulation of sediment in the canals. Already on 28 September 1992, at a meeting of the irrigators to discuss their problems, representatives of Gold Fields Mining Company denied that the sediment originated from the mines. At another meeting with the former West Driefontein Gold Mine, the denial was repeated and the farmers were warned that the Mine had “deep pockets” and would keep them in Court for “60 years”. As a result of the three decades long complaints by farmers on the impact of the water quality on the soils and animal health a study was mandated by the then Department of Water Affairs and Forestry (DWAF) in 1993. These results, though still unknown, were not accepted by the farmers because of the dominant mining involvement (West Driefontein Gold Mine and the Far West Rand Dolomitic Water Association (FWRDWA)).

To at least address this matter which was becoming serious, the Enforcement Directorate of then the Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism (DEAT) was approached after 1998 to accentuate the responsibility of the municipalities with regard to environmental issues related to water and air pollution. Therefore local governments in the West Rand area were assigned by government structures to be more responsible for their respective local environment. The City Council of Mogale City, for example, assigned some water related research of which the results were not widely distributed but in which the findings were not merely surprising but indeed disturbing. During the nineties a few articles by scientists also hinted at the possible effects of mining pollution on the environments in which they operate. These writings, carefully phrased in published papers, were harmless because they never reached the ears and eyes of those they directly concerned.

---

30 S du Toit, Draft report water contamination in the Krugersdorp area at the request of Mogale City, 2007.
The impact of research consultants in the Merafong area

Besides the tertiary research input by academics, the seventies and eighties also gave rise to more research involvement on a consultation basis by established and new research institutions with a governmental backing. These included the Council for Scientific & Industrial Research (CSIR),\(^{31}\) the Institute for Water Quality Studies (IWQS),\(^{32}\) the Water Research Commission (WRC), the Council for Geo-Science (CG), as well as private research consultants\(^{33}\) that government and mining companies had commissioned from time to time. Also to do research in the Merafong and the broader environmental area regarding issues of concern.

A difference between research reports of an academic nature and commissioned research by companies or bodies (and consultants) are that not all in the past (and some still don't) were exposed for public eye. Some consultants have later on produced whistle blowing articles or simply kept the silence on critical issues\(^{34}\) which in turn, questioned the ethical approach of scientists and professionals on environmental issues of a broader concern.

In a confidential study in 1957 by the Council for Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR) on behalf of New Consolidated Gold Fields Limited the dewatering of the springs was confirmed.\(^{35}\) Next to follow was the Final Report of the Inter-Departmental Committee on which a Dr GJ Stander, Director of the National Institute for Water Research, commented on 10


February 1964 after having difficulty in obtaining the report. Apart from the fact that the Institute he was working for was not consulted, Stander also pointed out environmental destructors that needed attention in the West Rand area, namely the danger of pollution; the quality of the water that would reach the different communities; the protection of a National Asset (the Dolomitic compartments should not be used as dustbins) and need for pollution-prevention planning.

The above-mentioned advice by Stander regarding the environment and human health, was ignored by mining and government controlled research bodies like the Far West Rand Dolomite Water Association (FWRDWA) and the State Co-ordinating Technical Committee (SCTC). Both these bodies operated from respectively 1963 and 1964. Continuous allegations between a dissatisfied farming community and the mines probably led to the Deputy Minister’s announcement in November 1967 that concerns as raised by the farmers would be investigated. N Stutterheim of the CSIR chaired this process. At the same time the Farmers Union (FU) compiled a memorandum on the impact on animals and crops that was presented to the then Deputy Minister of Water Affairs, H Martins. The above scenarios and speculative findings were not taken seriously but were suppressed. The mining authorities, by the eighties, had become the prime “managers” of the agricultural areas in the Oberholzer district, which perhaps deliberately quietened the regular complaining voice of the agricultural community.

Commissioned research? – By whom for whom?

The power to commission scientific research regarding these concerns remained in the power structures of the mines and the government. After all, to quote Turton et al government i) makes the rules as their legislative obligation ii) applies the rules as their executive obligation towards the country’s people and iii) adjudicates rules when required to benefit the majority of the country’s people. In the process they also had the capacity to direct and enable the science field to develop solutions for the problems and

37 CG, Based on Archival material on the SCTC and the FWRDWA.
Health concerns in the Merafong gold mining region

needs of society. To what extent government utilized research information by researchers of for example the CSIR for the explicit attention of government so that informed decisions on environments in which gold mines operate could be made, is unknown but certainly not yet groundbreaking.\(^{39}\)

At the time of writing no research project, focused on research to directly complement the health impacts of mining activities on humans, has been commissioned. However, some research done by the area's gold mining companies in the past did focus on the health status of their mining work force. These findings were never released to a wider audience but simply internally utilized or dealt with. Government has commissioned a few research assignments through respectively the Department of Mines (DM) and the DWAF. The so-called Jordaan report, the Truter report (as compiled by the Joint Committee on the Dewatering of Mines in the West Rand) as well as the Gibbs Report were recorded from the late fifties to the mid-sixties. Concerning the Jordaan Report of 1960 by the DWAF on the study area, one of the adverse impacts that was foreseen was the contamination of the water by the mines, particularly sulphate contamination.\(^{40}\)

**The 2009 status of scientific research and action**

No specific action or environmental remediation is recalled that addressed the possible impacts of dewatering as stated in the Jordaan report. Close to a half century later, at least four research efforts comes to mind in which the direct focus was to determine the level of water pollution. Perhaps an indirect intention was to determine the possible effects pollution may have had on efforts to ensure a healthy environment for local communities. These reports are:

- **DWAF, IWQS, April 1999, “The Radioactivity Monitoring Programme in**

---


the Mooi River Wonderfonteinspruit) Catchment”, Report N/C200/00/RPQ/2399, Pretoria. In this report possible health risks in the area was based on researching the levels of radioactivity in raw water samples that had been filtered prior to analysis, and on the use of such water for drinking purposes on a continuous basis. The study unfortunately did not consider radioactivity in sediments, therefore the study did not shed any new light on the effects of possibly polluted water on people. Also the IWQS as a valuable departure to conduct water quality studies ceased their operations shortly after this report.


Scientist F Winde of the North-West University confirmed that an investigation aimed at establishing possible health implications in affected communities in the West Rand is still due. An effort to assess associated health risks is further complicated by a number of facts including the lack of reliable data on effects of long-term low-dose exposure of humans to uranium in drinking water and limited understanding of the complex mechanisms and dynamics of uranium pollution and uranium transport in the aquatic environment. To the ordinary citizen it is not currently known how many unpublished or restricted reports have been produced that relate to the environmental pollution problems in the West Rand which may impact (or/and already have impacted) on the health status of the communities living in these areas. Most mining commissioned research reports are not available and/or easily obtainable. The scenario of not having access to valuable report data is just as common as the secrecy of research reports. Water expert, A Turton, speaks as if nothing has changed:

I have just got the 1958 Sodium Chloride report. It is amazing. But it is classified so it cannot be released. We can discuss this because I believe it should be released. Permission would need to come from Gold Fields, the new owners. The Jordaan Report builds on the CSIR NaCl report and also a Floculation Report so they are a family.
Some of the most recent publications worth mentioning that refer to environmental related research with health pointer foci as done by professionals and scientists are:


Research between 2006 and 2009 which was more explicit regarding the detrimental environmental and health related effects due to gold mining activities and treated with secrecy for some time before making it public, are:


- NNR, R Barthel, G Deissman & W Leotwane (2007), “Radiological impact assessment of mining activities in the Wonderfonteinspruit Catchment area”, Paper that was avoided to be presented at the Environment Conference, Pilanesberg, NWU, South Africa, 23-25 July, 2007 In this report the radiological risks of the mining activities for cattle being watered at polluted surface water bodies in the Wonderfontein Catchment area in the West Rand were extensively looked into.


All the research as indicated above not only accentuates a high research involvement of scientists in the study area, but also sadly reflects how little impact their findings had in their time regarding for example water pollution. More whistleblowing concerns are found regarding the area as recorded from 2003 to 2009 in which scientific report findings and suggestions also feature as a kind of confirmation that government and goldmines should react in a progressive way to remediate the environment for the benefit of affected communities (also health wise) and for the sake of future generations.41

Other media organs and newspapers followed suit, with some reasonable success regarding the creation of awareness, and eventually the development of a more proactive approach towards environmental remediation for the sake of a sustainable environment regarding the future of local communities. Several local bodies and committees were founded during the early 21st century.

Health concerns in the Merafong gold mining region
century to accommodate all stakeholders in the West Rand and the West Rand environment. Some still function whereas others have ceased their operations due to complexities and differences regarding how the future should look.\textsuperscript{42} However, a research request that has remained in the background, as if not even speculated on or mentioned at any point in time, is the call for studies to determine the impact of gold mine pollution on the health status of local communities. Though some scientists recently have suggested that some steps in this direction should be considered,\textsuperscript{43} no substantial funds were available at the time of writing, or have been commissioned by for example the government and the mines.

Anthony Turton (former Director of the Water Research Division at the CSIR) recently remarked that South Africa currently faces a serious water quality challenge, both in the eyes of the public and by scientists. He also accentuated that the impact of mine water quality on humans is largely unknown and has not yet been studied in South Africa. A proposal that was submitted by the CSIR in 2008 to the WRC to address this deficiency was unfortunately rejected, “so the state of knowledge around this crucial area is still very weak”\textsuperscript{44}

Currently individual gold mining companies are co-operating with academic institutions to address a variety of environmental impacts and to exploit the potential of wetlands to act as a sink for heavy metals.\textsuperscript{45} However, on the negative side of efforts, mining closures became a reality in which the quality of surface and groundwater can further deteriorate.\textsuperscript{46}

There is a need for more opinions and input in finding solutions. In the past, efforts towards sufficient pro-activity and environmental remediation were hindered by individuals and the mines, as well as the government (local

\textsuperscript{42} ES van Eeden & I Brink, “Factors that determine the facilitation of stakeholders in environmental management – some philosophical-historical thoughts with Merafong area as example”, \textit{Koers}, 74(4), 2007, pp. 691-721.
and national), due to scientific selfishness, differences and economic greed. Only recently a report was released by DWAF to announce a three-year environmental remediation plan for the Wonderfonteinspruit Catchment in the Merafong area.47 If implemented efficiently this process may also impact positively on the health status of people in the long term. However, this sign of progress does not imply that the need for research in the environmental impacts on people’s health should be nullified. Recent research has pioneered concerns in this regard and the scientific community should follow up to search for information that will enhance a better understanding of the impacts of man on man in an environment of this nature.

Conclusion

In the discussion it has been accentuated to what extent different economic ideals and insufficient communication among stakeholders as well as an insufficient application of research data can have an impact on the environment and can lead to enormous environmental management complexities over time. After close to 80 years of active gold mining operations in the area, in which minor efforts of remediation to the advantage of the environment and communities were made, it has become an extraordinary challenge for younger generations to propose constructive solutions. Equally the effective application of scientific research and results to, for example, address possible health risks in the West Rand gold mining region of South Africa, simply do not happen because of a fear of the expenses that may result if mines are pointed out (with actual evidence), as the party that affected people’s health. Furthermore differences of opinion or an inclination to exclude role-players also prevail and complicate this historically driven scenario even further. From a national point of view the question of environmental ethics and to what extent human rights can be demanded regarding individuals and communities whose health status may have been affected will become significant issues in research themes based on the impact of the destructed environment in an epidemiological and toxicological study area on the health of people.48

47 See RSA, WEA, Wonderfontein Spruit Catchment Area Remediation Action Plan (RAP)’s four Public participation meetings conducted in the course of 2009, but which was not yet effective in finding and applying remediation solutions to benefit environment.

48 Compare ES van Eeden, E Nealer & M Liefferink, “Environmental management complexities and rumours impeding the effective application of scientific results to address possible health risks in the West Rand Gold Mining region of South Africa”, CA Brebbia (Ed.), Environmental health risk, V (Witpress, Institute of Technology, UK, 2009), pp. 195-212; ES van Eeden & I Brink, “Factors that determine the facilitation of
question then regarding what role science could play in the democratic South Africa Turton\textsuperscript{49} has commented:

If the national science councils are forced to continue as commercialized entities, then they run the very real risk of being hijacked by private interests intent on maintaining the status quo in the country. This will lock in existing inequities and could potentially undermine the stability of our fledgling democracy. On the other hand, if our national science councils are given robust grants and a focused research agenda that meets the national interests as broadly defined, then science could play a vital role in addressing past inequities and helping with the transition to a more stable society in which the core values of democracy are deeply entrenched.

If the environmental destructions in the Merafong and broader municipal area continues in future without a sustainable plan to properly manage the variety of concerns raised, this area will not sufficiently recover to at least supply those living in it with a reasonable chance of survival. With the gold mines in a process of moving out as the dominant economic sector, the area indeed may be irreversibly destroyed for the people, for farming, as well as for cultural and environmental sustainability. The role that capitalism, racism and nationalism would have played then can become interesting debates but will never bring back what once was. However, most importantly at this stage is to proceed in the scientific research focus by moving on in time and conducting environmental health impact assessments especially regarding mining pollution matters. The past has pointed out several ground breaking research reports that were requested and suitable for a specific timeframe, though these were not always applied to benefit a wider population. Perhaps constructive global discussions on many similar examples worldwide should also be explored and possible solutions posed that can apply to this unique micro community scenario.

A historical overview of the study of family business as an evolving field

Shelley Farrington and Elmarie Venter

South Campus (Port Elizabeth)
Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University

**Samevatting**

Ten einde ‘n begrip van die unieke aard van familieondernemings te bevorder, het daar met verloop van tyd talryke konseptuele modelle en benaderings tot die studie van familieondernemings ontstaan. In ‘n poging om te beskryf hóé hierdie studieveld sedert sy ontstaan ontwikkel het, poog hierdie artikel om ‘n historiese uiteensetting en beskrywing te gee van dié tersaaklike modelle en benaderings.

Vroeëre benaderings het op die tipiese probleme van familieondernemings gefokus, en is later opgevolgdeur ‘n nadere beskouing van die karaktereis van die stigters van sulke ondernemings. Hierna volg die toepassing van die stelselstorie, wat die familie en die besigheid as oorvleuelend, interaktief en interafhanklik beskryf. ‘n Verdere uitbreiding van hierdie model voeg ook die dimensie van eienaarskap tot dié van die besigheid en die familie by. ‘n Tekortkoming van baie van hierdie vroeër modelle is dat tyd en veranderinge buiten rekening gelaat word. Die drie-dimensionele ontwikkelingsmodel oorkom dié probleem deur te toon dat elk van die drie subsisteme (eienaarskap, bestuur en familie) met verloop van tyd deur verskillende stadia beweeg. Die uitgebreide ontwikkelingsmodel van familieondernemings (DMFB) bou voort op vorige modelle deur die inkorporering van die bykomstige eienaarskap, besigheid en familie eienskappe, sowel as en addisionele eienaarskaps-veranderlike. Die “Bulleye”, ‘n ope sisteembenadering, wat vlakke van ontleding behels, hanteer sommige van die basiese tekortkominge van vorige modelle.

Dit blyk ook duidelik dat ‘n bydrae tot die groei van die studieveld van familieondernemings te danke is aan die multi-dissiplinêre benadering wat deur navorsers in die veld gevolg word. Konsepte en teorieë vanuit ander dissiplines soos, onder andere, Psigologie, Sosiologie, Bestuur, Ekonomie, Rege en familiesisteme teorieë, word byvoorbeeld geïntegreer en toegepas

---

1 This paper is based upon work financially supported by the National Research Foundation of South Africa.
2 To whom correspondence should be addressed.
om ’n beter begrip te verkry van hoe hierdie unieke tipe ondernemings funksioneer. In aansluiting hierby blyk dit dat as gevolg van die groot aantal familieondernemings wat wêreldwyd bestaan, hul belangrikheid tot nasionale ekonomieë en hul unieke aard, sowel as hul hoë mislukkingskoers, alles faktore is wat bygedra het tot die belangstelling van navorsers van ’n verskeidenheid vakdisiplines, en wat hul inspireer om hierdie tipe ondernemings te bestudeer. As gevolg hiervan was die groei in die studieveld van familieondernemings werklik beduidend.

’n Historiese beskouing van die studieveld van familieondernemings toon dat navorsing steeds gemoeid is met dieselfde kwessies, naamlik dié van opvolging, prestasiemeting en vergoeding, en ook die bestuur van familieondernemings, wat tot dusver die redevoering van die afgelope 20 jaar oorheers het. Die meeste navorsing is steeds gegrond op gevestigde teorieë afkomstig vanuit ander dissiplines. Gevolglik bly ’n soliede teoretiese begronding in gebreke, en is die studieveld ietwat gefragmenteerd ten opsigte van sy fokus en bevindinge. Ondanks die toename in die aantal empiriese studies, wat gekenmerk word deur nougesetheid en groter steekproewe, word die veld nog steeds oorheers deur geykte navorsingsmetodes en ontledingsinstrumente. Dit dra nie by tot ’n diepgaande begrip van die dryfveer van empiërse waarneming nie. Met die ondersoek van die studieveld kan die gevolgtrekkings gemaak word dat alhoewel navorsing oor familieondernemings reeds gevorderd is, lei dit nog steeds as ’n bestuursveld aan relatiewe isolasie. Dit sal nog lank neem voordat familieondernemings as ’n onafhanklike studieveld ’n noemenswaardige invloed op die openbare beleid, besluite en verbeterde bestuurspraktyke sal hê, óf selfs vakliteratuur oor familieondernemings verder sou uitbrei.

**Keywords:**

Family business; Succession; Systems theories.

**Introduction**

It is undisputed that family businesses are among the most important contributors to wealth and employment in virtually every country of the world. According to Van der Merwe, family businesses have also, for the

---


last 300 years, been making a positive contribution to the South African economy. Various scholars⁵ point out that family businesses are fast becoming the dominant form of business enterprise in both developed and developing economies, and play an important role, both economically and socially, in these economies. According to Venter, Boshoff and Maas⁶, the influence and the number of family businesses can be expected to increase substantially in the near future.

A family business is fundamentally different from other forms of business. The key difference is that the business affairs of a family business are closely and intricately intertwined with the personal financial affairs of the family, and also with power relationships, blood ties, emotional bonds and inheritance issues within that family.⁷ The intertwining and reciprocal relationships between the family and business systems are recognised as the key feature distinguishing this field of study from others, and which make them complex to study.⁸

Relatively little attention in management research has been devoted to the family business’s unique and complex issues.⁹ These issues include family conflicts spilling over into the business environment, sibling rivalry, emotional rather than rational decision-making, autocratic paternalistic cultures, nepotism, confusing organisation, rigidity in innovation, succession, and resistance to change. As a distinct field of study, it has existed for only about 30 years in the United States and for a decade or so in Europe.¹⁰ Family business as a field of study has, however, grown from its modest beginnings to a substantial conceptual and theoretical body of knowledge at the start of the 21st century.¹¹ Contributing towards this growth is the multidisciplinary

---

approach that has been, and still is, adopted by researchers in the field. Concepts and theories from other disciplines such as Psychology, Sociology, Management, Economics, Law and family systems theories are, for example, integrated and applied to advance the understanding of these unique forms of business. In addition, the large numbers of family businesses that exist worldwide, their importance to national economies, their unique nature, and their high failure rate have intrigued researchers from all disciplines, inspiring them to investigate these unique business forms in greater numbers. Consequently the growth in this field of family business research has been significant.

In order to create a better understanding of this complex form of business organisation, numerous conceptual models and approaches to the study of family businesses have emerged over time. Endeavouring to describe how the field of family business research has evolved since its inception, the aim of this article is to historically outline the field and to review these models and approaches developed to date.

**Family businesses: An evolving field of study**

Pioneers in the field of family business studies were scholars who initially consulted family business managers on the challenges they faced.¹² Until the mid 1980’s, the field remained dominated by a few authors who focused mainly on succession issues, and research remained shallow in terms of systematic analysis and theoretical rigour. Building on these earlier efforts, the late 1980’s and mid 1990’s saw a rapid increase in the number of scholars from various disciplines being attracted to the field of family business research. Overall, the period was characterised by an increase in the number of topics, scholars, and methods used. Rigorous empirical studies also began to emerge, but topics on succession still continued to dominate the field. The period after 1996 has been characterised by a rise in the number of scholars interested in the field of family businesses, and although succession has remained a dominant

theme, a multitude of other topics have received and are receiving scholarly attention.\(^\text{13}\)

Brockhaus\(^\text{14}\) points out that relatively little research has been carried out in South Africa on family-owned businesses. During the past decade, however, research on family businesses in South Africa has gained increasing momentum.\(^\text{15}\)

**Conceptual models and approaches to the study of family businesses**

To develop an understanding of the complex nature of family businesses, many authors have integrated concepts from family systems theories to theories on organisations used by social psychologists and organisational development consultants.\(^\text{16}\) At the same time, family therapists have begun to apply concepts such as enmeshment/disengagement, differentiation, and triangles, to the subgroup of families who have businesses. The contributions from this broad spectrum of scholars and practitioners, such as psychologists, sociologists, economists, lawyers, accountants and historians, have begun to converge into conceptual models of family business.\(^\text{17}\) The evolution of these conceptual models and the models themselves will be briefly described in the

---


Earlier approaches to the study of family businesses

Scholarly work in the field of family business research began with consultants’ case descriptions of family firms. These pioneers in the field were close to the challenges faced by family business managers, as they devoted their energies to consulting to these firms. The study of family business systems was launched with the publication of various articles in the 1960’s and 1970’s, focusing mainly on general problems that appeared to hamper the success of family businesses, such as nepotism, generational and successor rivalry, and unprofessional management. Early theorists approached the enigmas of family businesses in the belief that the problems observed resulted from the infringement of emotional family factors that had the potential to corrupt the business. These initial assumptions were largely responsible for the negative connotations associated with family businesses, which have persisted to this day. The attention then shifted to the founders of family businesses. Much of the available literature relates directly or indirectly to these individuals. Many studies focused on the personality of the founders, and more generally, on the personality of entrepreneurs, which most founders are considered to be.

Life-cycle approach to the study of family businesses

One of the first approaches adopted to enhance the understanding of the nature of a family business is the life cycle or phase approach. Theoretically, businesses are thought to evolve through some type of life cycle. In terms of the life-cycle approach, family businesses can prepare themselves for the personal and organisational developmental tasks they will face in the future.

---

by considering people, families and businesses as dynamic entities undergoing cyclical processes of birth, growth, and decline.\textsuperscript{23}

Various typologies have been used to describe the different stages of an organisation or business’s life cycle.\textsuperscript{24} Amongst others, Goldberg, Handelsman, Leach, and Neubauer and Lank have discussed various business developmental models in the context of understanding the family business.\textsuperscript{25} These models include those proposed by Hershon, McGivern, Ward, and Benson, Crego and Drucker.\textsuperscript{26} Neubauer and Lank\textsuperscript{27} maintain that the challenge is to find ways of clearly describing the complex evolutionary patterns of human organisations in general and family businesses in particular, because the governance of a family business should be guided by its position in the evolutionary life cycle. The life-cycle models were developed in literature from individual physiology, organisational theory and family business theory.

**Family businesses as dual systems**

The next approach to understanding the nature of family businesses is the application of the systems theory and theories of organisation to the field of family businesses. This approach has resulted in a useful framework for studying the relationship between the family and the business, by presenting the family and the business as overlapping, interacting and interdependent

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{27} F Neubauer & AG Lank, *The family business …*, p. 26.
\end{itemize}
systems, and also for analysing both the family and the business as systems.28 This framework which is referred to as the dual systems approach or the two-system concept,29 was developed by Tagiuri and Davis at Harvard University in the early 1980’s.30 This approach is shaped by the general systems theory and is sometimes also referred to as the “family business systems theory”. The underlying belief is that the interconnectedness of related subsystems is critical to an understanding of how the overall system functions.31

In terms of the dual systems approach, the business and the family systems are separate entities, each with its own norms, goals, membership rules, value structures, and organisational structures.32 The family system, for example, is emotion-based; its members are bound together by deep emotional ties that can be both positive and negative. The family system also tends to be inward-looking, placing high values on long-term loyalty, care, and the nurturing of family members. It is a conservative system, operating to minimise change and to keep the equilibrium of the family intact.33 The business system, on the other hand, is more task-orientated and outward-looking, and places a high premium on the reward of performance, as well as and embracing change.

In the non-family business, these two basically incompatible systems operate independently, but in the family business they not only overlap, but are actually interdependent.34 Although the institutional overlap between the family and business systems does have the potential to contribute positively to organisational success, this key interface often damages both entities.35

30 TM Dickinson, “Critical success factors…”, (MA dissertation, University of the Witwatersrand, 2000);
32 KE Gersick, JA Davis, MM McCollom Hampton & I Lansberg, Generation to generation…, p. 5.
The Three-circle model of family business

In the early 1980’s, Tagiuri and Davis elaborated on the two-systems approach. They made a critical distinction between the ownership and management subsystems within the business circle: some individuals are owners, but are not involved in the operation of the business, while others are managers, but do not control shares. From this, the three-circle model emerged. This model describes the family business system as three independent but overlapping subsystems: business, ownership and family. For the past decade and a half, the three-circle model (see Figure 1) of family business has been the primary conceptual model of family business.³⁶

The three-circle model views family business as a complex system comprising three overlapping subsystems, namely business, ownership and family. The health of a family business relies on parallel developmental processes occurring in all three subsystems. When a legal arrangement, for example a trust, freezes development in the ownership system, the family business as a whole may suffer.³⁷

![Figure 1: Three-circle model of family business](image)


The three-circle model illustrates the various positions that could be taken up by different family and non-family members in the family business. The complexity of managing the differing norms, values and expectations from the various positions in the three circles typifies the challenges facing the family business.

Another useful and complementary way to examine the family business system is to define it as an ideological triangle. As Johannisson and, Johannisson and Huse report, very often a family business is ideologically a combination of entrepreneurialism, managerialism and paternalism. Koiranen offers a cultural approach in describing how a family business system works as an ideological arena, by developing a C^3-model to complement the well-known three-circle model of Tagiuri and Davis. According to Koiranen, the family business seems to be an arena of contesting and contrasting ideologies. By adopting the structure of a three-circle model to this ideological dimensionality, it is possible to illustrate the interactive battleground of the key cultural forces. The joint field in the middle is often the arena for clashing ideologies, but when understood and managed properly, can lead to a C^3-type situation where a family business system can have the right balance between the cultures of Caring (paternalism); Controlling (managerialism); and Creating (entrepreneurialism).

The three-circle and C^3 models discussed above are important frameworks for understanding complex behaviour in family businesses, as they clarify the motivations and perceptions of individuals at various locations in the overall system. According to Gersick et al., however, the dimension of time is needed to make these frameworks more relevant to the reality of family and business organisation.

**The three-dimensional development model of family businesses**

According to Gersick et al., the business, ownership and family circles can

---


be used to create a snapshot of any family business system at a particular point in time. However, many of the most important dilemmas that family businesses encounter are caused by the passage of time, involving changes in the business, in the family, and in the distribution of ownership. A family consisting of a young couple and an infant child is not the same as a family with teenagers, or a family with elderly grandparents, adult offspring, and a new generation starting school. Similarly, entrepreneurial start-ups are not the same as businesses that have already secured a place in the market. Because of the critical roles key individuals often play over long periods, family businesses are especially affected by the inevitable aging of people in each of the sectors. Gersick et al. argue that any model describing family businesses should therefore take time and change into consideration, in order to reflect the real world accurately.  

Implementing their own suggestion, Gersick et al. have transformed the three-circle concept into a developmental model in which each of the three subsystems moves through a sequence of stages over time (see Figure 2). Basically, the authors have taken a variation of the three-circle model and chosen to focus on family, ownership and business, breaking each into individual life cycles. The result is a three-dimensional model referred to as the “developmental model”. The family axis of the developmental model has been greatly influenced by Levinson and other individual and family life-cycle theorists; the ownership axis is derived directly from Ward, while the business axis is a telescoped version of the numerous business life-cycle models. Although each of the conceptual models describing the family business and its life cycles has its own strengths and weaknesses, the three-dimensional model developed by Gersick et al. offers the most advanced insight into the stages of development in a family business’s ownership, family and management structures.

---

43 See KE Gersick, JA Davis, MM McCollom Hampton & I Lansberg, *Generation to generation…*.
45 See KE Gersick, JA Davis, MM McCollom Hampton & I Lansberg, *Generation to generation…*. 
Figure 2: Three-dimensional development model

As previously mentioned, each of the three subsystems, ownership, family and business, has a separate developmental dimension. Each of these three developmental dimensions will now be considered separately.

Ownership developmental dimension

Gersick et al. contend that it is the aspect of family ownership that defines a family business, even more than the family name on the door or the number of relatives in top management.46 The three-circle model explicitly identifies the ownership group in the family business system, replacing the two-circle concept that originally did not differentiate between ownership and management in the family business system.47

Ownership may take many forms in a family business. Ward48 first drew attention to different categories of ownership for family businesses when he proposed a typical progression of ownership from Controlling-Owner to Sibling Partnership, and finally to the Cousin Consortium or family dynasty. Gersick et al. suggest that the progression of ownership from one form to another

---

46 KE Gersick, JA Davis, MM McCollohm Hampton & I Lansberg, Generation to generation…. .
should be considered as developmental, because it follows a predictable sequence, and is at least partly driven by the aging and expansion of the owning family. The core issues of ownership development are well captured in three stages: Controlling-Owner businesses; Sibling Partnerships; and Cousin Consortiums.49

The form of ownership influences the business strategy, as different ownership plans require different strategies. Each stage also has key issues and challenges that are common to that stage in most family-owned businesses. While the stages of a family business are distinct, the lines between the stages are not clear or distinct. There are periods, for example, where one generation has not quite let go, and the one to follow has not quite taken charge.50

**Family developmental dimension**

The family developmental axis in Gersick et al.’s model shows the development of the family over time. The family developmental dimension captures the structural and interpersonal development of the family through such issues as marriage, parenthood, adult sibling relationships, in-laws, communication patterns, and family roles. The family axis is different from the ownership and business axes, because it is driven by the biological aging of family members, and is therefore more of a one-way street than the others. This dimension is also different from depictions of other family life cycle theories, because it is specifically about business families.51

Gersick et al. and Lansberg adapted and integrated the concepts of individual adult development and family life cycles to apply to business families, using the broadest generational definition of the term family.52 According to them, business families can be divided into four stages: Young business family; Entering the business; Working together; and Passing the baton. It is important to mention that, although the family developmental axis traces the developmental cycle of one nuclear family, more than one family life cycle will be evolving at the

---


same time, as business families become more complex. Among businesses that have reached the *Sibling Partnership* and *Cousin Consortium* stages on the ownership axis, there may be family groups that are in two, three, or even all four of the family stages.

**Business developmental dimension**

The developmental model of Gersick et al. once again suggests that a simple three-stage progression captures the essential useful differentiation of business stages. The first stage, *Start-up*, covers the founding of the business and the early years, when survival is at stake. The second stage, *Expansion/Formalisation*, covers a broad spectrum of businesses, and includes all family businesses from the point where they have established themselves in the market and stabilised operations into an initially predictable routine, through expansion and increasing organisational complexity, to the period when growth and organisational change slow down dramatically. The final stage on the business developmental axis is *Maturity*. This stage is characterised by an organisational structure that supports stability, a stable customer base with a modest growth or decline, a divisional structure run by a senior management team, and well-established organisational routines.53

It is important to emphasise at this stage that although it is useful to use the typology presented by the model of Gersick et al., an overemphasis on categorising may lead to oversimplification. There are many hybrid conditions, for instance, when ownership is shared across generations, or when a complex business that, although comfortable in maturity with its original product, opts to start some new ventures and to develop others. A given family business can be at more than one stage on any given axis, placing the focus periodically on archetypes such as *Controlling-Owner*, *Young business family*, or *Start-up* business.54 Gersick’s model ideally provides a predictable framework for the development of family businesses over time in each dimension, and suggests how a recognition of the current stage, and the combination of stages across ownership, family and businesses, could help to analyse the dynamics of the family business.55

---

54 F Neubauer & AG Lank, *The family business …*, p. 41.
Augmented development model of family businesses

According to Rutherford, Muse and Oswald, the underlying logic of Gersick et al.’s development model of family businesses (DMFB) has gone without challenge in the family business literature. Models developed since then are highly correlated with the DMFB, and make it clear that any study of the family business must take into account both family and business dynamics. What is less clear is which variables in the respective sets are actually important when classifying family businesses. In an effort to understand more clearly the classification of family businesses, Rutherford et al.’s research has attempted to add value to the widely utilised and respected DMFB.56

The augmented DMFB proposed by Rutherford et al. begins with Gersick et al.’s classification by utilising the family, business, and ownership dimensions. However, after a review of the existing literature, Rutherford et al. added a number of owner, family, business, and ownership characteristics. Specifically included are constructs found in the literature since the publication of the DMFB (1997-2005). The augmented DMFB further builds on Gersick et al.’s model by incorporating owner characteristics (gender, growth orientation, and education level); business characteristics (capital structure and strategic planning); family characteristics (divorce rate, family turnover, and family net worth invested in business); and one additional ownership variable (co-preneurship).57

Rutherford et al.58 postulate that their analysis indicates that the original DMFB provides a solid foundation for studying family business development. Their analysis, however, provides an extended model that may be superimposed on the original DMFB to gather additional forms of information regarding family business development.

The Bulleye systems approach to modelling family businesses

According to Pieper and Klein, the models developed to explain family businesses to date, are incomplete in that they exclude essential family

---

business dimensions and ignore important relationships among subsystems that may influence family business behaviour. In addition, most of the models developed are illustrated on rather basic levels of abstraction, which do not allow for feedback loops and reciprocal influences.

To address these shortcomings Pieper and Klein developed the “Bulleye”, an open systems approach that accounts for four levels of analysis, namely the individual, the subsystems, the family business, and the environment. Despite the challenges posed in graphically depicting the “Bulleye” (Figure 3) in an appropriate and comprehensive way, Zahra, Klein and Astrachan contend that the model contributes to a more unified and holistic view of the family business field.

Pieper and Klein, however, suggest that the Bulleye open systems approach need only be applied where complex interactions across various levels of analysis influence each other, and where theories concerning different levels of analysis are needed to explain a phenomenon.

![Figure 3: The Bulleye: Two-dimensional onlook onto the three-dimensional open-system](image)

---

Conclusion

Reviewing the evolution of the field of family business research, it can be observed that it remains preoccupied with the same issues that have dominated its discourse over the last 20 years, namely succession, performance, and governance of family firms. Paradoxically, key issues relating to the effective management of family businesses, such as goal and strategy formulation, innovation, professionalisation, resource management, internationalisation and culture, are routinely ignored or remain understudied by researchers in the field. Family business research continues to remain fragmented in its focus and findings, and lacks a solid theoretical grounding. Similarly Casillas and Aceda suggest that the literature on family business shows a high degree of fragmentation, which points to a lack of consensus as to what the prevailing conceptual foundations of the field are.

Since its inception, the field of family business studies has borrowed heavily from other disciplines, including Psychology, Sociology, Economics, Law and Family systems theories. This trend has continued, and much research is still grounded in well-established theories drawn from other disciplines. However, as the number of scholars investigating each topic remained small, the depth of understanding of each topic has remained shallow, lacking comprehensive theory-based frameworks.

A prevalence of descriptive studies based on small sample sizes has also been observed. Both Handler and Wortman have proposed that the range of research methods be broadened. However, a rise in empirical studies characterised by more rigour and larger samples has recently been observed. Despite this positive trend, the field remains dominated by familiar research methods and analytical tools that render a mechanical quality to published research and does not contribute to a deeper understanding of the forces that drive empirical observation. Because family businesses resist easy definition, many studies on family businesses are conceptual in nature. As a result,

On examining the field of study, one would have to conclude that while family business research has made great strides, it still has a long way to go before it will influence public policy decisions, improve managerial practices, or even enrich scholarly literature on family business.\footnote{SA Zahra & P Sharma, “Family business research…”, \textit{Family Business Review}, XVII(4), 2004, p. 337.} Casillas and Aceda\footnote{J Casillas & F Aceda, “Evolution of…”, \textit{Family Business Review}, XX(2), 2007, p. 141.} conclude that the field of study of family business is still an emerging discipline when compared to other neighbouring areas of study. Family business may be considered as just one particular area of business within the management field, but research rooted in its concepts offers a different view, showing how it is developing into a formal paradigm within the organisation of the science. Similarly, Nicholson\footnote{N Nicholson, “Evolutionary psychology and family business: A new synthesis for theory, research and practice”, \textit{Family Business Review}, XXI(1), 2008, p. 103.} advocates that the field of family business still, to a degree, suffers from relative isolation as a field of management.

Researchers in the field of family business do, however, continue to gain new insights and understanding into the fundamental processes that underlie these businesses. In doing so, their findings inform, direct, enrich and guide managerial practice as well as future research.
Entrepreneur, social capital and the survival of Afrikaner business on the Witwatersrand, 1930–2007: The case of Burgers Brothers Clothing enterprise

Grietjie Verhoef

Universiteit van Johannesburg
Johannesburg

Opsomming

Die ekonomiese afswaaifase van die 1930s is verswaar deur die geweldige droogte, plaas en peste in die landbou en toenemende verarming onder blanke Suid-Afrikaners. Verstedeliking het een oorlewingstrategie gebied. Ty Burgers het ‘n klerewinkel begin met as teikenmark die verarmde blankes en verarmde Afrikaners op die Witwatersrand. Hierdie artikel maak gebruik van sosiale kapitaalteorie om die vestiging van nuwe netwerke deur die Burgers onderneming in die sake-omgewing te verduidelik, waardeur die oorlewing van die Afrikaneronderneming bewerkstellig is.Die Burgers onderneming moes vestig te midde van sterk mededinging in die klere- en modebedryf in Johannesburg. Mededinging is veral gebied deur Indiër- en Joodse handelaars. Die Burgers familiebesigheid het homself baie vernuftig geposisioneer tussen die Afrikaner kultuur- en politieke netwerk en die Joodse sakenetwerk sedert die vestigingsjare. Burgers het die voorkeurverskaffer geword van klerasie aan die Afrikaners in Johannesburg, asook later vir skoolkleres en sportdrag. Die artikel ondersoek die ontwikkeling van die besturstrategie van die Burgers familiebesigheid sedert die na-oorlogse jare van mededingende nasionalisme in Johannesburg. Die opvolgstrategie en die impak daarvan op die onderneming word ook bespreek.

Humble but noble

The Burgers family farmed in the Graaff Reinet district during the late 19th century. Jakobus Wilhelm Burgers (senior) was born in the district of Aberdeen in the Eastern Cape in 1900. He married Johanna van Heerden, the daughter of a Scottish mother, Harriet Wheeler, and an Afrikaner father, Karel
van Heerden. Harriet had survived the concentration camps of the South African War between Britain and the Boer Republics, 1899–1902. The father of JW Burgers was also Jakobus Wilhelm Burgers, the half-brother of Thomas Francois Burgers, the President of the South African Republic between 1843 and 1881, preceding President Stephanus Johannes Paul Kruger, the President of the South African Republic at the time of the declaration of war on the Boer Republics by Britain in 1899. The Transvaal was relatively undeveloped, rural and primarily dependent on agriculture. JW Burgers and Johanna had nine children. Some diamond deposits were discovered in the Western Transvaal during the 1902s, which then attracted many poor uneducated people in search of employment. JW Burgers worked first as a surveyor on the diamond mines in the Western Transvaal, then moved to Piet Retief in the South Eastern Transvaal and during the depression of the 1930s moved to Cape Town, where he worked as a civil servant in the prisons service. The couple initially lived in the Western Transvaal on the diamond diggings in the Lichtenburg district on the farm Welverdiend, where the eldest, Tomas Francois Burgers, was born in 1928. (He is currently living in Kraaifontein on the Cape Peninsula.) The second son, Jakobus Wilhelm du Plessis Burgers, was born in 1931 and died in 2000 at the age of 69. He was called “Ty” Burgers. When he was a young boy aged 18 months, he was stung by a scorpion. His brave conduct during the incident, as well as the fact that he survived the sting, earned him the nickname ‘tough’ which became ‘Ty’. Tough is the English for ‘taai’ in Afrikaans, which simply became ‘Ty’ in the English-dominated Johannesburg environment where he had settled during the second half of the twentieth century.

Methodology

Research into the history of family businesses in South Africa is not met with great enthusiasm: politics, social relationships and business secrets have

---

often rendered families reluctant to disclose private documents for academic research. This is especially pertinent with small family firms. A more serious concern is the lack of systematic recordkeeping with the view to preserving the history of the enterprise for future research. The study of family businesses in Johannesburg is part of an ongoing research project at the University of Johannesburg. The aim is to conduct as comprehensive as possible research on family businesses, initially in the western suburbs of Johannesburg and then to expand the research to adjacent areas. The diversity of family business is rich and the multiplicity of firm strategies illuminating. This article details the history of a landmark Afrikaans business in Johannesburg, that of the Burgers brothers. No records were available, apart from the meticulously kept financial records of Bobby Kotze. Some newspaper clippings could be found, but nothing substantial on the business. Private documents of the founder were not disclosed. Some records could be found in the company records of Wesco Beleggings, the company of Dr Albert Wessels.

This research therefore relied heavily on interviews with family members. The choice of interviewees was predetermined: the brothers Burgers who are still alive and active in the business were all interviewed. The only child of Ty in South Africa was interviewed. The brother-in-law, Bobby Kotze, who had lived through the uncertainty of the take-over and the transition after the death of Ty Burgers, was interviewed. Petro, the wife of Fouché Burgers, was also interviewed, since she had lived through the turbulent times with Fouché. All interviews were transcribed and will be kept in the University of Johannesburg’s Rare Book Collection, where a depository of oral interviews conducted for the family business research is kept. In this way the research project will contribute to the systematic collection of the invaluable memories of early entrepreneurs. This predicament is not understood by European researchers of family businesses, who have access to more readily available systematic company records, official documents and organised company archives. The extensive literature on oral sources\(^6\) reflects the value of oral testimony, but should also be treated with caution, given the intentions of interviewees. While most of the oral history of South Africa emerged as part of

the anti-apartheid resistance movement, very limited systematic oral history collection has taken place for the writing up of the economic and business history of South Africa. The fact is that a lack of written sources makes the use of oral testimony imperative. Oral sources are especially important for the development of systematic research on family business, and, in this case study, constituted the core of the research material. It is hoped that this research will encourage South African family businesses to contribute to the systematic research on and explanation of the immense contribution they have made (and are still making) towards the establishment of a modern South African economy. This article will explain the insecurity of the entrepreneur, the risks of the establishment of an enterprise and the construction of networks to support the entrepreneur in bridging uncertainty and creating existential security for those dependent upon the entrepreneur.

**In the city of opportunity**

The poverty of Afrikaners and the disadvantaged social and economic position they subsequently held in the urban centres in the first part of the twentieth century exacerbated their condition. Employment was scarce and discrimination against them frequently experienced. In the *Rand Daily Mail* a frustrated Afrikaner wrote in 1934: “Some employment opportunities are reserved only for English boys. ... this reveals the most distressing fact that all desirable jobs are reserved for English boys. Are boys who are not English, however smart they may be, to be penalised because they had the misfortune of not being born of English parents? Apparently the majority of employers are not only of this opinion, but are actually practicing this manifest unjust policy.” The marginalisation of Afrikaans people in Johannesburg encouraged them to develop strategies to sustain themselves. One of these was to emerge as entrepreneurs. Although the majority of Afrikaners urbanised in the first half of the twentieth century were seeking employment in the industrial and mining sectors, a few early entrepreneurs bravely attempted to set up their own businesses. A number of general dealer retail shops were established, some entrepreneurs were agents for the fresh produce markets, and some began the manufacturing of furniture. Moreover, a publishing house and a newspaper were started, automobile traders emerged and several businesses selling fresh

---


meat and produce were opened. Afrikaners gradually moved into the world of finance by establishing building societies, insurance companies and, in 1934, Volkskas Bank.9 The growing Afrikaans population in Johannesburg attracted the young and ambitious who were seeking their share in the seemingly never-ending prosperity.

This article explores the history of a poor young Afrikaans-speaking man with an elementary education who exploited the ambitious entrepreneurial spirit within him to establish the Burgers Broers family business enterprise, established in Johannesburg in 1962. The focus on entrepreneurship as manifested in a family business in the case of the Burgers enterprise is furthermore explained, as it displayed the development and exploration of social capital to sustain the business. The third aspect of this paper is the influence of Afrikaner nationalism, which served as a strong mobilising force behind the establishment, growth and diversification of Afrikaner business in South Africa.

Figure 1: Ty Burgers, founder of Burgers Broers

Entrepreneurship: Social capital and nationalism

An entrepreneurial spirit is often nurtured under conditions of poverty, low social status and lack of opportunity, currently visible in transitional

---

In mid-twentieth century South Africa a large proportion of Afrikaans people were still struggling with poverty, social exclusion and a lack of education and training which could secure employment. From these circumstances several family enterprises emerged to devise strategies to sustain themselves and those dependent upon them. As explained by Basu (2008), the literature on ethnic entrepreneurship or minority entrepreneurship (used interchangeably) has reflected on economic disadvantages as ‘push factors’ that result in people subject to such circumstances taking up self-employment to sustain themselves. Although the cultural predisposition or ‘pull factors’ which explain the tendency of certain ethnic entities (such as Jews, or Protestants or the Marwaris in India) to resort to entrepreneurial activities may not be applicable to the Afrikaans community in South Africa, other contextual factors have indeed contributed – as in the decision by Ty Burgers to set up his own business. Here consideration can be given to low entry barriers, ethnic residential clustering and ‘mixed embeddedness’ or the interaction between the socio-economic and ethno-social characteristics of the community. A very powerful explanation developed for ethnic entrepreneurship is that ethnic entrepreneurs are involved in ‘dual cultures and countries’, which provides such entrepreneurs access to multiple cultures. These circumstances may then produce ‘a duality of personality and culture’, which could make the entrepreneur more creative in business, “hence, close in character to a Schumpeterian entrepreneur” [source?] with an alertness to detect opportunities. Most importantly, to these entrepreneurs, access to ethnic resources is key. This dependence can be explained as access to ‘social capital’, which offers the advantage of shared values and less greed, but could also result in undue partiality towards family or community members.

The distinction between ‘entrepreneur’ and simple ‘self-employment’ is not always obvious at the outset, but some enterprises succeed in surviving in the longer term. The case study of the Burgers family enterprise is an example of unintentional family entrepreneurship commencing as self-employment and eventually leading to sustained family business enterprise. De Vries et al.

(2007) described ‘founder entrepreneurs’ as “… people who are achievement-oriented: they like taking responsibility for decisions, and they dislike repetitive, routine work. They are creative and imaginative, with high levels of energy and great perseverance, and they are willing to take calculated risks … Because of their high energy levels, entrepreneurs can instill contagious enthusiasm in others in their organization.” It is this mentality and agency of entrepreneurs that has been vital to economies in the process of change. It has also been the source of social transformation for communities caught in a cycle of impoverishment and lack of opportunity. This is where the ‘self-made person’ has succeeded in extending opportunities to those around him/her. Since Cole’s explorations in entrepreneurial history it has been accepted that the entrepreneurs should be explored not solely as captives of their historical and economic circumstances, but as individuals, as agents of entrepreneurship, while attending to the networks entrepreneurs establish for themselves in which to operate. While the entrepreneurial spirit is the essence of entrepreneurship, society and institutions are equally important in paving the way for independent business operations. The entrepreneur’s economic action is, according to Granovetter and Swedberg, “…socially situated. It cannot be explained by reference to individual motives alone. It is embedded in ongoing networks of personal relationships rather than being carried out by atomized actors.” In a similar way Shaperol and Sokol argued that “… a social system that places a high value on innovation, risk-taking, and independence is more likely to produce entrepreneurial events than a system with contrasting values.” In this case study the nature of the socio-economic environment seems to have constituted such an accommodating or conducive environment, but the greatest value of the environment was the ‘weak ties’ (according to Granovetter, 1995) which offered information and expertise from more diverse origins than the close cultural or ethnic community to support the new enterprise. The ‘weak ties’ here refers to personal goodwill

15 M Casson et al., *The Oxford handbook of entrepreneurship*, p. 5.
connections with people outside the Afrikaner or family circles, contacts with newly acquainted fellow businessmen and relationships with suppliers.

In South Africa the marginalisation of Afrikaners in economic life as a result of impoverishment over a sustained period as well as cultural sidelining was a serious cause for concern to the small Afrikaner elite. In effect the majority of Afrikaners perceived themselves economically as “an ethnic minority” marginalised from participation in the mainstream of the economy.21 Afrikaner social capital was mobilised on different levels to address this condition. Several earlier attempts culminated in the Economic People’s Congress in 1939, where Afrikaner leaders across the broad spectrum of religious, cultural and economic activities decided to plan and implement a concerted strategy to ensure the conscious and systematic penetration of Afrikaners into the mainstream economy.22 Afrikaner nationalism thus mobilised Afrikaner social capital to assist Afrikaner entry into business, industry, mining and the financial sector. These initiatives contributed successfully to the emergence of several Afrikaner entrepreneurs. The Burgers enterprise benefited from the rhetoric of Afrikaner nationalism, the sense of loyalty encouraged among Afrikaners, specifically in the relatively ‘unfriendly’, less accommodating urban environment of Johannesburg, but never utilised nationalism exclusively as a business strategy. The Burgers enterprise skilfully benefited simultaneously from two networks of social capital – that of the Jewish business community as well as the Afrikaner community to which it belonged and within which it was physically located. These networks helped to establish so-called ‘reputational bonding’ on which the entrepreneur could rely in future.23 The Burgers enterprise is a case study of the multi-tiered operation of social capital,24 utilised skilfully to develop ‘reputational bonding’. The Burgers enterprise used these networks to develop a well-known and trusted ‘brand’ as clothing wholesaler in Johannesburg.

Consensus on the definition of what constitutes family firms seems to elude scholars. Colli and Rose (2008) used the following as an acceptable definition, capable of describing the general phenomenon:

“... a broad general definition of the family firm is one which a family owns enough of the equity to be able to exert control over strategy and is involved in top management positions.”

There are three elements to family firms: kinship – defined in terms of culture; property – the ownership of a crucial element of capital; and ownership and succession – the ownership of and succession control of the strategic management. In the Burgers family firm the ownership and succession strategies were neglected and almost resulted in the termination of family control.

**Beginning his own business: Ty Burgers, ambitious policeman**

The “Burgers Pakke en Klerefabrikante Edmd. Bpk.” (Burgers Suit and Clothing Manufacturers, (Pty) Ltd) was established in Johannesburg in 1959. The founder was Ty Burgers. Ty Burgers completed only standard 8 at school and then joined the South African Police Force in Cape Town during the early 1950s. He barely made ends meet and supplemented his income by assisting his father in selling fresh meat to relatively poor communities in the Cape Peninsula. In 1952 he was transferred to the flying squad at the Norwood Police station in Johannesburg. When off duty, policemen often frequented the Norwood swimming pool. On one such occasion Ty met the beautiful young English-speaking girl Joy Diesel, whom he soon married. They lived in a flat in La Rochelle, a working-class suburb south of the city where many working-class Afrikaners had settled and the Afrikaans Dutch Reformed Church had performed an important role as social caretaker of the newly urbanised people. The meagre remuneration levels of policemen

---


28 Informal selling of food and clothing was common among poor people: See CGW Schumann, “Die Afrikaner in die handel”, *Verslag van die Tweede Ekonomiese Volkskongres* (FAK, Bloemfontein, October 1950), pp. 41-42.

29 Interview, G Verhoef/F Burgers, 20 June 2008.

sometimes served as an incentive to them to investigate alternative ways of supplementing their income. Ty also sought other ways to meet his obligations as a young husband. Ty Burgers was a hardworking man. After hours he sold refreshments at the Johannesburg drive-in, where he used his fine appearance to convince the female movie-goers to buy from him. His ambition was to work for himself – he did not want to work for a boss. The success with his part-time refreshment enterprise convinced him that he might be able to succeed on his own.

Soon he investigated opportunities to sell clothing to the working-class Afrikaans people living in the southern suburbs of Johannesburg. He noticed that they worked long hours and could not go shopping during normal shopping hours. Furthermore, these people were poor and could not pay the prices charged in shops outright – they might benefit from ‘home’ shopping, where they might fit clothing in the privacy of their modest dwellings and pay in installments. Ty was prepared to take clothing to these people and accept installment payments. He met Benzion Tanchum, a Jewish clothing wholesaler and manufacturer, who had immigrated to South Africa from Lithuania with his parents in the 1920s. Tanchum was merely one of a steady stream of Jews immigrating to South Africa from Lithuania to escape the Tsarist rule first of Tsar Nicholas and then his son Tsar Alexander in 1856. These Jews were known as the ‘Russian Jews’ from the Eastern parts of Russia and left Lithuania primarily in search of economic security. The most famous Jewish immigrant to the Transvaal was Samuel Marks, also known as ‘the uncrowned King of the Transvaal’. Lithuanian Jews were advised to consider immigrating to South Africa, since it was “an increasingly attractive destination, like Australia and America, for young men of wide ambition and narrow means.” A noticeable number of Lithuanian Jews finally ended up in the Transvaal after the discovery of diamonds in the Northern Cape in 1867 and the discovery of gold in 1886 on the Witwatersrand (located in the Zuid-Afrikaansche Republiek – South African Republic, later to become the British colony of Transvaal). These Jews distinguished themselves as middle-class tradesmen, engaging in importing and retail goods distribution, as well as workmen, but usually not as industrialists. These Jews were often known as the “Jewish commercial men”, who established a network of tradesmen and

33 R Mendelsohn, Sammy Marks..., p. 6.
‘smouse’ (hawkers) selling much-needed consumer goods in ‘bazaars’ (stores with a wide range of goods from household ware to clothing, to hardware tools, to food etc). They were known to purchase in bulk, cutting out middlemen in order to sell at discount prices to the public. They advertised themselves as businessmen ‘catering to all tastes in the community’. These wholesalers engaged largely in the clothing and textile businesses and can be regarded as responsible for the evolution of the retail trade in South Africa.\(^{34}\)

During the 1930s the Transvaal newspaper \textit{Die Transvaler} published an editorial on the “Jewish Question”. It was concerned about Jewish advantage in business and Afrikaner disadvantage,\(^{35}\) but this concern did not capture goodwill and co-operation in ordinary business engagements between Jewish businessmen and customers, who included Afrikaans people and Afrikaans entrepreneurs. The domination by Jewish businessmen in several retail sectors, \textit{inter alia} in the clothing industry, was general knowledge,\(^{36}\) but what is less well known is how Jewish businessmen assisted non-Jewish entrepreneurs to get themselves into business. The experiences of Ty Burgers is an excellent case study of the unfolding of such co-operation and support by several Jewish businessmen to an Afrikaans entrepreneur attempting to find his way into business in Johannesburg.

Benzion Tanchum was one of the Lithuanian Jewish immigrants who established a wholesale trading business. He established “Bentank Clothing & Shirt Factory” in 1945 in Nursery Road, Fordsburg, Johannesburg.\(^{37}\) Fordsburg was an area inhabited by poor working-class people. Most of the inhabitants were newly urbanised Afrikaners. Fordsburg was central to all business activities in Johannesburg. In Fordsburg Ty met Benzion Tanchum, who became his mentor in business. Ty obtained clothing on approval from Tanchum and took to the streets of Johannesburg hawking his wares from a suitcase. Soon he was able to buy a bicycle, and he attached a basket to the rear in which to pack the clothing. Ty sold clothing in the southern suburbs of Johannesburg, i.e. in La Rochelle, Turffontein, and Rosettenville. He concentrated on the Afrikaans community, because he felt a strong sense of loyalty towards his people and he was barely able to speak English. A work


\(^{37}\) \textit{Braby’s South African Commercial Directory}, 1945, p. 751.
 ethic and desire to become an independent businessman, complemented by a
good nature and ability to communicate and work with people, were valuable
attributes to Ty. He could soon replace the bicycle with his first automobile,
a Prefect car, in which he put his wife and first child (daughter Carin), and
roamed the streets selling his clothing. He sold much of the clothing on credit,
and therefore visited his clients on a weekly basis to collect payment.

The close relationship between Ty and Benzion Tanchum nurtured Ty’s
business confidence and experience. He established a wide network of
customers amongst the Afrikaans working-class people, with whom he
identified and felt a strong sense of loyalty.\[slightly repetitive, Grietjie?] The
informal business he established soon developed into a sustainable part
of Benzion’s business. Ty had approached Tanchum about the possibility of
shareholding in Bentank Clothing and Shirt Factory, but Benzion Tanchum
was not interested in a partner to his business. This unwillingness to forego
autonomy or independence later characterised Ty Burgers’ management
style. Benzion Tanchum was only prepared to assist Ty in establishing his
own business, by providing clothing on favourable terms. Finally in 1959 Ty
was able to open his own business in premises on the first floor of the Jewish-
owned Kushner Building in 33 Central Road, Mayfair, Johannesburg.\[slightly repetitive, Grietjie?]
His wife Joy had inherited £2 000, which she offered Ty as establishment capital
to start up his own business. As a policeman, he was not able to save enough
to start up his own enterprise, nor could he rely on family to supply capital for
such undertaking. The only notion of entrepreneurial activity in the Burgers
family was his father’s meat-selling activities in the suburbs surrounding Cape
Town. This served only to supplement his meagre public service remuneration,
and did not provide sufficient savings to begin an independent business. The
mentorship of Benzion Tanchum provided Ty with the confidence to take the
step of venturing on his own.

38 Interview, G Verhoef/J Cernades, 12 February 2009.
39 See A Licht and JI Siegel, “The social dimension of entrepreneurship”, p. 515.
Figure 2: The genuine leather suit that belonged to President TF Burgers, here displayed by Fouché Burgers and a shop assistant

The mid-1950s, the aftermath of post-war economic recovery, was a period of strong economic growth in South Africa\(^1\) and middle-class wealth was booming. Spending on consumer goods and clothing adjusted upwards and the market among the growing Afrikaner middle class provided the opportunity Ty Burgers needed. As tentative discussions between Ty and Tanchum about the acquisition of shares by Ty in Tanchum’s business failed to materialise, Ty realised that the time was opportune for the establishment of a business in the clothing wholesale sector. Ty had become acquainted with the industry, had established some customer base and he could rely on the support network of Tanchum and other Jewish entrepreneurs in Johannesburg\(^2\) – a benefit of the ‘dual cultures’ of the Jewish and Afrikaner communities.\(^3\) Ty opened his business in 1959 in the clothing industry as a clothing wholesaler, selling men’s suits shirts and trousers. The business was registered as Burgers Suit and Clothing Manufacturers Pty Ltd. He opened his third shop in 32 Central Road, Fordsburg, Johannesburg. He rented shop space from Benjamin Rosmarin, a Jewish engineer and landlord, on the third floor of Rosmarin’s building, just opposite the road from Ben Tanchum’s wholesale business. The location was prime: in the building was the restaurant The Red Lantern, a location frequented by the wealthy Harry Oppenheimer of the mining house

\(^2\) Interview, G Verhoef/F Burgers, 20 June 2008.
Anglo American Corporation. Nearby was the Monk’s Inn, another favourite restaurant visited by well-known Johannesburg businessmen. Also in the vicinity were an art gallery and a travel agency.44

Peter Arendson, a Dutch immigrant, joined Ty Burgers as a partner with 50 percent shares in the enterprise. Together they started the business with an explicit focus on the Afrikaans community. The competitive advantage of the enterprise was Ty’s knowledge of the Afrikaans customer base and favourable trading conditions Ty Burgers negotiated at the outset. The Burgers clothing manufacturer and wholesaler negotiated a thirty-day credit on clothing purchased from suppliers, such as Benjamin Tanchum. Forward selling on thirty days’ credit still allowed Burger’s clients one month’s credit. Ty had established very good relations with his first Afrikaans customers in Johannesburg, to whom he sold clothing he obtained on approval45 and later purchased from Tanchum. He relied on the integrity of his customers and their pride in not defaulting on debt repayments – even in his bicycle years he did not run bad debt.46 His new enterprise with Arendsen followed the same strategy: thirty days’ credit and strong client loyalty, which guaranteed regular settling of outstanding debt.

The business model was also a simple and modest one. The primary aim was to establish a clothing manufacturer and wholesaler of quality affordable clothing to the customers attracted to him as an Afrikaans entrepreneur since the days in which he sold clothing from his bicycle in Johannesburg. The goal was to pay the rent of the premises and then grow profits to expand to other parts of the Witwatersrand. The initial business model was to sell formal men’s clothing at a maximum price of £10 for the best quality suits. Cheap suits were sold at £3, and expensive suits £10, but no suits were traded at a higher price. This was a conscious strategy to serve the growing Afrikaans middle-class market as well as poor Afrikaners in Johannesburg and make them feel that they were obtaining real value for money. The loyalty to the Afrikaner customer base and fellow newly urbanised Afrikaners in need of basic goods, such as decent clothing, strengthened the conscious business decision of the Burgers enterprise to develop that market segment. The banker to Burgers Suit and Clothing Manufacturers Pty Ltd was Volkskas Bank. The significance of this relationship was that Ty had approached the newly established Afrikaans

44 Interview, G Verhoef/P Burgers, 17 February 2009.
45 To take good ‘on appro’ meant that no payment was made when goods were taken to be sold. Once the goods were sold, the supplier was paid the full amount due for the merchandise.
46 Interview, G Verhoef/J Cernades, 12 February 2009.
bank Volkskas as a rising Afrikaans entrepreneur. Ty was well known to the officials of the Fordsburg branch of Volkskas.\textsuperscript{47} The first bookkeeper was Josie Koffler, who worked for the business until her retirement in 1985. The first auditor to the business was Ray Oliver, employed by the auditing firm Marshall, Roe and Company in Mayfair, Johannesburg. Ray Oliver also owned a travel agency located in Mayfair, a suburb bordering Fordsburg.\textsuperscript{48} Ray Oliver soon joined the business with Ty and Arendson. A meaningful overlap of networks manifested in the Burgers business: embeddedness in a network of Jewish business contacts and goodwill, and location in an area frequented by the Afrikaans community as the primary target market, which provided the second network to sustain the business.

The nature of the business was trading in formal men’s clothing, especially suits, trousers, jackets and shirts, but it had no factory. The name of the enterprise referred to “Manufacturers”, but Burgers had no such facility. The service-oriented approach of the business was its main advantage, especially because it was building on the good client base established by Ty’s earlier street merchandising. Service provision was thus afforded by obtaining a manufacturer to supply what Burgers’ clients wanted, at the price and quality levels demanded. This Burgers succeeded in doing by purchasing from Veka, down the road from them.\textsuperscript{49} In 1938 a group of Afrikaans entrepreneurs established the “\textit{Volkshemde en Klerefabriek}” (People’s Shirt and Clothing Manufacturer). This was part of the upsurge of Afrikaner nationalism after the 1938 centenary celebrations of the Great Trek.\textsuperscript{50} \textit{Volkshemde} struggled to break into the English-dominated clothing manufacturing sector, but in 1943 moved their business to Fordsburg. Then Albert Wessels took over as managing director of the business and gradually diversified the business by take-overs and decentralisation of operations. In 1958 “\textit{Federale Volksbeleggings}” (FVB –

\textsuperscript{47} Interview, G Verhoef/B Kotze, 19 May 2009.
\textsuperscript{48} Interview, G Verhoef/T Burgers, 17 February 2009; Interview, G Verhoef/B Kotze. 19 May 2009.
\textsuperscript{49} Interview, G Verhoef/P Burgers, 20 June 2008.
\textsuperscript{50} The Great Trek was the mass movement in 1838 into the interior of then the Cape Colony by Afrikaners who were dissatisfied with British colonial rule and aspired to establish their own free republics in the interior. The commemoration of the event in 1938 led to a strong rekindling of Afrikaner nationalism, which manifested in various ways. One of these was a drive by Afrikaner businessmen to capture a more meaningful part of the South African economy, since South African business had been dominated by English, Jewish and foreign European businessmen. See G Verhoef, “Nationalism, social capital and economic empowerment: SANLAM and the economic upliftment of the Afrikaner People, 1918–1960”, \textit{Business History}, 50(6), 2008, pp. 695-714.
Federal People’s Investments\textsuperscript{51} bought a substantial shareholding in Veka – the new abbreviated and registered name of the former company. Veka acquired Transvaal Mackintosh [?] (Pty) Ltd, which had licences to import fabric from overseas. Veka also established Prefect Schoolwear, to manufacture school blazers and schoolwear, and manufacturers of juvenile clothing Allwear Gyms and Juvenile Clothing, which secured its place in the clothing manufacturing industry of South Africa.\textsuperscript{52} Albert Wessels admired the entrepreneurship of Ty Burgers and inspired Ty to persevere in his new enterprise.\textsuperscript{53} With Veka down the road, Burgers had ready access to an established clothing manufacturer and could offer clients fine clothing – either in the form of already made up garments, or suits that could be made from fabric chosen by customers. No formal contractual arrangement existed between Veka and Burgers, but informally a good working relationship developed. This symbiosis was mutually beneficial and indicative of mutual support developing among upcoming Afrikaner enterprise. By the time of the establishment of Burgers, Veka had experienced problems with overproduction\textsuperscript{54} and benefitted from the outlet the reliable Burgers name could offer them.

\textbf{Kinship ties – Sharing with the family}

The Burgers business was initially not a family enterprise and not intended to be one, but the success of the enterprise soon lured Ty’s four brothers to join him in Johannesburg. In 1962 Fouché, the third brother, moved from Cape Town, where he had worked for the pharmaceutical company B Owen Jones. In 1963 the next brother, Karel, followed, then Hennie in 1964 and finally Pietie in 1966.\textsuperscript{55} Ty was a good people’s person: he could interact with people from all walks of life and possessed good communication and connective skills. In the core of his business, he had acquired a keen sense of quality top-class


\textsuperscript{53} Interview, G Verhoef/E Bradley, 14 March 2009; Interview, G Verhoef/B Kotze, 19 May 2009.


\textsuperscript{55} The eldest brother, Tomas Francois Burgers (known as Tom), was a professional photographer in Cape Town and never took an interest in the business. He worked for the South African Broadcasting Company in Cape Town and today still lives there (G Verhoef Interview, Tom Burgers, 20 January 2009).
fabrics. The business evolved very much around him, despite the fact that it had other shareholders. In practice, Ty was left to run the business. Although shareholding was held jointly by Ty, Arendson and Oliver, the enterprise developed a strong family character through the employment of the other brothers in the business. The ‘family’ character was an invaluable asset in the Afrikaans market, where family ties and ethnic culture were highly regarded. During the early 1960s women’s and children’s clothing was gradually added to the stock. The business also opened a school uniform section in order to provide for the clothing needs of an entire family. Burgers never advertised their business – except much later in schools’ annual calendars. The brand was spread by word of mouth, primarily as a result of the growing appeal to nationalist-inspired Afrikaners to support their own people’s businesses. The South African economy was also booming during the 1960s and Afrikaner enterprise was growing rapidly on the back of the economic prosperity. It became ‘fashionable’ for Afrikaans people to take the whole family to Burgers to buy their clothes. People came to buy from the Burgers clothing wholesaler travelling from remote areas in the Transvaal and Orange Free State rural areas. It was recollected that families would pack a picnic basket with snacks and drinks, and travel early on Saturday mornings from small rural towns to buy clothing for the whole family at Burgers. People used to stand in rows on the pavements early in the morning before the opening of the store, drinking their warm coffee from flasks and eating sandwiches while waiting for the doors to open for business. The ‘family’ characteristics of the business dovetailed with the ethnic ‘family’ characteristics of the Afrikaner people collectively mobilising for their entry into the mainstream South African economy.

Figure 3: The five Burger brothers. Second from the left is Bobby Kotzé, brother-in-law responsible for financial recordkeeping

56 Interview, G Verhoef/J Cernades, 12 February 2009.
Burgers also appealed to the growing English-speaking urban community and was soon famous for its good service by ‘the five Burgers brothers’! In the shop the public was served by all the Burgers brothers with good quality clothing. The business was known for its personal service to customers and tireless friendliness. Burgers was also renowned for the fine quality Dutch blankets and German Berghaus coats imported from Europe. At the beginning in the early 1960s the shop did not always have stock of all the garments displayed. Clients would select a specific style suit and a matching fabric, but on the shelves were only empty boxes. Then the shop assistant would “Phone the factory to establish whether stock was available”. That phone call was often to Veka, to whom a fast-running messenger was sent to fetch the suit, trousers or other garment. If Veka did not have the desired size, it was ordered and delivered. A family business developed – family as employees and families as clients. By the early 1970s the Burgers business was well established with annual turnover in excess of R4 million.

Big money: Professionalisation of ownership and management

The success and loyalty brand of Burgers developed into an attractive enterprise for ambitious Afrikaner businessmen in Johannesburg. Growing Afrikaner penetration into the formerly English-dominated Johannesburg business environment manifested in the mining industry, media and the general tertiary sector. The attractiveness of Burgers lay in its extensive appeal across cultural boundaries and the growing geographical branch network to serve the customer base. Albert Wessels had established a growing conglomerate of businesses, known as Wesco Beleggings, from the initial clothing enterprise, Veka. Wesco Beleggings included several clothing manufacturers and retailers, such as Veka. Wessels developed an interest in the successful “Burgers Pakke en Klerefabrikante Edms. Bpk.” He had extended encouragement to Ty

---

57 Interview, G Verhoef/P Burgers, 17 September 2009.
58 Interview, G Verhoef/P Burgers, 20 June 2008.
and admired the success his business had achieved. In January 1970 it was announced that FVB and Wesco Beleggings had acquired a 51% stake in Burgers, which meant that ownership shifted to professional businessmen with no family ties to the original founder. This transaction led to the introduction of professional management for the business: the new owners appointed a new board of directors and Ty as the new managing director. The other four Burgers brothers were still employed in the business. Peter Arendson sold his share to Ty and Oliver also decided to terminate his relationship with the business. The board of directors were Afrikaners representing the business interests of Wesco and FVB. This division between day-to-day business and policy formulation by a board of directors outside the enterprise soon created tension. It became apparent that Veka had hoped that “Burgers Pakke en Klerefabrikante” would become the retail market outlet for Veka clothing in Johannesburg. A person completely unfamiliar with the Burgers business, Hennie Jansen, was appointed to do the purchases for Burgers. This step illustrated the insensitivity of the new controlling interest to the historical development and specific Burgers ‘brand’ that had taken shape.

The Burgers customer base was firmly rooted in the loyalty of Afrikaners and English customers across the social spectrum, with Ty unmistakably well connected to the rising Afrikaner business elite, but not yet entirely accepted in those circles. He had not completed school and obtained no university education. He was accustomed to run the business as the owner/manager, with little or no interference from Arendsen or Oliver. His brothers were employees of the business, who were subjected to his authoritarian management style. The Wesco / FVB take-over was negotiated between Ty, FVB and Wesco Beleggings, but he had not factored in the impact the loss of autonomy would have on him. He had become increasingly prepared to forgo income and bear costs and risks alone with his family, just to engage in an independent venture. “The special preference for autonomy found among entrepreneurs is not the only special characteristic that they exhibit in comparison to average population.” In August 1971 Ty resigned his position at Burgers under Wesco management, complaining that he could not work with people who did

---

63 Interview, G Verhoef/Bobby Kotze, 19 May 2009.
65 Interview, G Verhoef/F Burgers, 17 January 2009.
66 Interview, G Verhoef/P Burgers, 24 April 2009.
68 Wesco Beleggings: Minutes of Board of Directors, 24 November 1971.
not know the business, but made policy decisions at board level which were out of touch with and not in the interests of the enterprise and its customers. His press statement typified the frustration of an initial owner/founder in disagreement with the outside shareholders:

‘I built up this company with my own hands to the position this group is today. Everything I thought or did centred around this business. But I can no longer co-operate with the board of directors. I simply had to resign.’ (my translation) \(^{69}\)

The drive to succeed for the sake of success itself, and not for the fruits of success, and the special preference for autonomy and independent action \(^{70}\) were the primary driving forces behind Ty Burgers. The absorption into the Wesco Group offered substantial material gain, an elevated status among the Afrikaner business elite and the potential for participation in larger and more diversified business opportunities. The latter were less attractive to Ty – he yearned for autonomy and success as an independent businessman.

**Brothers Burgers**

The business established by Ty Burgers was no more, but the family had only one competitive advantage: they knew clothing and they had captured the Afrikaans middle-class and working-class market in Johannesburg through the strategy of affordability and quality. Above all, they were the Burgers brand. They had training in no other field of business and no capital to venture into something entirely new. Ty was paid out his shares in the business then owned by Wesco, thus providing him with some capital, but his resignation was subject to a restraint of trade. He would not be permitted to return to his beloved clothing business within three years. It took the family three months to regroup and in November 1971 they announced their return strategy. The brothers registered a new company: Die Burgers Broers Edms Bpk (The Burgers Brothers Pty Ltd – company registration number 71/12864/07).

---

They established themselves in 33 Central Road, Fordsburg, just across from the original business.\textsuperscript{71} The building in which the business was re-opened, was bought by a Mr Van der Westhuizen, owner of Crosby Dry Cleaners, under the pretext that he wanted to establish a new dry cleaning outlet in Fordsburg. He was acting on behalf of the Burgers brothers, who then rented the premises from him to re-establish their clothing business.\textsuperscript{72} This collaboration was indicative of the supportive network among small Afrikaans businessmen in Johannesburg at a time when Afrikaans-controlled business was steadily making inroads into the English-dominated Johannesburg.\textsuperscript{73} Ty opened a business adjacent to the brothers’ business trading in travel gear and toys.\textsuperscript{74} The brothers Ty, Fouché, Karel, Hennie and Pietie in collaboration with their brothers-in-law Bobby Kotze (married to Cecile, née Burgers) and Ray Downing (married to Elmien, née Burgers) pooled resources to re-establish the successful clothing business of the pre-Wesco/FVB deal. Although unofficially, Ty owned 51% of the new business and the rest of the family 49%. The business had no start-up capital, but again relied on the very good relations Ty had with suppliers to obtain stock on credit. The revived Burgers enterprise was then truly a family business in terms of ownership. The clothing wholesale business was resumed, with renewed emphasis on quality men’s and women’s clothing. The business did not diversify, but expanded

\textsuperscript{71} Braby South African Commercial Directory, 1972, p. 30J; 1974, p. 20J.
\textsuperscript{72} Interview, G Verhoef/F Burgers, 17 January 2009.
operations in the former departments of formal men’s clothing, men’s casual wear, school uniforms and ladies’ wear. The school uniform department was maintained. Kotie Wolbers, who started the women’s section in 1963, returned to the same position. She was assisted by a former employee from the Pretoria branch Tokkie van Niekerk.75 The new Burgers could immediately fall back on the ethnic social network that supported the business as employees as well as customers. Loyal customers soon flocked back to their beloved Burgers Broers.

The decision on the resumption of business was taken quite quickly and spontaneously, but the new enterprise had a much stronger body of expertise and experience than in 1962. Shortly before the Wesco deal Ty convinced his brother-in-law Bobby Kotze, employed in Cape Town as an industrial chemist, to join the business in Johannesburg to assist on the financial side of the business.76 All the brothers had worked in the Burgers suit business after the take-over by Wesco and FVB in 1970. They thus maintained an active presence within the industry. When the four brothers were asked to leave the business shortly after the resignation of Ty,77 Bobby Kotze remained an employee. He resigned his position just in time to become a partner to the new Burgers Broers. The immense knowledge and experience of Ty was still lurking in the background, since the brotherhood of the Burgers brothers and sisters closed in a network of support and encouragement. A truly family business arose from the shattered visions of a massive Afrikaner clothing conglomerate with Wesco Beleggings and FVB. Managerial functions were nevertheless not more evenly distributed this time around: Ty remained the dominant businessman, dictating business strategy. The family enterprise returned to its core business: the strong brand of quality clothing at discount prices for the whole family. The new business roped the majority of its former staff complement back into its business.

Burgers Broers was a small enterprise compared to Wesco Beleggings and FVB, but it had a competitive advantage in its niche – personal attention in the trading of quality clothing merchandise to a loyal Afrikaner and urban middle-class customer. As these categories of Afrikaners became more established in the urban environment, their taste developed for quality and perhaps more expensive clothing. Burgers monitored this development carefully and

---

75 Interview, G Verhoef/B Kotze, 19 May 2009.
76 Interview, G Verhoef/B Kotze, 19 May 2009.
77 Interview, G Verhoef/F Burgers, 17 February 2009.
supplied the merchandise and service accordingly. The fashion industry was nevertheless a closely knit business environment. Ty had developed a keen sensitivity to quality and demanded observation thereof in the purchasing policy of the business. He also had very good relationships with the clothing factories. These attributes were what Veka had aimed to acquire. Fouché also developed into an expert of stylish suits and other men’s wear fabrics. He had learnt from his mentor, BJ Shubb, a Jew and owner of the well-known Rex Trueform men’s clothing manufacturer in Cape Town. Fouché travelled to the Rex Trueform factory in Salt River, Cape Town, to gain experience in the assessment and treatment of fabric suitable for formal men’s clothing. The one fundamental principle he was taught was: use only the best quality fabric to ensure a quality garment, and sell at the best possible price. This clothing principle became second nature to Fouché, who was in charge of the men’s suits department in the new business.

The Burgers Broers business developed rapidly into a strong fashion wholesaler. This meant that Burgers Broers sold a wide range of quality clothing at prices comparable to wholesale prices – that is, lower than the price levels maintained in specialist boutique clothing enterprises. It was as if the business had simply taken off from where it had been before the Wesco takeover. Ty insisted on quality and style and Fouché had acquired the expertise and contacts to stock the business with superior quality suits and men’s formal clothing. The business purchased good quality fabric and then contracted Durban Clothing and M. Burtish & Company (which was the manufacturer of House of Monatic suits) as well as IL Back in Cape Town, to perform the cut, make and trim (CMT) operations according to order. Burgers Broers did not advertise the brand names of the exclusive suits they stocked, since they had an agreement with the suppliers to sell at discount prices as a wholesaler. The CMT factories also made up suits specifically for the Burgers Broers business, under the name Prudurex suits. (This brand name was chosen because it reflected ‘style’ and quality.) That was the Burgers Broers house brand. The Burgers men’s clothing wholesaler became the preferred outlet in Johannesburg of well-known men’s suits, such as Primarius suits, Dugson suits (the brand name that overtook Pierre Cardin in South Africa) as well as Rex Trueform suits. Ty’s strong appetite for style and quality resulted in brand names such as Dax of London, Berelovich suits, RT Lanvin clothing as well as the exclusively manufactured Peter Brown suits from the factory in

---

Durban (which could not be purchased except through private connections to the owner, Peter Brown) finding their way into the Burgers store. The Burgers name was so reliable that terms of thirty days were negotiated with the suppliers. This was how those exclusive and expensive suits found their way into the Burgers wholesaling enterprise and finally into the homes of their customers. The success of the new Burgers Broers could be measured by the steadily growing customer base – people such as the former president of the country, PW Botha, were regular customers of the business.79

The business diversified operations from 1971. The women’s section brought in more fashionable ladies’ wear, such as Delswa and Miss Cassidy, the exclusive brand of the wife of Barbara Shubb, Fouché’s mentor BJ Shubb in Cape Town. Later in the 1980s two of Ty’s daughters, Jennifer and Denise, worked in the women’s section. Jennifer did much to improve the style and fashion in the women’s section and catered more for women of somewhat fuller figures!80

The schoolwear department, under the management of Hennie Burgers, was expanded. He developed Burgers Broers as the supplier of choice of school uniforms to all the Afrikaans-medium schools in Johannesburg. The brothers visited the schools to advertise the services the business could render to the schools. After 1971 Ray Downing was instrumental in marketing their schoolwear business to English-medium schools in Johannesburg. Burgers Broers is presently the clothing wholesaler supplying the most comprehensive range of schoolwear to the school community in Johannesburg. By the 1980s Burgers Broers was the sole agent to 174 schools in Johannesburg and the extended East and West Rand schools.81 Soon the school section led to the development of a sports wear department. Pietie Burgers played rugby for the Transvaal provincial team and gradually introduced rugby clothing for the Transvaal Rugby Union at the sport store, Ellis Park Sport. Burgers diversified into the supply of sports gear to the rugby shop as well as other sports clothing. Burgers later took control of the shop and used that to develop a casual sports clothing department in their Fordsburg store. Burgers became the exclusive supplier of official clothing to all the national sporting codes in South Africa. All official Springboks and after 1994 other national sporting identities such as the Proteas (official South African cricket team), purchased their official

79 Interview, G Verhoef/J Cernades, 12 February 2009.
80 Interview, G Verhoef/J Cernades, 12 February 2009.
blazers from Burgers Broers. The same applied to the regional and provincial schools and amateur sporting teams. Burgers acquired this prestigious contract and currently still holds it.\textsuperscript{82}

Burgers Broers became a household name in Johannesburg and across most of the Transvaal (currently Gauteng, and parts of the North West Province). Branches were opened in Pretoria, Benoni (East Rand) and Klerksdorp (Western Transvaal, now North West Province).\textsuperscript{83} Serving their own business ambition also benefitted the community: Burgers employed people from the Afrikaans community. It was a matter of principle to Ty that he would employ ‘his own people’, under-privileged Afrikaans people, to whom that employment meant the difference between starvation and making ends meet. It was only in the 1980s that Coloured people, who could also speak Afrikaans, were employed in the business. Immense loyalty between employer and employees was nurtured, which resulted in the decision by the majority of the staff to transfer their employment back to Burgers Broers after the termination of Ty and the other brothers’ relationship with Wesco and FVB. The shop was also situated adjacent to the residential areas of the poorer Afrikaans communities – Fordsburg, Vrededorp, Mayfair, Brixton and Langlaagte. Since the shop was easily accessible from the Johannesburg central business area, middle-class customers had no difficulty in accessing the premises. In Langlaagte there is the orphanage of the Dutch Reformed Church, established in 1902 after the South African War to care for children orphaned by the war. Burgers Broers made daily deliveries of food and clothing to the orphanage. At the end of the year Burgers supplied suits and evening wear to the matriculants in the orphanage for their matric farewell dance. Ty personally took his daughters to visit the orphanage to show them how privileged they were. In 1985 a school bus drove into a local dam, the Westdene Dam, while on its way to drop the children off at their homes. Many children drowned and the tragedy touched the hearts of the Burgers family. Burgers Broers clothed almost the entire bereaved community for the funerals.\textsuperscript{84} The Burgers Broers family business maintained a strong sense of community engagement.

\textsuperscript{82} Interview, G Verhoef/F Burgers, 17 February 2009; Interview, G Verhoef/P Burgers, 24 April 2009.
\textsuperscript{83} Interview, G Verhoef/P Burgers, 24 April 2009.
\textsuperscript{84} Interview, G Verhoef/J Cernades, 12 February 2009.
Management

The “Burgers Suit and Clothing Manufacturer Pty. Ltd.” was the product of the entrepreneurial ambition and tireless energy of Ty Burgers. He had the vision and the drive and he finally negotiated the establishment of the business, relying on the social capital networks of the Jewish business community and the Afrikaans customer base. He managed the business as a ‘personal enterprise’ – that is, he managed the business as an owner-run company, allowing limited input from either his partners or his brothers. Throughout the history of the enterprise, he was a dominant owner/manager. He trusted nobody and managed the business close to his chest. He appointed auditors, but insisted on manual bookkeeping until his death. The brothers joined the business as employees. The capital strategy of the business was controlled solely by the founder. Establishment capital was obtained from his wife’s inheritance. By 1970, when the take-over was performed by Wesco Beleggings and FVB, none of the brothers owned shares in the business. When Ty decided to part ways with the new owners, his brothers were also asked to leave – their status was mere employees. Since Ty was the only one with capital (from the take-over deal), he provided the start-up capital for the new Burgers Broers business in 1971. He was again the majority shareholder, with the remaining 49% distributed almost equally among the four brothers and the brothers-in-law. As controlling shareholder, he dictated business decisions and management policy.

The positive impact of education on entrepreneurship is widely acknowledged. Ty did not complete school. None of the Burgers brothers had post-school qualifications and therefore relied on their business instinct and practical experience. The lack of education impaired management’s ability to evaluate business opportunities (the Wesco transaction was not successful) and introduce modern technology in the business. Ty had a very strong personal relationship with both customers and suppliers. It was his personal friendship with Albert Wessels, with whom he played golf, that paved the way for the transaction in 1970. The deal benefitted Ty financially, since he sold part of his shares to Wesco and subsequently bought Arendson’s share when the latter decided not to follow the transaction. Ty was therefore the only one of the brothers who owned capital to restart the enterprise when he decided to

86 Interview, G Verhoef/J Cernades, 12 February 2009; Interview, G Verhoef/P Burgers, 24 April 2009.
terminate his relationship with Wesco and FVB.

His authoritarian management style instilled a sense of frugality in his brothers – he did not allow business lunches! If they wanted to accept an invitation to such a lunch, they had to leave in secrecy. The brothers were strictly held to office hours. In November 1990 Hennie died, leaving his 10% share of the business to his two sons. In December 1997 Karel died and Ty acquired his shares, leaving him in control of 56% of the business. Finally, when Ty died on 15 August 2000, no succession planning was in place. Ty left his entire estate to a trust in benefit of his wife and children. None of them were involved in the business. The trustees were his children, one of whom lived in England, a son-in-law and his second wife – none of them with an interest in perpetuating the business.88 In effect the trustees, owning 56% of the business, controlled the business. Neither of the remaining brothers, Fouché or Pietie, had any managerial control.

Ty’s management style was entrepreneurial – less determined by planned strategies, but characterised instead by developing emergent strategies. This means that management strategies were developed in the course of the development of the enterprise and not consciously according to some theoretical model. Such entrepreneurial management is usually associated with centralised companies89 – which is a fairly good description of the management style in Burgers Broers. Ty’s death therefore left a vacuum: he had created and developed a business ‘in accordance with his [. . .] capabilities and needs.’90 Valuable ‘intangible resources’ developed in Ty, the founder and majority shareholder in the business. Those resources can be transferred to successors if an explicit succession strategy is in place. If no conscious succession strategy exists, then those significant resources are lost to the enterprise. The management style of Ty Burgers resulted in such a loss of resources to the business when he died unexpectedly.

Since reorganising the business in 1971, turnover of the enterprise rose from R4m in 1970 to R13,2m per annum in 2000.91 Business at Burgers Broers

88 Interview, G Verhoef/J Cernades, 12 February 2009; Interview, G Verhoef/P Burgers, 24 April 2009.
experienced a serious slump after 1994, when political changes in South Africa ended an era of residential and social segregation. Traditional inhabitants of the Fordsburg and surrounding areas were increasingly people of different ethnic affinity and no longer represented by a white middle-class community. The demographic transformation caused a gradual and steadily weakening business environment, which demanded a strategic decision. The weakening business prospects were exacerbated by the sudden death of Ty. The business soon faced the possibility of closure.

In 2004 Ray Downing also passed away, which left only two brothers still active in the business – Fouché and Pietie – as well as their brother-in-law, Bobby Kotze. The working relationship with the trust was strained and Pietie and Fouché then brokered a deal with the trust: after a fair-and-reasonable evaluation of the business was made, the two brothers offered an instalment buy-out of the trust. The offer was accepted, but the persistently weakening performance of the business threatened to derail the salvation strategy for the remaining brothers. Business in Fordsburg declined rapidly and annual turnover growth declined steadily. Fordsburg was no longer a viable business area for a clothing store targeting the middle- to upper-class customer. Safety and security concerns were discouraging women from travelling to purchase school clothing in Fordsburg, and men preferred shopping in the new upmarket shopping malls. A dual survival strategy was then decided upon: first the shop closed its Fordsburg premises and moved to Northcliff, one of the northern suburbs of Johannesburg. Secondly, a rescue capital strategy was
devised to regain family control of the business. Two private partners joined Pietie as joint shareholders in the business. A new business entity was registered with the Registrar of Companies, no. 2003/001483/07, as “Burgers Broers Groothandelaars Edms Bpk.” (Burgers Brothers Wholesalers Pty Ltd).\(^92\) The new owners bought out the shares of the trust. The rescue agreement provided capital for the buy-out and secured a contractual right to Pietie to obtain the remaining 50% from the private partners within five years, thus restoring Burgers family control.\(^93\)

The youngest of the Burgers brothers restored family control of the business and brought his children back into active participation in the running of the enterprise. Two of the next generation Burgers are currently employed in the business. They worked in the business prior to the death of Ty and the era of trust management. Now Pietie employs both Fouché and Bobby, who have retired, but whose experience is respected and valued by the youngest brother, now controlling the family enterprise. Pietie is acutely aware of the ‘resources’ for the family firm in Fouché and Bobby. Pietie’s management style is inclusive, professional and modern. As managing director, he assigned specific responsibilities to his two children as well as Fouché. He has taken out life cover on his own life to ensure that the business will be secure to the next generation of Burgers should he die. The children are trained in specific fields – one in marketing and the other in managing the casual and sports wear departments.\(^94\) Accounting in the business has only now been computerised and a conscious attempt made to plan succession and secure second-generation control. The partnership deal into which Pietie entered provided the capital to end the impasse of the trust control and security of first right of acquisition by a Burgers family member from non-family shareholding in future.

**Conclusion**

“Succession problems have been described as one of the main factors that tend to weaken family companies.”\(^95\) The history of the Burgers family business illustrates the potential uncertainty that could follow when the management style of the founder is not inclusive and does not entail succession planning. The

---

\(^92\) Interview, G Verhoeof/B Kotze, 19 May 2009, Company records.

\(^93\) Interview, G Verhoeof/P Burgers, 24 April 2009.

\(^94\) Interview, G Verhoeof/P Burgers, 24 April 2009.

Burgers family descends from the relatively prosperous farming community of Graaff Reinet and delivered a President of the South African Republic. The next generation fell victim to the aftermath of the South African War. From a family of nine children, one emerged with ambition and an entrepreneurial spirit and entered the world of business with the assistance of social networks. The Burgers enterprise started as the fruit of Ty Burgers’ entrepreneurial ambitions and abilities. He skilfully utilised social capital networks from different cultures, as well as the strong growth in Afrikaner nationalism, to establish and grow his business. The ethnic dimension of the establishment of the business assisted in strengthening its performance and development. The ‘family’ character in the period when all the brothers and their in-laws were working in the store enhanced its appeal to the customer base. Although it has been acknowledged that all ethnic ties are not necessarily valuable to entrepreneurship,96 the dysfunctional relationship between Wesco Beleggings and Ty Burgers did not end the positive appeal of Burgers Broers to the Afrikaans and working-class communities in Johannesburg. The management style of Ty as entrepreneurial manager instead accounts for the collapse of the deal.

The business succeeded in sustaining its position amidst strong competition from other clothing wholesalers and retailers in Johannesburg by exploiting the ethnic appeal of Afrikaner nationalism, although not exclusively. The sustained focus on the core business – that is, the supply of quality clothing to initially men and later the entire family as well as the amateur and professional sports communities – contributed to the survival of the business. Another contributing factor was the appeal of the business to both middle class as well as poorer working-class people, also Afrikaners, in Johannesburg. The deterministic class analysis O’Meara employs in attempting to explain the behaviour of sections of Afrikaners in business in terms of material and structuralist determinism97 is of no value in understanding the development of Burgers Broers. The business was not a product of “class”, but the fruit of an entrepreneurial spirit integrating strategies for survival with ideals of cultural upliftment and the development of social networks across ethnic and language boundaries. This study has documented the emergence of a successful enterprise, started by an Afrikaans-speaking young man, with the assistance of

several Jewish businessmen, but a business perceived to be an example of a successful ‘Afrikaans’ enterprise. This enterprise nevertheless served customers across class, cultural and language divisions. The impressive performance of the enterprise made it a take-over target for Wesco and FVB.

A complex of factors almost resulted in the closure of the business: weakening economic conditions, concentration on primarily a white customer market segment (which required adjustment after the political changes in South Africa in 1994), and a complete lack of consultation between Ty and his brothers regarding management and succession. The involvement of the next generation of Burgers in the management in the firm has only just commenced. Second-generation family businesses are typically the most fragile, but successful transition to the third generation usually bodes well for the enterprise.

Hanlie dos Santos

University of Johannesburg

Johannesburg

Introduction

Entrepreneurship as an ‘enlightenment’ concept became an inseparable part of the developments of the agricultural and industrial revolution in the eighteenth century. It created space for free-thinking individualism and fashioned an environment fertile for the development and rapid increase of entrepreneurship. Over time it has evolved to produce contemporary
multifaceted entrepreneurs.¹ There are a multitude of current definitions attempting to pinpoint entrepreneurship, but Walter Kuemmerle provides a comprehensive version, describing it as “opportunity-driven behaviour cognizant of the resources required to pursue the opportunity. The kernel of entrepreneurship is to identify a potential opportunity, match the opportunity and resources optimally, and keep adjusting that match as the opportunity materializes.”²

Fogel, Hawk and Morck explained that entrepreneurs need not be creators of products but often reinvent an existing product to be more economic or useful. At the centre of the entrepreneurial action lies the multifaceted nature of the entrepreneur. High on the list of traits is cautious risk-taking, accompanied by insight and the ability to forecast potential ventures. Other characteristics encompass the ability to raise funds and stay abreast of new technology, business practices and skills. Conversely, the authors show that entrepreneurial skills will be ineffective in the absence of a responsive political and economic climate, which can play a most important role in the creation and encouragement of an entrepreneurial environment.³

The difficulty experienced in pinning down personality traits is shared by topics on cultural development and its cognitive relation to entrepreneurialism. Some insight into the topic is proffered by Andrew Godley’s research on the upward movement of the Jewish immigrants who settled in Britain and America towards the end of the late nineteenth century. Godley’s study brings into view two notions of cultural influences on entrepreneurship. The first indicates that the culture within a society can stimulate entrepreneurship and prosperity. The economic performance of the New York entrepreneurs was remarkably higher than those in Britain. The Jewish immigrants in Britain adopted the sentimental attitude of the British workers to their craft culture, which impeded their performance. Conversely, the Jewish immigrants in New York assimilated the national culture, which promoted individualism, entrepreneurship and investment in machinery.

---

³ K Fogel & A Hawk & R Morck, “Institutional obstacles to entrepreneurship”, M Casson, B Yeung, A Basu, N Wadeson et.al, The Oxford handbook…, pp. 540-543, 557. Beneficial to such an environment would be regulations such as property rights, sound education and cultural freedom. Detrimental to entrepreneurship are societies that reject status earned by significant personal achievements, such as a dictatorial society.
Godley’s second notion remained somewhat vague but his findings made some progress towards the assumption that a nation’s intrinsic nature can stimulate entrepreneurship and economic development. He found that by 1905 over a third of Jewish immigrants in New York had become entrepreneurs. Another supportive argument was that in comparison to other individuals Jewish immigrants in both Britain and America were exceptionally “upwardly mobile” and their entrepreneurship enabled them to emerge from extreme poverty to middle-class status over a fifty-year period. Drawing on research conducted in the field of psychology, a recent study by Nigel Wadeson concludes that there appears to be a substantial relation between culture and entrepreneurial cognition, but that the matter requires thorough interdisciplinary investigation.

A large portion of entrepreneurial businesses develop into family businesses. David Pistrui et al. describe family businesses as “the engine that drives socio-economic development and wealth creation around the world, and entrepreneurship is a key driver of family businesses.” The scope of the family involvement can extend far beyond the boundaries of relatives to religious or business associates in the community, ensuring a source of skills, labour and finance. The objectives of a family firm are to bring about business security, trust and prosperity, and, once established, diversification often underpins security. In an unstable environment, the functioning of the family business within community culture is of mutual advantage, offering protection of business and family for the family business entrepreneur.

Irrespective of the country in which it took place, the introduction of ready-made clothing provided the opportunity for a vast number of entrepreneurs to expand their practices into successful family businesses. A good example of this is Jaff and Company, first established in 1931 on the Witwatersrand, which developed into a family business during prosperous times for the clothing

---

industry of South Africa. Three aspects are addressed in the article. The first aspect offers a background to the environment, for the period 1930 to 1960, when Jaff and Company was established and started to grow rapidly. Focus is placed on the economic and political climate as well as the development of ladies’ fashion production. The second aspect reflects on the company’s development over the period 1931 to 1980 and specifically on the company’s expansion, its capital growth as well as product range and supply market. The third aspect is a reflection on Jaff and Company as a family business and then on Sam Jaff the entrepreneur as well as the business community leader.

The research for this article includes a range of secondary sources, newspaper and journal articles, and primary sources in the National Archives, the Garment Workers’ Union Records and the Dulcie Hartwell Collection housed at the William Cullen Library at the University of the Witwatersrand. Interviews were conducted with Stephen Jaff, son of Sam Jaff and CEO of the company, as well as with Albert Foster, retired factory manager, and Annie Wolkin, retired patternmaker and designer. In 1981 Jaff and Company celebrated its 50th birthday and the trade journal, The Buyer, published a supplement with a short history on the company.\footnote{8 Supplement to The Buyer, August 1981.} Then in 1986 Mendel Kaplan published his book \textit{Jewish Roots in the South African Economy}, in which he investigated the contribution of the Jewish pioneers to the industrial development of South Africa from 1897.\footnote{9 M Kaplan, \textit{Jewish roots in the South African economy} (Cape Town, C Struik Publishers), 1986.} Both these sources were useful for information on Jaff and Company’s early development.

\textbf{Contextual background}

\textit{Economic and political environment, 1930 to 1960}

Before the First World War, the development of the secondary sector in South Africa was slow. Since skilled craftsmen and technical expertise were scarce, labour-intensive methods were used, and this raised the labour costs of manufacturing. Furthermore, the unrestricted openness of the economy made it easy to import a variety of goods. However, during the First World War, a shortage of imports resulted in the stimulation of local industries.\footnote{10 S Jones & A Müller, \textit{The South African economy, 1910-90} (London, Macmillan), 1995, pp. 13, 65, 68-69.} During the war factory workers’ skills developed and manufacturing establishments multiplied and expanded rapidly. The greatest development took place on
the Witwatersrand and especially in Johannesburg. The development was
stimulated by the prosperous gold mining industry, with resultant higher
wages and consumer spending, which attracted entrepreneurs.

Faced with increasing poverty amongst White citizens and labour unrest
which peaked with the Rand Rebellion (1922), ways had to be found to
expand and support manufacturing industries. The benefits of increased
import tariffs were realised but tariffs were retained at a general 15 percent.
Subsequently, from 1924 the newly formed Pact government introduced
measures to accelerate the tempo of industrialisation. The main purpose was
to provide employment for the estimated 300,000 ‘poor Whites’, as well as to
ensure long-term employment prospects for the rapidly growing population.
The Board of Trade and Industry (BTI) found that White women in
particular would benefit from industrialisation since it could provide ample
‘civilised’ work opportunities in an acceptable working environment. The BTI
established that specific industries could expand under increased protection,
as would customs revenue, which constituted the state’s principal source of
income. Therefore the general rate was increased to 20 percent but hardly ever
exceeded 25 percent. In the case of clothing, the general 10 percent duty on
men’s outerwear was raised to 20 percent. On ladies’ dresses the existing 15
percent remained unchanged but a specific duty was added.

The Witwatersrand did not experience the effects of the Great Depression,
from 1929 to 1932, to the same extent as the rest of the country. This was due
to more secure and rapidly increasing consumer spending, mainly due to the
stability of gold mining and the building of the Iscor steel plant. In general,
the country experienced a relative decline in imports as well as in exports,
and during this period it was realised that there was a need to develop export
markets to African countries to the north of South Africa. The abolition of
the gold standard in 1933, the devaluation of the South African pound and

Reported on Sir Meiring Beck (Minister of Post and Telegraphs) address to the opening Congress of the S.A.
Federated Chamber of the Industries held in Johannesburg, 1918.
13 S Jones & A Müller, The South African..., pp. 70.
15 University of Johannesburg (UJ): Report of the Committee of Inquiry into the Textile and Clothing Industries:
16 HP Pollak, “Women in Witwatersrand industries: An economic and social study” (MA, UW), 1932, pp. 10-12,
17 HP Pollak, “Women in Witwatersrand industries: An economic and social study” (MA, UW), 1932, pp. 16-
18.
an increase in the gold price created a boom for the gold mining industry and the economy in general.\textsuperscript{18}

Labour was scarce at the clothing industry’s inception and consisted mainly of male immigrants from Britain as well as Jews from Eastern Europe.\textsuperscript{19} However, by the 1930s, owing to economic problems in the rural areas, vast numbers of poor White Afrikaner women had flocked to the Witwatersrand in search of employment, and they became the principal workforce of the industry. In 1932, they accounted for 93 percent of the female industrial workforce on the Witwatersrand, and from the mid-1930s the rapid industrial development sparked an inflow of non-European workers from subsistence farming into the industrial sector.\textsuperscript{20}

The situation changed during the Second World War, when the clothing industry experienced an exodus of White machinists to better-paying jobs in other sectors. Consequently, competition for trained labour became a major dilemma on the Witwatersrand, particularly after the war. Even though there was a closed shop agreement, it was very difficult for manufacturers to avoid enticing labour away from each other. Another contributing factor to the shortage of labour was that it was particularly easy to become a clothing manufacturer and as a result many small factories sprang up. In addition, legislation such as job reservation made it difficult to increase the number of non-European workers and it was to take many years before the different racial groups could be placed in the same workroom.\textsuperscript{21}

The war forced South Africa to become more dependent on its own resources. The driving force of the economy was import replacement, which resulted in manufacturing output growing at an average annual rate of 5.1 percent from 1936/37 to 1946/47. Import control and the needs of the Allied powers stimulated economic growth and sparked rapid development specifically in the clothing and explosives industries.\textsuperscript{22} During the war the Industrial and Agricultural Requirements Commission recommended support to industries

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{enumerate}
\item M Kaplan, \textit{Jewish roots…}, pp. 274, 283.
\end{enumerate}
\end{footnotesize}
that manufactured products from South African raw materials. Precedence was given to those industries that could contribute to import replacement, as well as those that could become exporters of manufactured goods. The textile industry was identified as an industry with such potential.23

Unfortunately, the only fabrics produced before the Second World War were blankets, unbleached sheeting and canvas.24 The spinning and weaving of piece goods suitable for clothing began only during 1946.25 Despite the disadvantage to the clothing industry, which at that stage required substantial quantities of imported fabric, the BTI proceeded to implement import control on textiles in 1948.26 Technical difficulties and the restricted market experienced by the infant textile industry limited its ability to produce the quantity and variety of textiles required by the clothing manufacturers, forcing them to import fabric at very high tariffs.27 The textile industry was just not ready to cope with the country’s requirements and the import control on some of the fabrics required by the clothing industry had to be relaxed during early 1950.28 From 1952 protection was continuously raised and widened in accordance with the growth and increase in variety of the textile industry. By the 1960s, textile duties ranged from 20 to 30 percent and on calicos and drills approximately 37 percent.29

As regards the local requirements for cotton fabric during 1950, 15 percent was South African-made. By 1952, the local textile production had the capacity to produce close to 60 percent of the required drill, twill and sateen and 40 percent of calico (plain weave). However, the use of local fabrics had only increased to 20 percent since the variety had not increased and the qualities available were coarse and most were not suitable for clothing.30 Of the local requirements of woven cotton and man-made fabric, the use of local textiles

---

had increased to 36 percent by 1958/59 and to some 47 percent by 1961.\footnote{UJ, Syfret’s Trust Co. Ltd.: South African Textiles, Clothing and Related Industries, pp. 48-49; JPL: Board of Trade and Industries: Review of the Local Textile Industry and Revision of the Related Duty Structure, Report No. 1294, September 1969, p. 18; Interview, S Jaff (CEO, Jaff & Co, Johannesburg Head Office)/H dos Santos (Researcher, UJ, Department of Fashion Design), 4 October 2006. In the 1980s, 80 percent of fabric requirements were met by the local textile industry. Presently, the situation has reversed itself, and 90 percent of Jaff and Company’s fabrics are imported.}

The development of ladies’ fashion production, 1930–1960

Like the development of the clothing industry in New York and London, it was Eastern European Jews or their descendants who became the entrepreneurs in the clothing trades of the Witwatersrand. Access to the clothing industry was relatively simple and little start-up capital was required. Kaplan explains that the popular phrase of the time was that, ‘all you needed were a few sewing machines’.\footnote{A Godley, Jewish immigrant entrepreneurship…., pp. 95-96; M Kaplan, Jewish roots…., pp. 227-228.} Many of these immigrants were tailors in “the old country” and came with tailoring experience, but many “greenhorn” tailors, sensing possible prosperity, were also drawn to these trades. Waldinger argues that the reason why the clothing trades became predominantly Jewish trades in Britain and America seems to lie in their entrepreneurial nature, essential for survival when entering foreign countries. Their well-rooted cultural background encouraged characteristics such as, “discipline, hard work and risk taking” and the clothing trades also lent themselves to the establishment of small businesses.\footnote{RD Waldinger, Through the eye of the needle: Immigrants and enterprise in New York’s garment trades (New York, New York City Press), 1986, pp. 3-7, 51.}

Internationally, ready-made men’s clothing production developed much earlier than ladies’ clothing. The local production of ready-made men’s clothing almost completely replaced imported garments by 1934, although the bulk of quality garments were still imported.\footnote{University of the Witwatersrand (UW), William Cullen Library (WCL), Dulcie Hartwell Collection (DHC): Reference DHC: AD1454: Wage Board Report: The Clothing Industry, 1 May 1956, pp. 12, 60.} Large-scale production of ladies’ fashion garments commenced in America and Britain before the First World War. Further stimulation came in 1926 with the development of rayon, a low-cost fabric which was regarded as ‘artificial silk’. America was at the forefront of the development and the world followed suit. The more cost-effective fabric, simpler styling and improved production techniques made fashionable dresses affordable for all and contributed to the spread of mass production.\footnote{E Ewing, History of twentieth century fashion (London, BT Batsford Ltd), 1986, pp. 49-51, 88, 119.}
The local production of ladies’ fashion was held back firstly by the low level of protection against the importation of end-of-season clothing. Secondly, the difference between the South African and the northern hemisphere seasons created opportunities for the latter to dump garments that were not sold during their season. The importer’s profit on these end-of-season leftovers and jobbing-off lots was also much higher than the profits made by local manufacturers.

The mass production of ladies’ fashion started in 1929 on the Witwatersrand, with the small-scale production of coats by the factory Jardine des Modes. Previously, dressmaking on the Witwatersrand was performed by several hundred females. Annie Wolkin recalls that these women were of different nationalities and not simply poor White Afrikaner women. She was trained by another Jewish dressmaker in 1934 and she remembered that many Portuguese women also earned a living this way. By 1934, mass production of ladies outerwear was still insignificant and comprised only 13 percent of the country’s requirements. The local production of such clothing became significant only during the period of the Second World War and from 1934 to 1946 had increased from 13 percent to 51 percent. At that stage, Jaff and Company was the principal producer of ladies’ dresses and remained so for many years.

By the end of the war, Johannesburg had become the fashion centre of South Africa since most of the ladies’ clothing producers and fashion outlets were located on the Witwatersrand. During the war the clothing outlets became dependent on the local clothing industry, much to the benefit of

---

37 National Archiving (NA), Pretoria, Raad van Handel en Nywerheid (RHN) Reference 1615 600/303: Memorandum to the Board of Trade and Industries from the Clothing Industry of the Union of South Africa: for Purposes of the Investigation of the Industry by the Board, 9 August 1945, pp. 34-38. To make matters worse, these garments were available at the beginning of the South African season and therefore had an immediate effect on newly released locally produced items. In 1945 it was estimated that these items accounted for roughly 80 percent of ladies’ imported outerwear and consequently, only approximately 20 percent of imports were at monetary values that could be deemed as fair competition to the local industry.
38 M Kaplan, Jewish roots..., p. 252.
40 Interview, A Wolkin (Retired Patternmaker and Designer, worked for Jaff and Company for 35 years)/H dos Santos (Researcher, UJ, Department of Fashion Design), 14 June 2006.
41 NA/RHN, Reference 1615 600/303, “Memorandum to the Board of Trade and Industries from the clothing industry of the Union of South Africa: For purposes of the investigation of the industry by the board, 9 August 1945, p. 1.
ladies’ fashion production on the Witwatersrand. Retailers came to realize that imported clothing also had its problems: as most was bought as end-of-season lots, colours, sizes and quality could not be guaranteed or returned. Local manufacturers, on the other hand, could guarantee their quality, styles and sizes. Clothing producers and the fashion chain stores, as well as the larger independent speciality shops, started to work closely together by meeting prior to a season to discuss fabric, colours and styling. The increased import duties on imported ladies clothing secured a market for the local manufacturers. In addition, most retailers and manufacturers were Jewish, and the Jewish community generally formed close business relationships and supported each other.43 The rapid development of the industry resulted in the significant reduction of general clothing imports by 1955, to less than seven percent that year.44

It was estimated that by 1956 the clothing industry was the fourth-largest manufacturing industry in South Africa after the iron and steel, metal products and building construction industries. At that stage, the clothing industry employed 45,279 workers and contributed £22,562,000 to the total production of £430,086,000 by the secondary industry.45 Unfortunately, towards the end of the 1950s, the levelling-off of the clothing industry was already noticeable when the total number of factories declined from 598 to 563 during the period 1953/54 to 1958/1959.46

Development of Jaff and Company

Company expansion

Sam Jaff established Jaff and Company with one assistant on July 1, 1931, at 154 Market Street (corner of Von Wielligh Street) in Johannesburg. The company expanded rapidly and six months later the factory moved a few blocks down Von Wielligh Street to new premises at 104 President Street. This was a new building which had been built by Sam Jaff’s father-in-law, Nathan Katzenellenbogen, which Jaff and Company ultimately purchased.47

43 Interview, S Jaff/H dos Santos, 4 October 2006. E-mail: S Jaff/H dos Santos, 30 November 2007.
47 Interview, S Jaff /H dos Santos, 4 October 2006; E-mail: S Jaff/H dos Santos, 30 November 2007; News Check,
Initially, the entire company fitted into the top floor of the building, which comprised an area of about 15 by 30 metres, but later expanded to the whole building. The building became a familiar landmark in Johannesburg because of its unique Mediterranean pink colour.\textsuperscript{48}

The company continued to grow and, mostly due to the labour shortage in Johannesburg as well as legislation such as job reservation, started to investigate the possibility of expanding to decentralised areas.\textsuperscript{49} In 1946 small premises were rented in Kimberley and a few machinists were employed. The cutting of the garments was still done in Johannesburg, sent to Kimberley for assembly and then back to Johannesburg for finishing.\textsuperscript{50} The small factory was successful but an offer to purchase land to build a larger factory was rejected by the Kimberley municipality, on the grounds that Kimberley was a mining town and land was reserved for mining purposes. The company was permitted to continue to operate but the municipality was not interested in developing a clothing manufacturing industry.\textsuperscript{51}

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{jaff-and-company-johannesburg-factory-1930s.jpg}
\caption{Jaff and Company’s Johannesburg factory in the 1930s\textsuperscript{52}}
\end{figure}

\begin{itemize}
\item 25 August 1967.
\item Supplement to \textit{The Buyer}, August 1981.
\item Interviews, (1 & 3), A Foster (Retired Jaff & Co Factory Manager, Umhlanga)/H dos Santos (Researcher, UJ, Department of Fashion Design), 25 October 2006. Statutory job reservation made it difficult to increase the number of non-White workers. One White worker had to be employed for every four non-White workers.
\item Interview, S Jaff/H dos Santos, 4 October 2006; Interview (1), A Foster/H dos Santos, 25 October 2006. Albert Foster, who worked for Jaff and Company from 1947, explained that the factory was in a building that belonged to the Salvation Army. During the week ten machines occupied the floor and on Sundays the machines were pushed aside for the church service.
\item Interview, S Jaff/H dos Santos, 4 October 2006.
\item Delswa Limited Website: \url{http://www.delswa.co.za}.
\end{itemize}
Since the company could not expand in Kimberley, Sam Jaff investigated other areas and made an application to the Kroonstad municipality to buy land to build a factory there, which was accepted. The Kroonstad factory, with a floor area of approximately 30 square meters, was opened during 1947.\(^{53}\) However, about a year later the Kimberley municipality then agreed to sell land to the company and a new factory was built and occupation was taken up in 1950.\(^{54}\)

![Figure 2: Jaff and Company's Kimberley factory](http://www.delswa.co.za)

In the first few years the Kroonstad factory was not successful, mostly due to labour problems and the appointment of ineffectual management.\(^{56}\) The situation started to improve in 1955 when the Johannesburg factory was closed and Albert Foster, who had become Sam Jaff’s technical right-hand at the Johannesburg factory, was appointed as manager of the Kroonstad factory. The problem was a shortage of labour since White women no longer wanted to work as machinists and the only factory work they were prepared to do was supervision. Foster went ahead and trained Black machinists, ignoring the job reservation restrictions. Furthermore, production was then concentrated on

---

\(^{53}\) Interview, S Jaff/H dos Santos, 4 October 2006.

\(^{54}\) Interview, S Jaff/H dos Santos, 4 October 2006; *Femina*, 17 September 1970; Supplement to *Diamond field Advertiser*, 25 August 1964.

\(^{55}\) Delswa Limited Website: [http://www.delswa.co.za](http://www.delswa.co.za).

\(^{56}\) Interview, (2), A Foster/H dos Santos, 26 October 2006. Six managers and seven supervisors were employed over three years and the company had no choice but to employ White women with no appropriate skills, just for the sake of meeting the ratio. Machinists of different races were also not permitted to work on the same bench and the work areas had to be partitioned off. Similarly, separate tea and rest room facilities had to be provided, due to the apartheid policies then in operation.
producing skirts, shorts and slacks, as opposed to the wide variety of items previously produced. At that stage the offices and design, sample and cutting departments all remained in Johannesburg and after the factory was enlarged the cutting was moved to the Kroonstad factory. A few years later, a more modern factory was built opposite the original factory.

By 1964 the Kimberley factory had been enlarged twice and employed approximately 500 workers. But the 1960s developed into a very difficult period for the factory since the company’s early relocation preceded government legislation on industrial decentralisation. Decentralisation benefits were introduced during the 1960s to create employment, principally in the homelands and in decentralised poor areas. The benefits were in the form of tax incentives and cash hand-outs. Kimberley was declared a decentralised area, where factories were compensated according to the number of Coloured employees. Jaff and Company’s factory manager identified the opportunity, opened his own factory and enticed the company’s Coloured workers. The company bounced back by employing and training Black machinists. No sooner had the company managed to recover and new Black workers been trained than the government changed its policy. Decentralisation incentives were then offered for the employment of Black workers. The whole situation repeated itself, with the opposition luring away their newly trained Black workers.

Besides the Kroonstad and Kimberley factories, Jaff and Company ventured into Rhodesia during the 1960s. The decision to build a factory in Salisbury, Rhodesia (now Harare, Zimbabwe), was an outcome of successful exports there, as well as to other sub-Saharan countries. Stephen Jaff explained that the factory was reasonably successful but eventually ran into financial difficulties because of exchange control and other factors. The Zimbabwe Development Corporation purchased a majority share, but this was not successful and

57 Interview, (2), A Foster/H dos Santos, 26 October 2006.
58 Interviews, (1 & 2), A Foster/H dos Santos, 25, 26 October 2006.
60 Interview, S Jaff/H dos Santos, 4 October 2006. Jaff and Company had spent years training these workers but there was very little that could be done about the situation; R Tomlinson, “Industrial decentralisation and the relief of poverty in the homelands”, *The South African Journal of Economics*, 51, 1983, pp. 545-546: During 1955, the Tomlinson Commission’s investigation made the government aware that “Industrial decentralisation is necessary in order to increase the proportion of the Black population which can be resident in the homelands”. This was due to the tempo of the population growth in the homelands. Because White individuals could not invest in the homelands, industrial development was encouraged in the border areas.
61 Interview, S Jaff/H dos Santos, 4 October 2006.
resulted in the closure of the company.62

By the early 1970s, the Kroonstad factory workforce had increased from 36 to 600.63 At that stage the Kimberley factory employed approximately 750 workers, who produced about 2,500 Delswa dresses per day, with an average production of between 12,000 and 14,000 dresses per week.64 Two more factories were built in Kimberley: one manufactured school uniforms for boys and girls under the company’s Markstan label and the other manufactured Delton knitwear.65 The workforce continued to increase, and in 1981 the combined workforce of the Kimberley and Kroonstad factories stood at approximately 2,300.66

**Capital growth**

Stephen Jaff believed that when his father started the business he might have borrowed a little money from his father-in-law, Nathan Katzenellenbogen, and a small amount from the bank.67 Jaff and Company’s first balance sheet already showed a profit. An article that appeared in the *Sunday Star* in 1991 reported that the company initially borrowed an amount of £500. Sam Jaff took a monthly salary of £35, paid wages to 100 employees and with a turnover of £1,100 managed a profit at the end of the first year of £235.68

In 1948, Jaff and Company was listed on the JSE through the newly registered holding company Delswa Limited. In terms of the prospectus, Delswa Limited became registered as a company with a nominal share capital of £300,000 divided into 120,000 5½ percent Cumulative Preference Shares of 20s. each and 720,000 Ordinary Shares of 5s. each. Delswa Limited acquired the entire issued share capital of Jaff and Company (Pty) Limited, as well as Textile Handicrafts Limited, Stenets (Pty) Limited and C.R.S. Manufacturing Company Limited, all of which were engaged in the manufacture and distribution of women’s clothing. The directors were Messrs. S. L. Jaff (Sam), P. Jaff (Peter), A. Immink, F. L. Hornabrook (from England) and H. Phillips. The issue of the Preference and Ordinary Shares to

---

62 *Diamond Fields Advertiser*, 27 September 1956; E-mail: S Jaff/H dos Santos, 30 November 2007.
63 Interviews, (1 & 2), A Foster/H dos Santos, 25, 26 October 2006.
64 *Femina*, 17 September 1970.
66 Supplement to *The Buyer*, August 1981.
67 Interview, S Jaff/H dos Santos, 4 October 2006.
the public was underwritten by the Industrial Development Corporation of South Africa, Limited.\textsuperscript{69} Delswa Limited grew progressively from strength to strength and qualified on a number of occasions as one of the \textit{Sunday Times} - \textit{Business Times} Top 100 Industrial and Commercial Companies listed on the JSE.\textsuperscript{70}

However, in 1962, Delswa's profits dropped drastically to R42,000 from R133,000 in the previous year, due to additional duties levied on imported fabrics and to a lesser degree by slower sales and administrative issues. But the situation was quickly reversed, and profits for 1963 were R131,000.\textsuperscript{71} By 1967, profits had increased to R370,000 – more than double the profits of 1963.\textsuperscript{72} In 1968, Jaff-Delswa Investments Limited (Jade) listed on the JSE, through which the Jaff family had a 50 percent controlling interest in Delswa Limited. Delswa Limited generally maintained a conservative dividend policy in order to retain profits for further expansion, yet in 1984 Delswa Limited also qualified as one of the Top 100 Dividend Growth Companies.\textsuperscript{73} By 1973, profits broke through the half-million mark to R508,000.\textsuperscript{74}

In 1981, the company celebrated its 50\textsuperscript{th} year in business. At that stage Delswa Limited was the holding company for four divisional companies: Jaff and Company Limited (women's fashion); Markstan (Pty) Limited (school dresses); Delton Knitwear (Pty) Limited (women's fashion) and MSG Holdings (Pty) Limited (boyswear).\textsuperscript{75}

\textbf{Product range and supply market}

Whilst promoting his new business in 1931, Sam Jaff produced a small quantity of CMT dresses. After three months he received his first significant order for his own tennis dresses, made in Japanese silk, after which he phased out the CMT work.\textsuperscript{76} The use of silk fabric gave birth to the company's well-known trade mark, Delswa, inspired by the French, \textit{de la soie} (of silk). The Delswa tennis dress was followed by Delswa golf shirts and then dresses made

\begin{footnotes}
\item[69] \textit{Cape Times}, Monday, 23 February 1948.
\item[70] Delswa Limited Website: \texttt{http://www.delswa.co.za}.
\item[71] \textit{Financial Mail}, 13 August 1965.
\item[72] \textit{News Check}, 25 August 1967.
\item[73] Delswa Limited Website: \texttt{http://www.delswa.co.za}.
\item[74] \textit{Financial Mail}, 22 March 1974.
\item[75] E-mail: S Jaff/H dos Santos, 22 October 2008; Supplement to \textit{The Buyer}, August 1981.
\item[76] M Kaplan, \textit{Jewish roots...}, pp. 253, 255. CMT refers to Cut, Make and Trim. The manufacturer is supplied with fabric and pattern and then makes the garment.
\end{footnotes}
in washable fashion fabrics.\textsuperscript{77}

\textbf{Figure 3: Jaff and Company’s tennis dresses in the 1930s}\textsuperscript{78}

For the Christmas season dresses in larger sizes ranging from 40 inch to 48 inch hip measurement were offered.\textsuperscript{79} These larger sizes became an outstanding feature of the Delswa range, as did the half-sizes that were offered in the Poplar range.\textsuperscript{80} By June 1934, dresses were offered in 30 different fabrics. They were promoted as being designed in-house and afforded the customer an absolutely exclusive garment range. By then the company had already had ten selling seasons.\textsuperscript{81} During 1934 the Delswa shirt blouse was created and became a fashion item all South African women desired. It was constantly updated according to fashion changes and remained an essential item in the Delswa range for many decades.\textsuperscript{82} By 1939, Jaff and Company’s registered ladies’ wear trade labels were Delswa, Poplar, Hickory, Carolina and Delton, Calypso.\textsuperscript{83}

Jaff and Company was the largest producer of ladies’ fashion for many years and continued to produce sportswear for ladies, but dresses were by far the most popular garment during the 1950s into the 1960s, followed by skirts

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{77} Jaff & Company’s Private Collection (J & Co): Letter to customers, 28 July 1932.
\item \textsuperscript{78} Jaff and Company’s private collection.
\item \textsuperscript{79} (J & Co): Letter to customers, 18 November 1932.
\item \textsuperscript{80} M Kaplan, \textit{Jewish roots…}, p. 255.
\item \textsuperscript{81} (J & Co): Letter to customers, 21 June 1934.
\item \textsuperscript{82} Interview, (1), A Foster/H dos Santos, 25 October 2006; Delswa Limited Website: \url{http://www.delswa.co.za}.
\item \textsuperscript{83} \textit{The Buyer}, 11 (7), July 1939.
\end{itemize}
and blouses and later slacks when they became fashionable. Labels that followed were Jade, Marchesa and the leisurewear label, Crazy Horse. School uniforms were also produced under the Markstan and Schoolmaid labels and boyswear under the Youngset and Gabstan labels. During the early years Jaff and Company supplied the independent shops and during the 1950s they started supplying the chain stores, which became their largest supply market. These included what were known as the “Big Seven”: Edgars, Jet, Sales House, Foschini, Truworths, Milady’s and possibly Greatermans.

In the 1980s, the tradition of silk fabric was still evidenced in its range of Jade silk dresses. The company also produced under various franchises and for many years paid royalties to Mary Quant for the use of its label. By 1956, reflecting back over the years, the company was satisfied that its aspiration of “fit, quality and value, and that simplicity that is the essence of good fashion” had been maintained. By the 1980s, its ladies’ wear was still considered to represent “simple elegance”.

Figure 4: Fashion in the 1980s by Delswa

---

84 Interview, S Jaff/H dos Santos, 4 October 2006; Supplement to The Buyer, August 1981.
85 Supplement to The Buyer, August 1981.
86 Interview, S Jaff/H dos Santos, 4 October 2006; E-mail: S Jaff/H dos Santos, 30 November 2007.
87 Supplement to The Buyer, August 1981.
88 News Check, 25 August 1967.
89 Supplement to The Buyer, August 1981; Advert for Delswa, SA Merchandising, September 1956; Interview, S Jaff/H dos Santos, 4 October 2006; E-mail: S Jaff/H dos Santos, 30 November 2007.
90 Delswa Limited Website: http://www.delswa.co.za.
**Jaff and Company as family business**

**Family entrepreneurs**

As noted in the introduction to this article, Godley points to the idea that a nation’s intrinsic nature can stimulate entrepreneurship and economic development. Sam Jaff grew up in this culture and was exposed to his father’s and certainly other Jews’ business ventures, which must have stimulated his entrepreneurial thinking and made him aware of the importance of the economic welfare of family, achievable through family business.

Sam Jaff’s father, Herman, immigrated to South Africa from Lithuania during the 1890s. His entrepreneurship in South Africa commenced with the trading in wool and cattle. Then, after the South African War, he raised his own stock on a farm in the Harrismith district until 1926.91 Stephen Jaff, explained that in 1926 his grandfather Herman Jaff started a wholesale company in Johannesburg called Kobe Silk House. The company imported silk fabric and blouses from Hong Kong, using Herman’s brother-in-law in Japan as the Eastern contact. At first, the company did well, but unfortunately during the Great Depression Kobe Silk House ran into difficulties. Sam Jaff, who at that time was at university, was forced to interrupt his studies to assist his father in trying to save the company. When Herman Jaff suddenly died, Sam was left with an insolvent company and limited clothing background.92 Phillip, Sam’s brother, had to leave school and became employed by Elephant Trading, which was one of the prominent Jewish wholesale companies.

Once Jaff and Company was well established, Sam took the first step in the direction of making the company a family enterprise. He appointed Phillip as Sales Manager and then as Director in 1939.93 Over time, managers were employed to handle the accounting and production functions.94 Howorth et al. show that family in businesses can be extended to include outsiders.95 In the case of Jaff and Company a member of the clothing industry community, Joe Pillemer, joined the company in 1961. Stephen Jaff explains that Joe Pillemer joined the company as the Sales Director and made a major contribution by

---

91 M Kaplan, *Jewish roots…*, p. 253. He fought on the Boer side and was imprisoned on the island of Ceylon.
92 Interview, S Jaff/H dos Santos, 4 October 2006; E-mail: S Jaff/ H dos Santos, 30 November 2007; *News Check*, 25 August 1967. A few years later Sam Jaff completed his Bachelor of Economics degree.
94 E-mail: S Jaff/H dos Santos, 22 October 2008.
introducing sophisticated business systems to the company. Commenting on complementary roles, Stephen Jaff believes that his father was an entrepreneur, innovator and a visionary with regard to fashion, and Pillemer was his equal in administrative tasks.96

Succession came from within the family sphere. Sam Jaff remained the CEO until son Stephen succeeded him in 1980. Stephen Jaff had worked at the company during his school and university vacations and on completion of his MBA in America in 1965 he joined Jaff and Company.97 His brother Nicky also completed an MBA and managed the knitwear division until he emigrated. His cousin Peter, Philip Jaff’s son, also joined the company in 1973 as a Chartered Accountant. Peter Jaff became a Director in 1978 and a few years later he became the Financial Director.98 By 1980, Jaff family members still featured prominently on all four Delswa Limited’s divisional companies, which remained family-controlled by at least 60 percent.99

Figure 5: From left to right: Stephen Jaff, Phillip Jaff, Nicky Jaff, Peter Jaff and seated Sam Jaff (Mid-1970s)100

Sam Jaff the entrepreneur

Sam Jaff’s entrepreneurial behaviour fits well within the framework of

---

96 E-mail: S Jaff/H dos Santos, 22 October 2008. Pillemer was co-owner of Jaxly Manufacturers before joining Jaff and Company.
97 Supplement to The Buyer, August 1981: Cape Times, 23 February 1948.
98 Interview, S Jaff/H dos Santos, 4 October 2006; E-mail: S Jaff/ H dos Santos, 22 October 2008.
99 E-mail: S Jaff/H dos Santos, 22 October 2008; Supplement to The Buyer, August 1981.
100 Jaff and Company’s private collection.
Kuemmerle’s definition on entrepreneurship. Jaff identified the production of ladies’ dresses as an entrepreneurial ‘opportunity’ and then matched it with ‘resources’. At that stage the resources at his disposal were silk fabric, left over from his father’s insolvent company, and the abundance of available labour, who at that stage were poor White Afrikaner women. He also continued to ‘match’ resources and opportunities as they occurred. At first he continued to import the cheaper Japanese silks that made it possible to compete with imported garments, and when the local demand for his product increased, he travelled to Italy, France, England, America and Japan to source the latest fabrics. Subsequently, contacts were also established overseas, and these assisted him in keeping up with the latest fashion and textile trends.

Sam Jaff’s entrepreneurial personality traits are evident in his conduct. His persistent marketing techniques motivated customers to secure their orders. He regularly sent out letters to promote his products to established and prospective clients. He identified two markets neglected by importers: larger sizes as well as half-sized ladies’ clothing, which presented the company with an opportunity to establish niche markets. His personality traits also manifested in his intuitive forecasting that labour problems on the Witwatersrand were on the increase. Consequently, as Stephen Jaff explained, he investigated alternative areas in which to set up a clothing factory and discovered that the munitions factory and the mint in Kimberley had closed down, which had resulted in high female unemployment. At first he ‘cautiously’ rented small premises to test the potential venture. When the Kimberley municipality refused to sell land to him, Jaff believed in the potential of the business venture and pursued the possibility of starting a factory in Kroonstad. On his many train journeys via Kroonstad he had envisaged the possibility of employable females living in the latter town, who were the spouses of the very large contingent of railway workers. The decision to relocate production to Kroonstad and Kimberley made him a pioneer of decentralisation in South Africa.

102 Interview, S Jaff/H dos Santos, 4 October 2006.
103 Jaff & Company’s Private Collection (J & Co): Examples of letter to customers, 28 July 1932, 18 November 1932, 21 June 1934. The letter dated July 1932 urged customers to book: “As we are getting heavily booked up with spring orders, we would be glad, should you desire to take up any of the three lines mentioned in this letter, if you would let us have your order as soon as possible.”
104 M Kaplan, Jewish roots…, p. 225.
105 Interview, S Jaff/H dos Santos, 4 October 2006.
Sam Jaff also had to contend with specific technical obstacles, since even by the 1940s the level of South African technical expertise in certain clothing manufacturing processes was not that advanced. Permanent pleating of fabric could only be done by shipping the cut skirts to Scotland. Buttons were also not yet locally produced or dyed. Being the entrepreneur that he was, Sam Jaff initiated the development of pleating equipment and established Buttrim to manufacture buttons as a separate business entity.106

**Sam Jaff the business community leader**

Sam Jaff’s contribution to the South African clothing industry is notable. He served in various positions in numerous organisations related to the clothing industry such as President of the National Co-ordinating Council for the Clothing Industry, Chairman of the Transvaal Clothing Manufacturers’ Association, and Executive Committee Member of the Transvaal Chamber of Industries, and he was the Presidential Nominee of the Executive Committee of the Federated Chamber of Industries.107

Sam Jaff became the Chairman of the Clothing Industry’s Medical Aid Society, since he considered the workers to be “the power-producing factor” of the whole “industrial machine”.108 He was very actively involved with the Industrial Council for the Clothing Industry, and played a role in the setting up of a provident fund for the industry. His close relationship with the Garment Workers’ Union served to improve his relationship with his employees. His staff’s welfare was important to him and the company was one of the first to recognise Black and Coloured shop stewards. He liaised regularly with leaders such as Lucy Mvubelo, even when Black unions were not yet legitimate. His company was often investigated for employing more Black workers than prescribed under job reservation legislation.109

Despite the potential of the local production of ladies’ clothing to provide employment for the growing population, import protection for this sector was inadequate before 1947. During the Second World War Sam Jaff, as spokesman for the industry, convinced the government to utilise the limited shipping capacity to import fabrics and provide employment, rather than use

---

106 Interviews, (1 & 2), A Foster/H dos Santos, 25, 26 October 2006.
109 Interview with Stephen Jaff, 4 October 2006.
it to import finished garments.110 In 1947 the import tariffs on dresses were increased to 25 percent.111

From the 1930s, fashion retail was already well established on the Witwatersrand and by the end of the Second World War ladies’ fashion production was also well established.112 To further stimulate development, Sam Jaff founded the Transvaal Fashion Guild, a body consisting of 24 of the Witwatersrand’s leading manufacturers. He also initiated the Fashion Fortnight, which started during 1947 and was held annually during March and September.113 Fashion Fortnight was an opportunity for customers, especially those from all over the country, to view the manufacturers’ ranges. Prior to this, clothing was generally sold to retail shops by travellers who went out to the customers with the manufacturers’ ranges to secure orders. During Fashion Fortnight, customers came for three to four days to view the ranges of all the manufacturers, rather than travelling back and forth to Johannesburg. Cape Town manufacturers also came and set up a showroom for the two-week event, usually at hotels or at their agents’ offices.114 It was a very successful exercise until the mid-1980s when the chain stores became dominant and began specifying their own requirements. Ranges and the manufacturer’s in-house labels had become much less important.115

Conclusion

Sam Jaff was part of a generation of remarkable family business entrepreneurs, who established the clothing industry in South Africa. His entrepreneurial capabilities very effectively embodied the continuation of the concept of ‘enlightenment’. Although it is difficult to pinpoint the cognitive relationship to entrepreneurialism, Sam Jaff’s insight and ability to recognise potential ventures for the family business probably crown his list of personality traits. Likewise, as regards the development of Jaff and Company in relation to the environment, it is clear that when Sam Jaff encountered and undertook

110 Supplement to *The Buyer*, August 1981.
114 Interview, S Jaff/H dos Santos, 4 October 2006.
115 Interview, S Jaff/H dos Santos, 4 October 2006; M Kaplan, *Jewish roots*…, p. 275; The event lost its importance from the mid-1980 and ended towards the late 1980s.
entrepreneurship, certain elements for success were present. At that point in time, the Witwatersrand offered both a responsive political and economic climate and provided stability and opportunity through its gold mining economic standing. However, the clothing industry faced many difficulties, such as increasing import tariffs on textiles, competition from imports as well as technical and labour problems. To solve labour problems, Sam Jaff instinctively relocated his factory to decentralised areas, and currently Jaff and Company continues to operate its Kimberley factory.

This article offered a background to the establishment and rapid expansion of Jaff and Company. It highlighted the entrepreneurial qualities of the company as a family business and reflected on a period in the history of the clothing industry during the time that it developed from a few sewing machines to almost completely eliminate the importation of garments. Many of the problems presently experienced in the clothing industries are remarkably similar to those discussed in the article. The article may assist in placing current problems in the clothing industry in perspective.
The nature of family businesses and their importance for economic development

Elmarie Venter and Shelley Farrington

South Campus (Port Elizabeth)

Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University

Samevatting

Familieondernemings is die algemeenste vorm van sake-ondernemings ter wêreld, insluitend Suid Afrika. Hul invloed en getalle sal in die nabye toekoms aansienlik toeneem. Alhoewel dit alombekend is en aanvaar word dat kleinsake-ondernemings ‘n belangrike bydrae tot ekonomieë lever, is dit minder bekend dat die meerderheid kleinsake ook familieondernemings is. Gevolglik is daar selfs ‘n neiging in sommige lande om familieondernemings en kleinsake-ondernemings as een generiese begrip saam te flans.

Sedert sy ontstaan voer die studieveld van familieondernemings ‘n stryd om sy grense en aard van uitsonderlikheid presies af te baken. Die hoofdoel van hierdie artikel is om die uitdaging die hoof te bied, deur die verschillende voorgestelde definisies van familieondernemings sedert die vroeë tagtiger jare te ondersoek. Verder sal daar lig gewerf word op die aard van hierdie tipe besighede, hul belangrike bydrae tot nasionale ekonomieë, insluitend die Suid Afrikaanse ekonomie, en die uitdagings waarmee hulle te kampe het.

Hierdie artikel illustreer die problematiek om familieondernemings te definieer. Afgesien van die aantal verschillende definisies wat bestaan, behoort hierdie definisies ook tot ‘n aantal verschillende kategorieë. By gebrek aan ‘n algemeen-aanvaarde definisie van familieondernemings is dit belangrik dat elke navorser ‘n duidelike omskrywing bied van sy keuse van ‘n definitie van ‘n familieonderneming. Met die definisies van Flören (2002), Hulshoff (2001) en Stoy Hayward (1989) as grondslag, kan ‘n familieonderneming in breë terme aan die hand van die volgende kriteria gedefinieer word: ten minste 51% van die besigheid se eienaarsbelang is in besit van ‘n enkele familie; ‘n

---

1 This paper is based upon work financially supported by the National Research Foundation of South Africa.
2 To whom correspondence should be addressed.
Family businesses, and more specifically those of small- and medium-size, form the basis of the South African economy, and it is of cardinal importance that all efforts be made to promote the success and sustainability thereof.

Introduction

The family business is the most common form of business organisation in the world, and its influence, as well as its numbers, can be expected to increase substantially in the near future. Family businesses can therefore offer powerful opportunities for further economic growth in South Africa. Although the field of family business has been regarded as a separate academic discipline since

---


Nature of family businesses

the 1990s, only recently has it been embraced within mainstream business research.

Since its inception, however, the field of family business studies has struggled with a need to define its boundaries and source of distinctiveness. Without clear definitional boundaries, it remains unclear what constitutes a family business, which could pose numerous methodological problems for family business researchers. Although family businesses resist easy definition, almost all researchers agree on the necessity of having a clear definition. Consequently, clarifying a definition for a family business is the first and most obvious challenge facing the family business researcher. Given this important challenge, the main purpose of this paper is to examine the nature of these types of business organisations by looking at how they are defined, how they differ from non-family businesses, and the unique challenges they face. In addition, their importance to national economies, including the South African economy, is highlighted.

The nature of family business

Defining the family business

There is no universally accepted definition of a family business in the literature or among teaching and consulting communities, the public, or even family business owners. Numerous attempts have been made to articulate conceptual and operational definitions of family businesses, and consequently many definitions exist. A review of the literature has, however, revealed that a

---

number of these definitions share several common elements. This has enabled researchers to classify their definitions into different categories. There seems to be general agreement that the categories of ownership and management, family involvement, interdependent subsystems, generational transfer, and multiple conditions are most commonly used in defining a family business. Some definitions are very specific, while others are broad. Many are impossible to quantify and thus difficult to apply to empirical data, whilst others are more specific and consequently usable for data collection. Despite efforts to develop conceptual and operational definitions of family firms, to date, instead of one definition, a range of definitions (see Annexure A for examples) that capture the varying extents and modes of family involvement in these firms is being used.

The discussion above illustrates the difficulties in defining a family business. Apart from the number of different definitions that exist, some categories of definitions are too restrictive or too inclusive, whilst others cannot be applied, or have never been applied, to empirical data. As long as there is no generally accepted family business definition, it is important that each researcher clarifies his/her choice of a family business definition, because the definition chosen influences the interpretation of results. Based in particular on the definitions of a family business offered by Flören, Hulshoff and Stoy Hayward, a family business can be broadly defined by the following criteria: at least 51% of the equity of the business is owned by a single family; a single family is able to exercise considerable influence; and at least two family members are actively involved as senior managers in the business.

nature of family businesses


crown 2004), Ford, Mars and L’Oreal, as well as Henkel, LEGO, C&A, Cargill and Suntory (Japan) are just a few examples. Some of the largest and most powerful South African businesses, all family owned, dominant especially in the second half of the 20th century, include Anglo American and Anglovaal, Rembrandt, Liberty, Altron, Pick & Pay, Pepkor, Liberty Life, Sage Life and Toyota SA.

The great majority of family businesses do, however, appear to be SMEs and it is expected that their influence and numbers will increase significantly in South Africa in the near future.

**Family versus non-family businesses**

After conducting a thorough review of the family-business literature, Wortman concludes that the exact field or domain of family business is unknown and that the boundaries of this study field are unclear. Some clarity on the domain and distinctiveness of the field of family business studies is, however, emerging as progress is made on the development of definitions of family businesses. Numerous efforts aimed at finding the sources of distinctiveness in family firm studies have been directed towards comparative studies of family and non-family firms.

Various studies have, for example, attempted to contrast the differences between family and non-family businesses with regard to:

---


31 E Venter, “The succession process…”, (Ph.D, University of Port Elizabeth, 2003), pp. 32-34.


Nature of family businesses

- Strategic behaviour and relation to the business environment

- Management and ownership imperatives

- Management information systems (planning, control and reward systems)

- Customer services

- Organisational buyer behaviour

- Successor development

- Management of human resources

- Business-related goals

- Sectors

- Venture capital, financing and financial issues

- Attributes of owner-managers and characteristics of CEOs

- Management capabilities

- Competitiveness and performance
• Adapting to a hostile environment.47

Family and non-family businesses differ with regard to certain aspects such as entrepreneurial activities undertaken, performance, and perceptions of environmental opportunities and threats, but they do not differ regarding other aspects such as strategic orientations and sources of debt financing.48 A large body of literature has also identified the unique attributes of family businesses versus businesses with diverse ownership. These include attributes such as trust, altruism and commitments that can, in principle, enhance firm efficiency and performance.49 Over the past 15 years, notable contributions have been made in identifying the different characteristics of family and non-family businesses. These contributions are based on a number of theoretical frameworks. According to agency theory, family firms are different because they demonstrate overlapping owner/manager relationships. In addition, the theory of transaction cost economics assigns cost advantages to family firms as a result of better communication, higher trust, lower monitoring costs and consolidated decision-making. Others attribute the differences between family and non-family firms to the contradictions between family and business systems.50

Research aimed at distinguishing between family and non-family businesses has revealed mixed results in terms of differences between them.51 Methodological concerns have also been expressed in relation to the comparative family versus non-family research.52 According to Jorissen et al.,53 the differences between family and non-family firms found in prior studies could be due to demographic sample differences such as size, age, type of industry and location, instead of “real” differences between groups. Their research provides evidence that family and non-family firms of a certain size, age, and in the same industry, do not differ greatly with regard to strategy, networking, perceptions

of the environment, long-term planning, non-financial control, growth, and management training. Real differences were, however, found in relation to export, formal short-term planning systems, variable reward systems, and CEO characteristics such as age, education, tenure and gender.\(^5\)

Identifying differences between family and non-family businesses constitutes one of the basic fields of family business research. Research has recently made some progress in this regard. However, in some cases, the differences between family and non-family businesses have not been sufficiently explained.\(^5\) Although these comparative studies have enhanced understanding of these firms, no set of distinct variables separating family and non-family firms has yet been identified.\(^5\)

**Importance of family businesses**

Throughout economic history, no institution has driven economic development in the way that family-based enterprises have, and it is generally agreed that this unique form of organisation is the economic motor of all non-communistic economies.\(^5\) It would be difficult to overestimate the critical importance of the success of family businesses to any country.\(^5\) Those who downplay their importance are making an enormous mistake.\(^5\) Even the most conservative estimates put the proportion of all worldwide business enterprises owned or managed by families at between 65% and 90%.\(^5\) However, the importance of family businesses for national and worldwide economies is usually underestimated or not recognised, as are their sheer numbers and their contribution to employment.\(^5\)

---

No statistics exist that are complete enough to map the presence of family-owned businesses throughout the world. Most estimates focus on smaller samples, or are anecdotal rather than based on quantitative research.62 Some even suggest that commonly quoted statistics are the result of “street lore”, not statistical analysis.63 In addition, no lists or databases exist in any country that distinguishes family businesses from non-family businesses.64

Several possible reasons present themselves for the scarcity of general statistics and research on family businesses. Firstly, there is a lack of a universal definition of a family business and, secondly, there are widespread beliefs about family businesses, based mostly on negative prejudices about the way in which such businesses operate.65 In addition, family businesses have not received the recognition they deserve because they are categorised by size (most are SMEs) and are therefore not recognised as characteristically distinct.66 In fact, until recently, few academics, governmental agencies or data-gathering agencies regarded families in business as characteristically distinct entities.67

Furthermore, family businesses themselves, for the most part, irrespective of their size, prefer to keep their anonymity.68 Families have no reason to publicise their involvement with a business, and as a result the outside world does not always recognise these businesses as family-owned. Many family businesses are privately owned and therefore not subject to publishing annual financial reports.69 Family enterprises are notoriously secretive; even well-intentioned researchers who are prepared to guarantee confidentiality, are not welcome. Many family businesses find it difficult to provide such cooperation because of a strong affinity for privacy and an unwillingness to disclose personal information.70 Moreover, families themselves sometimes tend to

64 RH Flören, Crown princes …, p. 70.
69 RH Flören, Crown princes…, p. 69.
70 P Davis, “Realizing the potential of the family business”, Organisational Dynamics, 12(Summer), 1993, p. 56.
keep non-family members at a distance.\footnote{SN Rodriguez, GJ Hildreth & J Mancuso, “The dynamics of families in business: How therapists can help in ways consultants don’t”, Contemporary Family Therapy, 21(4), 1999, p. 466.} This need for privacy at certain levels diminishes the possibility for family businesses to benefit from academic research and specific political decisions that could meet their demands.\footnote{IFERA (International Family Enterprise Research Academy), “Family businesses…”, Family Business Review, XVI(4), 2003, p. 238.}

Despite the fact that studies conducted in the field of family businesses display numerous methodological shortcomings and should therefore be used with caution in making interpretations and comparisons, they nevertheless confirm the weight that family businesses carry in their respective national economies, and substantiate the significance of family businesses worldwide.\footnote{RH Flören, Crown princes …, p. 73; IFERA, “Family businesses…”, Family Business Review, XVI(4), 2003, p. 235.}

Table 1\footnote{Adapted from the following: SM Farrington, “Sibling Partnerships in South African small and medium-sized family businesses”, (Ph.D, Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University, 2009), p. 64; RH Flören, Crown princes …, pp. 71-72; IFERA, “Family businesses…”, Family Business Review, XVI(4), 2003, p. 237; F Soria, “Los principales retos de la empresa familiar en el siglo XXI”, P Jaskiewicz, VM Gonzáles, S Menéndez & D Schiereck, “Long-run IPO performance …”, Family Business Review, XVIII(3), 2005; S Lane, J Astrachan, A Keyt & K McMillan, “Guidelines for family business boards of directors”, Family Business Review, XIX(2), 2006, p. 148.} presents a comparison of the contributions of family businesses in selected countries around the world. Many of the figures in Table 1 are based on quantitative research. In some cases the percentages quoted for a country vary from source to source; in addition, the percentage range is sometimes very broad. Consequently, these comparisons should be interpreted with caution; they are merely an indication of the impact that family businesses could potentially have, all over the world.

From Table 1 it is, however, clearly evident that, in the countries represented, approximately 60-90\% of the businesses can be classified as family businesses. These businesses are responsible for between 40-70\% of the GNP in these countries, and account for approximately 40-65\% of employment.
### Table 1: Importance of family businesses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>% Family business</th>
<th>GNP</th>
<th>Employment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Australasia</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Australia</td>
<td>• 80% of all private and 25% of all public businesses, &gt;75% of companies (Baring 1992);</td>
<td></td>
<td>• 50% (Smyrnious et al. 1997)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• 67% (Smyrnious &amp; Walker 2003)</td>
<td></td>
<td>• 50% (Smyrnious et al. 1997)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• India</td>
<td>• No data available</td>
<td></td>
<td>• 65% (CMIE; National Income Statistics 2000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Indonesia</td>
<td>• No data available</td>
<td></td>
<td>• 75% (CMIE; National Income Statistics 2000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>USA/Canada</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• USA</td>
<td>• 96% (Astrachan &amp; Shanker 1996)</td>
<td></td>
<td>• 40% (Astrachan &amp; Shanker 1996)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• 75-95% (Ward &amp; Aronoff 1990)</td>
<td></td>
<td>• 64% GDP (Shanker &amp; Astrachan 2003)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• 19-92% (Shanker &amp; Astrachan 1996)</td>
<td></td>
<td>• 50% (Scarborough &amp; Zimmerer 2003:18; Longenecker et al. 2006:86)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• 89% (Shanker &amp; Astrachan 2003)</td>
<td></td>
<td>• 60% (Astrachan &amp; Shanker 1996)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• 90% (Scarborough &amp; Zimmerer 2003:18)</td>
<td></td>
<td>• 62% (Shanker &amp; Astrachan 2003)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• 40% (Astrachan &amp; Shanker 1996)</td>
<td></td>
<td>• 60% (Scarborough &amp; Zimmerer 2003:18; Longenecker et al. 2006:86)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Nature of family businesses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Canada</th>
<th>No data available</th>
<th>45% (Deloitte &amp; Touche 1999)</th>
<th>No data available</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>UK and Ireland</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>UK</strong></td>
<td>76% of 8000 largest (Leach 1991)</td>
<td>No data available</td>
<td>&gt;76% in wider business population (Stoy Hayward 1989)</td>
<td>&gt;50% (Poutziouris 2002)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>70% (Poutziouris 2002)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ireland</strong></td>
<td>40-50% (Sunday Business Post, April 9, 1995)</td>
<td>No data available</td>
<td>No data available</td>
<td>40-50% (Sunday Business Post, April 9, 1995)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Latin America</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Brazil</strong></td>
<td>90% (Bernhoeft Consulting Group 2002)</td>
<td>65% (Bernhoeft Consulting Group 2002)</td>
<td>No data available</td>
<td>No data available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>75% (Martinez 1994)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chile</strong></td>
<td>80-98% (Poza 1995)</td>
<td>50-70% (Martinez 1994)</td>
<td>No data available</td>
<td>No data available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Other</strong></td>
<td>65-80% (Gersick et al. 1997)</td>
<td>No data available</td>
<td>No data available</td>
<td>No data available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Europe</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Belgium</strong></td>
<td>70-80% of all SMEs (Donckels and Hoebeke 1992)</td>
<td>55% (Crijns 2001)</td>
<td>70% (Crijns 2001)</td>
<td>55% (Crijns 2001)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Private Ownership</td>
<td>Source Details</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>74% (Flören 1998)</td>
<td>54% (Flören 1998)</td>
<td>43% (Flören 1998)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>&gt;60% (ASMEP/GEEF)</td>
<td>&gt;60% (ASMEP/GEEF)</td>
<td>45% (ASMEP/GEEF)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>60% (Klein 2000)</td>
<td>80% (Reidel 1994)</td>
<td>55% GDP (Klein 2000)</td>
<td>58% pvt. (Klein 2000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>93% (Corbetta 1995)</td>
<td>Almost 80% of firms employing 20-500 persons (Bank of Italy, 1994)</td>
<td>No data available</td>
<td>79% (Corbetta 1995)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>71% of companies with turnover &gt;$2 million (Gallo 1994)</td>
<td>23% of 1000 largest businesses (Gallo 1995)</td>
<td>75% (Gallo, Cappuyns &amp; Estapé 1995)</td>
<td>65% Gallo, Cappuyns &amp; Estapé (1995)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>70% (Reojo 1997)</td>
<td>60% (Reojo 1997)</td>
<td>No data available</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scandinavia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>79% (Emling 2000)</td>
<td>No data available</td>
<td>No data available</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>80% (Veaceslav &amp; Lehtinen 2001)</td>
<td>40-45% (Veaceslav &amp; Lehtinen 2001)</td>
<td>No data available</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Singapore</td>
<td>80-90% (Lee 2006b:175)</td>
<td>No data available</td>
<td>No data available</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
It is a worldwide phenomenon that family businesses account for most of the GNP and employment places; the figures are estimated to vary from 45-70% throughout the non-communistic world.\textsuperscript{75} Indeed, family-controlled businesses are the dominant form of business throughout much of the world and are among the most important, if not the most important, contributors to wealth and employment in virtually every country.\textsuperscript{76}

Family businesses are also the predominant way of doing business in South Africa today comprising about 80\% of South African businesses.\textsuperscript{77} For the past 300 years or more, family businesses have been making a positive contribution towards the South African economy and their influence, as well as their numbers, can be expected to increase substantially in the future.\textsuperscript{78} Reasons for this could include amongst others, the high level of retrenchments in the corporate sector as well as Black Economic Empowerment and employment equity. In addition young people today are demonstrating more enthusiasm for working in their family’s business.\textsuperscript{79} Joint research\textsuperscript{80} between the United States, Britain and South Africa has revealed that successful family businesses

\begin{table}[h]
\centering
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|c|}
\hline
\textbf{Africa} & \textbf{South Africa} & \textbf{Other} \\
\hline
\textbullet South Africa & \textbullet 80\% (Ackerman 2001:325; Piliso 2006) & \textbullet 60\% (Piliso 2006) \\
\hline
\textbullet Other & \textbullet No data available & \textbullet No data available \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\end{table}


\textsuperscript{77} Growing family businesses into professional companies, (available at http://www.thecorpshop.co.za/ fambus.html, as accessed 15 September 2008); S Piliso, “Blood money”, Sunday Times, Business Times, 23, (April), 2006; R Ackerman, Hearing grasshoppers jump: The story of Raymond Ackerman as told to Denise Prichard (Cape Town, David Philip), 2001, p. 325.


\textsuperscript{80} PF Hugo, “The alternative business entities…”, (MBA treatise, Graduate School of Business, University of Stellenbosch, 1996), p. 7.
generate jobs and wealth on a much larger scale than any other type of business. It is thus vital that more care be taken by public policy-makers everywhere to ensure the health, prosperity and longevity of this type of business.81

**Challenges facing small and medium-sized family businesses**

In the previous paragraphs the vital importance of family-owned business, specifically those that are SMEs, was highlighted. This evidently also applies to South Africa, with approximately 80-90% of SMEs being family owned or controlled.82

SMEs, both family- and non-family-owned, are, however, inextricably linked to problematic challenges and high failure rates. In the USA, for example, 34% of new small businesses fail within two years, 50% within four years, and 60% within six years.83 According to Kuratko and Hodgetts84, a more accurate statement is that more than half of all start-ups last between five and seven years, depending on the economic conditions following the start. It has been estimated that the SME failure rate in South Africa is between 70% and 80%, and that 80% of all new small businesses fail within their first five years of existence.85 High rates of failure are also expected among family businesses, as they are concentrated among small businesses.

There are many reasons for this high failure rate among SMEs, although some reasons are more prevalent and are cited more often than others. Because of their limited resources, inexperienced management and lack of financial stability, small businesses suffer from significantly higher mortality rates than larger businesses.86 Constraints specifically faced by smaller business enterprises in South Africa include: legal and regulatory requirements; market access; access to finance and suitable business premises; the acquisition

81 F Neubauer & AG Lank, *The family business …*, p. 11.
of skills and managerial expertise; access to appropriate resources and technology; the quality of infrastructure, especially in poverty-stricken and rural areas; bureaucratic hurdles, and tax regulations. Failures are largely due to a combination of poor macro-economic performance and a number of structural constraints that impede development.

Apart from facing similar business and environmental challenges as non-family-owned SMEs, family-owned SMEs face additional challenges owing to their unique nature and familial interpersonal relationships. These include problems arising from family conflict, emotional issues, sibling rivalry, autocratic paternalistic cultures, nepotism, confusing organisation, rigidity in innovation and succession, as well as resistance to change. Of these, succession is probably the biggest challenge faced by the majority of family businesses. Even though most owners want to see the family ownership of their business continue after their departure from the business, statistics worldwide show that only 30-33% of family businesses survive past the first generation, while even fewer (10-16%) survive to the third generation, while as few as 3% survive into the fourth generation. According to Hugo, only 25% of family businesses in South Africa proceed to the second generation, and a mere 10% to the third. As chief contributors to the economic and social well-being of all capitalist societies, this fragility is a reason for concern, and raises questions as to what factors explain this lack of longevity. Future research efforts should therefore focus on addressing these concerns.

88 “IDC support to SME sector”, SMME Tabloid, 2(7), 2001, p. 5.
92 PF Hugo, “The alternative business entities available to family businesses with succession as the ultimate goal”, (MBA treatise, Graduate School of Business, University of Stellenbosch, 1996), p. 8.
Conclusion

The main purpose of this paper was to examine the nature of family businesses and their important role in economic development. Little consensus exists in the literature as to what constitutes a family business. Numerous definitions have been identified, but most commonly a family business is defined by the following criteria:

- at least 51% of the equity of the business must be owned by a single family;
- a single family must be able to exercise considerable influence; and
- at least two family members must be involved in the senior management of the business.

Various unique characteristics of family businesses, as well as how they differ from non-family business, have been identified. These could have either a positive or a negative influence on the success of the family business.

Apart from facing similar business and environmental challenges to those of non-family-owned firms, family-owned businesses face additional challenges because of their unique nature and familial interpersonal relationships. The lack of longevity of family businesses is a major cause for concern; few proceed to the second generation, and even fewer make it to subsequent generations.

South Africa urgently needs to create more wealth and an environment which is conducive to more successful businesses if it is to achieve its many economic, social and personal objectives. In this regard it is important that family businesses should have a mouthpiece in government, academia and in the corporate sector, so that the contributions they make and the unique challenges they face can be highlighted in policy debates and in society at large. Such a mouthpiece could lobby on behalf of family businesses in policy debates, as is the case in countries such as the Netherlands, Sweden, and the European Union, amongst others. Currently (2009), two institutions focussing specifically on family businesses are being established in South Africa, namely the Family Business Institute of South Africa (FABASA) in conjunction with Old Mutual, and the Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University (NMMU) Family Business Unit.

Despite the high failure rates of family-owned businesses, statistics still show that they make a significant contribution to the economies of their respective countries. One can only imagine the enormous contribution these firms could make should their failure rate be reduced. Family businesses, and more specifically small and medium-sized family businesses, are the backbone of
the South African economy, and it is vital that all efforts be made to promote the success and sustainability of these businesses.

Annexure A: Definitions of family business

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME AND YEAR</th>
<th>DEFINITION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>OWNERSHIP-MANAGEMENT FOCUS</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barnes &amp; Hershon 1976</td>
<td>“controlling ownership is rested in the hands of an individual or of the members of a single family” (p. 106).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carsrud 1994</td>
<td>“firm’s ownership and policy-making are dominated by members of an ‘emotional kinship group’ whether members of that group recognise the fact or not” (p. 40).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Davis &amp; Taguiri 1985</td>
<td>“a business in which two or more extended family members influence the direction of the business” (quoted in Rothstein 1992:398).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hulshoff 2001 (Flören)</td>
<td>“a business where more than 50% of the voting shares are owned by one single family, and more than 50% of the management (team) are drawn from the family that owns the family”.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME AND YEAR</th>
<th>DEFINITION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ward 1990</td>
<td>“a business in which there are two or more family members influencing the business” (p. 66).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zimmerer &amp; Scarborough 2002</td>
<td>“one that includes two or more members of a family with financial control of the company” (p. 19).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GENERATIONAL TRANSFER FOCUS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Donnelley 1964</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Churchill &amp; Hatten 1987</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goldberg 1991</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward 1987</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward &amp; Aronoff 1990</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAME AND YEAR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Litz &amp; Kleysen 2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beckhard &amp; Dyer 1983</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Davis 1983</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dyer 1986</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Astrachan &amp; Kolenko 1994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAME AND YEAR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Donckels &amp; Lambrecht 1999</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leach 1994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neubauer &amp; Lank 1998</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smyrnioa, Tanewski, and Ramano 1998 (Flören)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steier 2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAME AND YEAR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stoy Hayward 1989</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“Your satisfaction, not mere profit is our aim”: A traditional English family enterprise and the textile industry – Arthur Bales and Son, from 1902

Leandie Maritz, Ingrid Thorius & Grietjie Verhoef

University of Johannesburg

Johannesburg

Samevatting

Die Britse setlaars van 1820 het ‘n setlaargemeenskap in die Oos-Kaap gevestig. Hierdie Engelse gemeenskap het onder andere ingesluit werklose Britse burgers, wat hulle hoop geplaas het op ‘n nuwe lewe in die Kaapkolonie. Onder die setlaars was daar vaklui, gewone nywerheidswerkers en boere. Uit ‘n netwerk van Britse entrepreneurs het die Bales familie hulle gevestig as handelaars. Die Bales- familie het ‘n algemene handelaarsonderneming gevestig en later uitgebrei om tekstiel en klerasie te verkoop. Na die Tweede Vryheidsoorlog het die Bales familiebesigheid verskuif na die Transvaalkolonie. Daar is ‘n materiaal- en klerasiebesigheid gevestig wat nog vir drie geslagte ‘n stewige vastrapplek in Johannesburg en omgewing sou verwerf. Hierdie artikels verwys na die mededinging in die tekstielhandel en die opkoms van die modebedryf in Johannesburg as die omgewing waarin die Bales familie hulle familiebesigheid gevestig het. Die sosiale kapitaalnetwerk van die Engelse kleinsakelui het die onderneming gehelp om in die mededingende klere- en modebedryf van Johannesburg ‘n gewaardeerde handelsnaam in tekstielhandel te vestig.

Introduction

From Colonial Origins to advanced economy

After the gold discoveries in 1886, Johannesburg, at first a dusty mining town, developed into the centre of business development in the Transvaal.

---

1 Bales Family Archives (BFA), Company document 1: Retail News.
The Witwatersrand gold deposits were the richest in the world. The predominantly rural Boer Republic was relatively poor and subsistence-oriented. The entire Witwatersrand was transformed rapidly: within four years brick houses replaced the tents. Immigrants from all over the world flocked to Johannesburg, where British immigrants, fortune seekers and labourers soon comprised the largest portion of the population. In 1905 The Rand Daily Mail noted that: “Everyone … seems to be in a perpetual state of hot haste.” The population rose rapidly from 155,642 in 1904 to 400,000 in 1926, thus creating a steady demand for consumer goods. More wealthy people settled to the north of the reef, while the poorer population gravitated to the south. Soon gas, electricity, electric trams and waterborne sewerage was introduced to the city. By 1904 Barney Barnato predicted that: “Johannesburg would become the financial Gibraltar of South Africa.”

Apart from the mining industry, other small manufacturing industries emerged in Johannesburg. People needed ordinary consumer goods and clothing. The depression after the First World War and again in the 1930s depressed demand, but the Second World War provided the much-needed stimulus for industry. One such industrial sector that benefited was the clothing industry, since the demand for fabric and garments was rising. Clear similarities can be observed between the establishment of the South African and British clothing industries. The mineral discoveries transformed the early rural town of Johannesburg. Johannesburg developed a truly cosmopolitan character, with the concomitant demand for consumer goods and luxury

---

8 GA Leyds, A history of Johannesburg, p. 11.
Traditional English family enterprise and the textile industry

items.\textsuperscript{11} By the turn of the century most of the clothing sold in Johannesburg was imported.\textsuperscript{12}

During the 1920s a large number of Jews immigrated to Johannesburg and settled in Johannesburg suburbs such as Doornfontein on the north-eastern side of the town.\textsuperscript{13} The Jews, known to be good tailors, made an enormous contribution to the economy as entrepreneurs in the clothing industry. Indian tailors also established themselves in Johannesburg. Clothing factories were established towards the end of the First World War. Mass production of ladies’ and children’s clothing already started in the 1920s. A resident of Johannesburg described the city as “the land of milk and honey,” because of its enormous economic potential.\textsuperscript{14} Fabric sales and the clothing sector expanded remarkably and continuously from the turn of the century.\textsuperscript{15} The clothing industry and related fabric wholesale and retail sectors offered a neat business niche to a family enterprise. In Johannesburg several examples of such enterprises developed, providing a survival strategy to immigrant entrepreneurial families. Johannesburg, as the fastest growing metropolitan area in South Africa since the mineral discoveries, was host to this development.

**Family business in South Africa**

What constitutes a family business has been the focus of much discussion. Colli even describes the defining of “family business” as “elusive”.\textsuperscript{16} Longenecker et al. described a family business as an enterprise involving a certain family responsible for the establishment, sustainability and functioning of the enterprise.\textsuperscript{17} Jaffe requires at least two family members’ involvement in management and/or ownership of an enterprise for it to qualify as a family business.\textsuperscript{18} To Brockhaus a family business constitutes one in which different generations are actively involved.\textsuperscript{19} Litz emphasised the involvement of the

\begin{itemize}
  \item \textsuperscript{11} GA Leyds, *A history of Johannesburg*, p. 176.
  \item \textsuperscript{12} JC Dos Santos, *The development of the Witwatersrand clothing industry: ..., 1925–55*, p. 7.
  \item \textsuperscript{13} ELP Stals, *Afrikaners in die Goudstad, Part 2*, pp. 23–25.
  \item \textsuperscript{14} JC Dos Santos, *The development of the Witwatersrand clothing industry: ..., 1925–55*, pp. 4–5.
  \item \textsuperscript{15} JC Dos Santos, *The development of the Witwatersrand clothing industry: ..., 1925–55*, p. 9.
  \item \textsuperscript{17} JG Longenecker, CW Moore and JW Petty, *Small business management. An entrepreneurial emphasis*, 10\textsuperscript{th} Edition (South-western College Publishing Company, Cincinnati), 1997, p. 92.
  \item \textsuperscript{18} DT Jaffe, *Working with the ones you love: Strategies for a successful family business* (Conary Press, Berkeley), 1991, p. 27.
\end{itemize}
family as owner in the business, with definitive say in the determination of a successor.\textsuperscript{20} The operational definition used in the recent study of Danny Miller and Isabelle le Breton-Miller is: “… businesses, whether public or private, in which a family controls the largest block of shares or votes and has one or more of its members in key management positions.”\textsuperscript{21} Broadly speaking, enterprises with at least 51\% of family ownership by a single family, at least two family members’ involvement in management of the enterprise, and planned succession of management and ownership kept within the next generation, would constitute the essential elements of a family business.\textsuperscript{22}

In this article the definition used by Parsons (1994) is appropriate to the analysis: a ‘family’ is described as “... a social unit with different degrees of belonging. Its core is a group that is organized around couples and their offspring (the ‘nuclear family’) which operates within a larger, less organized group of relations (the extended family).”\textsuperscript{23} A business family is one which performs special functions beyond ordinary family functions. These additional functions entail ensuring the future of the companies they manage. These functions could create ambivalent situations and affect relationships in the family.\textsuperscript{24} Families have different relationships to businesses, and these determine ownership and managerial dimensions.

Family businesses were the most common businesses formed during the pre-industrial period and early industrial revolution since they were seen to be the backbone of many industrialised economies. This business form was prevalent in old industrial sectors, especially in labour-intensive and craft-based enterprises.\textsuperscript{25} Initially family businesses were relatively unstable, because of asymmetric information flows and legal systems unable to secure property rights. But currently, family businesses operate in a more ‘friendly’ environment. The classic family business is currently still well entrenched in

\begin{thebibliography}
\end{thebibliography}
advanced economies.26 A classic family business is an enterprise where family and control are intertwined, and where the family members are involved in both strategic and the normal day-to-day decision-making.27

Family firms often appeared in the early stages of early enterprise, in the start-up period preceding the public company phase. Not all family firms have developed into public listed entities – the Bales family enterprise is a fine example of the perpetuation of a private non-listed enterprise. Family businesses of the early era were mostly small and medium sized, slow growing and developed internal succession patterns. The classic family firm primarily relied on self-financing or on local, informal credit sources and were often less profitable than managerial enterprises.28 Research to the contrary has shown that traditional characteristics of family enterprises have mixed successfully with features of modern capitalist markets such as internationalisation and the use of advanced technology.29

In response to the Alfred Chandler Jr view that family firms were limited in scope and unable to preserve capital,30 extensive research has shown the longevity of family firms and the successes and advantages of family enterprises.31 One aspect of the strong rejection of the Chandlerian view was imbedded in the longevity of family firms and the relative security of employment and subsistence they offered the family and larger kinship relationship. Goto showed carefully how long-lived family firms in Japan had survived stagnant economic cycles and succeeded in adapting themselves continuously to the business environment. These firms thereby strengthened managerial skills, risk management capacities and contributed to socio-economic stability in societies.32 The longevity of the Bales family enterprise illustrates the adjusting capabilities of the firm and the stability it afforded

---

family members as well as the communities within which it operated.

In the modern period family enterprises constitute a crucial part of modern world economies. Family forms represent between 75% and 95% of all registered enterprises world-wide and accounts for approximately 65% of world GDP.\(^{33}\) In South Africa between 65% and 90% of businesses are owned by families. This constitutes an estimated 80% of all the businesses. Of this large number, about 60% of the companies are listed on the Johannesburg Stock Exchange (JSE).\(^{34}\) These family businesses listed between 1987 and 1992, received a return of 36% compared to the non-family businesses, which had a 27% return.\(^{35}\) Although family businesses constitute a substantial proportion of the total number of operating businesses, it is said that the number will rise in the future because of the powerful opportunities this form of enterprise offers economic and social empowerment in South Africa.\(^{36}\)

Various attempts have been made to categorise family businesses. One useful categorisation, taken from the study of family firms in the United States of America, was formulated by Shanker and Astrachan. They suggest that family firms can be divided into three general categories, namely

- Businesses where family members are not in direct daily contact with the business but influence decision-making, either through board membership or significant shareholding.
- Businesses similar to the category stated above, but have the founder or a descendant in a managing capacity of daily operations.
- Businesses where multiple generations are involved in the business, family involved directly in daily operations and more than one family member entrusted with significant management responsibilities.\(^{37}\)

Despite the positive characteristics of family firms and the apparent superior operational performance, the advantages of loyalty, personal sacrifice
and commitment, quick decision-making, trustworthiness, transfer of intergenerational knowledge and a stable culture,\textsuperscript{38} as in other parts of the world, family businesses in South Africa seldom display exceptional longevity. Internationally only approximately 30\% of family firms are expected to survive into a second generation and only 10\% into the third generation,\textsuperscript{39} while Colli observed that relatively quickly, within two or three generations, entrepreneurial family firms would evolve into managerial public companies or disappear.\textsuperscript{40} In South Africa it was estimated that only about 25\% of all family businesses proceed into a second generation and a mere 10\% into the third generation. This lack of longevity undermines the social well-being of the society in which it operates and comes at a high social cost to the community.\textsuperscript{41} Despite this, family firms still make up a sizeable proportion of small businesses; they do just not all survive several generations.

This article will explore the exceptional longevity of the Bales’ family enterprise in Johannesburg in the fabric and drapery retail sector.

**Methodology**

The research into and the writing of family business history in South Africa often encounters serious problems. First, the family involved is reluctant to disclose private family sources for the purpose of research, and, secondly, more often than not no systematic record has been kept of company documents. When a keen interest is shown in research into family business history, the private advantage or marketing potential of such endeavour often mitigates against academic research methodology. South Africa does not have the benefit of a long tradition of historical record-keeping by private families and their participation in research to explore the contribution of such firms in society. For the purpose of this article the researchers were very fortunate to receive the full collaboration and participation of the Bales family. Research was undertaken into newspapers, company retail marketing pamphlets and some remaining official company records. Various interviews were conducted with the remaining family members engaged in the fourth-generation family enterprise. The third as well as the fourth-generation Bales descendants were

\textsuperscript{38} E Venter, *The succession process…*, pp. 64–73.  
\textsuperscript{39} E Venter, *The succession process…*, p. 70.  
\textsuperscript{40} A Colli, *The history of family business*, p. 13.  
\textsuperscript{41} E Venter, *The succession process…*, p. 70.
interviewed. Interviews were recorded, transcribed and submitted to the interviewees for comments. No factual or substantial changes were made to the actual transcribed interviews. These constitute valuable sources, and are now kept in the University of Johannesburg Library Rare Book Collection as part of an ongoing project to collect oral testimony from those involved in family businesses. Only formal registration documents of the original company could be retrieved from the Registrar of Companies, but those do not assist much in explaining the context and course of the development of the Bales family business. Use was also made of local newspapers to establish the community engagement of the enterprise. This article hopes to encourage scholars to engage enthusiastically in oral research and to assist the people of South Africa in understanding the contribution of family businesses in sustaining the long-term economic well-being of their participants and the wider community in which these enterprises operate.

Figure 1: Arthur Bales, draper and outfitter

The story of the Bales’ enterprise

The story of the Arthur Bales family enterprise is that of a simple family business enterprise, reflecting some of the aspects of complexity in growth and family dynamics identified by Sandig et al.42 Arthur Bales I arrived in Cape Town, South Africa, from Norwich, England, in 1893.43 He completed his

43 BFA, Family history document, undated.
apprenticeship in draping, in England, after completion of his formal school education. After working in various drapery and outfitters’ stores in the Eastern Cape, where he found employment in a drapery store in Whittlesea, he gained adequate experience to start his own business, although he did not yet take steps to establish his own business. He did not have access to start-up capital, but managed the drapery store in Whittlesea. In Whittlesea he met Edith, the woman who became his wife. She and her family were from the Whittlesea area. The Eastern Cape had a strong English community, following the settlement of the 1820 British settlers on the eastern frontier of the former British colony. The agricultural development was stimulated by the expanding wool-farming sector. The British settlers of the Eastern Cape became the tradesmen and artisans, capturing, together with the Jews, trading and business opportunities in the region. These enterprises expanded their entrepreneurial activities beyond the Cape colony into the Boer Republics when the mineral discoveries offered lucrative business. The Eastern Cape thus nurtured entrepreneurial activity in the English community in which Arthur Bales lived.

During the period of the South African War, 1899–1902, Arthur Bales lived in Kimberley, where he practised one of his hobbies – he worked as a photographer. In the early stages of the war the town was besieged by Boer forces. Arthur Bales photographed much of the human dimension of the war and society and managed to save sufficient funds to establish his own business. Arthur Bales was a professional draper with a five-year apprenticeship from England. He desired his own enterprise, but worked in draper stores in the Eastern Cape before being able to start up in Johannesburg in 1902. Johannesburg was captured by the British early in 1900 and Bales was convinced that he would be able to set up an enterprise in the then British-dominated society. On 10 July 1902, the Arthur Bales Drapery and Outfitting Store opened for business in Braamfontein, in the northern part of the town Johannesburg. The reason for the selection of Braamfontein as the first seat of the newly established store was that it was central to the

44 E-mail correspondence, Jonathan Bales, 8 April 2009.
45 BFA, History of the family Bales, 1982.
47 These photographs are still in the Bales Family Archive.
50 BFA, Family history document, undated.
city and people frequented the business area.\textsuperscript{51} It was the location of most shops and other business activities in Johannesburg. Post-war Johannesburg offered a wide range of opportunities for entrepreneurs to provide various goods and services to the rapidly expanding population that had settled there and had been starved by the disruption of ordinary, as well as more luxury, consumer supplies during the war.\textsuperscript{52} The population included the new British administration as well as the families of the mining magnates, the ‘Randlords’, who displayed a keen appetite for imported and luxury goods.\textsuperscript{53} The Arthur Bales Drapery and Outfitting Store sold imported clothing, domestic curtains and linen and offered a service to fit and adjust clothing for clients. Over Christmas they sold special imported Christmas gifts.\textsuperscript{54} The opening of the Arthur Bales store was delayed due to late arrivals of supplies. It was the consequence of war disruption, and the delivery of supplies remained erratic until late in 1902.\textsuperscript{55}

The business expanded gradually and a few years later two more stores were opened in La Rochelle, a residential area south of the city, and Doornfontein, which was east of the city. The Braamfontein store was managed by Arthur Bales himself, assisted by his wife, Edith, and some European shop assistants after expansion into other locations. By the 1920s the original store in Braamfontein had become a landmark. The address on the corner of De Beer and De Korte Streets became known to the local population as ‘Bales Corner’.\textsuperscript{56} The location of the store contributed to the entrenchment of the family brand.\textsuperscript{57} The early business advertised in various publications such as \textit{Clifton Magazine}, \textit{The Witwatersrand}, and \textit{The Worker} newspapers. Each of these newspapers was aimed at a different market segment: \textit{Clifton Magazine} was the magazine of the Clifton Presbyterian Church; \textit{The Witwatersrand} was a paper for the general public and \textit{The Worker} targeted working-class people, among whom were many women, who engaged in sewing, dressmaking and general housekeeping duties. Arthur Bales also published his own publications, such as calendars, an in-house magazine, brochures and coupons. During the first decades of the Braamfontein store Bales held a Christmas Bazaar to which customers received tickets. Arthur Bales also added a personal touch

\textsuperscript{51} BFA, History of the Family Bales, 1982.
\textsuperscript{52} E-mail correspondence, Jonathan Bales, 8 April 2009.
\textsuperscript{53} ELP Stals, \textit{Afrikaners in die Goudstad}, Part 2, p. 22.
\textsuperscript{54} BFA, Retail marketing brochures, 1937 and 1945.
\textsuperscript{55} E-mail correspondence, Jonathan Bales, 8 April 2009.
\textsuperscript{56} BFA, History of the Family Bales, 1982.
\textsuperscript{57} A Colli, \textit{Family business}, p. 212.
by sending customers typed personal invitations to the store. Early brochures and advertisements used the sales window as a marketing tool: “look into our window”, clients were invited.\textsuperscript{58} The business experienced disruptions in regular deliveries of supplies during the First World War, since the bulk of the merchandise was still imported from the United Kingdom.\textsuperscript{59} The store moved to the corner of Biccard and De Korte Streets in 1922, because expanding business activities necessitated larger premises. The store then became known as ‘The Daylight Store’. This was because the construction of the building ruled out the need for artificial lighting.\textsuperscript{60}

Arthur Bales I died in 1927. He was survived by his wife Edith and two children, Dorothy and Arthur Bales II.\textsuperscript{61} Arthur Bales II attended Parktown

\textsuperscript{58} BFA, CD 1, early 1900s advertisements etc.
\textsuperscript{59} E-mail correspondence, Jonathan Bales, 8 April 2009.
\textsuperscript{60} BFA, Family history document, undated.
\textsuperscript{61} BFA, History of the Family Bales, 1982.
Boys’ High school, a prestigious government school in the northern suburbs of Johannesburg.\textsuperscript{62} When his father died he was only 15 years old. He did not complete his schooling, since he was expected to follow in his father’s footsteps and pursue the business. Although the Arthur Bales store was not consciously started as a family business, the business provided the livelihood of the family of Arthur Bales I and Edith. The business played an important role in employment-creation, income-generation and wealth-accumulation, as observed by Colli and Rose.\textsuperscript{63} The business was successful and therefore it was quite justified to expect that the enterprise would persevere, despite the death of the founder. Given that the death of Arthur Bales was unexpected, there had been no conscious succession planning – his son was only fifteen years old. Edith Bales wanted to continue with the business in the interest of the founder’s family. Arthur Bales’s brother had shown some interest in taking over the business, but Edith disagreed. Arthur Bales II was subsequently sent to England to complete his apprenticeship in drapery in departmental stores in Norwich and London. During his absence Edith Bales managed the store with the assistance of her daughter, Dorothy. In the vacuum left by the passing away of Arthur Bales I, the family enterprise had offered a predictable “response to instability, uncertainty and poor property rights”\textsuperscript{64}. The uncertainty caused by Arthur Bales’s death was mitigated by the existence of an enterprise (the family firm) the spouse knew and could offer a relatively sustained source of livelihood. This had been the explicit case during the early stages of industrialisation when property rights were insecure. In the Transvaal property rights were quite secure and therefore the firm remained firmly in the hands of the Bales family, which was a valuable source of security to the family.

Arthur Bales I did not open his enterprise with the conscious strategy in mind that the business would be maintained by his children and successive generations. With limited employment opportunities, but vast entrepreneurial opportunities after the South African war, practising an apprenticeship in one’s own business seemed to be a good idea, especially at a time when a new British colonial government was formed in the colony. The current Bales generation explained the perpetuation of their great grandfather’s business as “the natural thing to do, since the business was there – all we had to do is

\textsuperscript{62} E-mail correspondence, Jonathan Bales, 8 April 2009.
\textsuperscript{64} A Colli, “Family business”, p. 197.
continue with an enterprise that had proven success.”\textsuperscript{65} The store was therefore managed by family members after the passing away of the founder.\textsuperscript{66} Arthur Bales II returned to South Africa towards the end of 1929 and immediately joined his mother and sister in the store in Braamfontein. These were trying times for all retail businesses, because of the impact of the Great Depression. The Arthur Bales store struggled to obtain stock and experienced a decline in sales.\textsuperscript{67} During this period the business became a member of the JCCI (Johannesburg Chamber of Commerce and Industry) and remained as such until the early 1990s. Taking up membership of a business network seemed indicative of a strategy to strengthen the position of the family enterprise in the wake of a general slump in the business cycle, without jeopardising the independence of the firm and the family. The management structure of the firm displayed strong and direct family control. Between 1930 and 1969, the various Bales stores were managed by Dorothy MacCallum (the sister of Arthur Bales II), Arthur Bales II and Mary Bales (his wife). From 1969 to 1980, Dorothy MacCallum, Anne MacCallum, Arthur Bales II, Arthur Bales III and Gaynor Bales (wife of Arthur Bales III) managed the stores.\textsuperscript{68}

\textbf{Figure 3: Store in Braamfontein, “Daylight Store”}

\textbf{Business diversification and relocation}

\textsuperscript{65} Interview, Arthur Bales III and Jonathan Bales, 27 August 2008.
\textsuperscript{66} E-mail correspondence, Jonathan Bales, 8 April 2009.
\textsuperscript{67} BFA, Family history document, undated.
\textsuperscript{68} E-mail correspondence, Jonathan Bales, 8 April 2009; Also see BFA: Arthur Bales Magazine, vol 1, 1911, p. 1, as well as several advertisements of newly imported wear.
At first Arthur Bales Drapery and Outfitting Store operated in a closely controlled market in Johannesburg catering for the demands of the entire spectrum of social entities – wealthy people from the mining and business environment, the colonial middle class from the colonial administration as well as ordinary workers. The emphasis was on the sale of quality goods. The 1904 Calendar described the enterprise as “The leading house for general, fancy … and furnishing drapery.”69 “The impoverished inhabitants of Vrededorp70 were not the primary target market of the Bales enterprise. The Indian traders, who engaged in wholesaling and the importation of clothing, fabrics and household goods from less expensive markets in India, were more active in the market for the less well-to-do population, such as poor people in Vrededorp. The Indian traders charged low prices and utilised family members to minimise operating costs and gain a stronghold in that market.71 They soon controlled the industry, and in some instances even outperformed Jewish distributors of fabric, household goods and textiles.72

Figure 4: Arthur Bales Calendar, 1904

69 BFA, 1904 Bales Calendar.
70 ELP Stals, Afrikaners in die Goudstad, Part 2, pp. 20–22.
71 Interview, Arthur Bales III and Jonathan Bales, 27 August 2008; also see C Cachalia, From survival to defiance: Indian hawkers in Johannesburg (South African Institute of Race Relations, Johannesburg), 1975, p. 12.
72 E-mail correspondence, Jonathan Bales, 8 April 2009.
Arthur Bales I assessed the market differently: he knew the family enterprise could not compete on that scale or at those prices with the Indian traders. Thus Arthur Bales specialised in quality goods, targeting the English and European middle and upper income classes of Johannesburg. By dealing directly with wholesalers and suppliers in the UK, and importing much of their own stock, the Bales offered goods that were clearly differentiated from the merchandise of the Indian trading competitors. Arthur Bales developed its own 'signature' on certain types of drapery, clothing and household linen. The business actually relied on the corresponding material culture of the European middle class to distinguish their market from that of the Indian businessmen.

As the business expanded, operations were diverted from an ordinary departmental store to add a stronger focus on quality drapery. Arthur Bales II and his sister Dorothy, who remained part of the business until shortly before their deaths (Arthur II died in 2002 and Dorothy in the late 1980s), moved one of their stores to Linden, further west of the central business district of Johannesburg. This residential area had two Afrikaans medium schools and a growing Afrikaans-speaking community developed. The first Arthur Bales shop in Linden was a clothing store for men, women and children. It also sold household drapery. At first the fabrics were imported from England. Gradually products from the East also penetrated the market. A substantial portion of local fabrics was also bought and traded. The idea was that different products of high quality should be offered at reasonably low prices to satisfy customer demand. At first the store sold various Christmas gifts for both adults and children. Much later, during the 1960s, the store shifted its focus to fabrics, yarn, wool and haberdashery in response to the emergence of retail clothing stores in the city, such as Truworths, Edgars and Woolworths.

The business has also supported various Indian-owned distributors, some which have become standing suppliers of goods to the store. One of the suppliers to Arthur Bales has had three generations of family members dealing with the store. Many of the suppliers to Arthur Bales are second-generation suppliers. The early business dealt with wholesalers and suppliers directly in
the UK, and imported much of their specialised wares.\textsuperscript{79}

The opening of the Linden store in 1948 marked the recognition of demographic movements in Johannesburg. A more middle-class Afrikaans-speaking community in Linden displayed a strong overlap with European English tastes and thus justified the opening of a branch in that area. Linden was also the location of many English-speaking people, who had settled in the area around several church congregations, such as the Presbyterian Church, The Anglican Church and a Roman Catholic Church and convent. Since the Arthur Bales family enterprise was not engaged in industrial production, location was not required in an industrial district, but in a socio-cultural environment conducive to household demand. Both the stores at La Rochelle and Linden in the 1940s fitted these characteristics. The Bales family themselves settled in Linden, having moved around in predominantly English middle-class suburbs such as Parktown, Parkview, Rosebank and Greenside. Arthur Bales III (born 1942) even attended Laerskool Louw Geldenhuys, which was a dual-medium public primary school in Linden. Then he went to Greenside High School, also a government school in the same area, west of the city centre. The Bales family thus maintained their English middle-class character by attending dual or English-medium schools and conducting business in areas representative of middle-class culture. The positioning of the Arthur Bales stores in or adjacent to middle-class white suburbs served to illustrate the selection of market segment the family enterprise wanted to target.

The current premises of the Arthur Bales family enterprise is in 4\textsuperscript{th} Avenue, Linden. It was opened by Arthur Bales III in 1969. The store was notably successful. The area also provided an environment where the family could develop the niche market selected.\textsuperscript{80} The Linden store was managed by Arthur Bales II until his death in 2002, then by Arthur Bales III and Gaynor Bales.\textsuperscript{81} The English Bales family’s presence in Linden created the network of trust and shared interest with the middle-class Afrikaans and English community, which constituted a prerequisite for survival. The founder of the enterprise had the knowledge and expertise required to make the business grow. Therefore the long overlapping period of control between Arthur Bales II and Arthur Bales III was used fruitfully to integrate the English colonial draper store\textsuperscript{82} into

\textsuperscript{79} E-mail correspondence, Jonathan Bales, 8 April 2009.
\textsuperscript{80} Interview, Arthur Bales III and Jonathan Bales, 27 August 2008
\textsuperscript{81} E-mail correspondence, Jonathan Bales, 8 April 2009; Northcliff and Melville Times, “Bales family celebrates a century of trading”, 9 June 2002, p. 5.
\textsuperscript{82} A Colli, Family business, p. 209.
a predominantly Afrikaans middle-class suburb.

The business environment changed dramatically between the end of the Second World War and the 1960s. Braamfontein changed from a business district in early Johannesburg to a residential slum area by the early 1950s and then to a business and office as well as urban residential district in the late 1950s and early 1960s. The clientele also changed over that period from the housewife to the office worker. Due to the increased economic activity in this area, demand for fabrics and clothing rose.  

The combination of the new Linden store and the Bales family’s middle-class suburban nature created a whole new generation of merchandise that was introduced to Arthur Bales in Linden.

Demographic changes resulted in a decision in 1994 to close the Braamfontein shop, which was effective from 1995. By the early 1990s Braamfontein was no longer the business hub of the wealthy or the middle class, but an area

---

83 E-mail correspondence with Jonathan Bales, 8 April 2009.
84 BFA, History of the family Bales, 1982.
inhabited by wage-earning flat dwellers, students and vagrants. Accessibility was also a growing concern, since parking had become problematic and the lack of inner city security resulted in shopping aversion by the middle-class women frequenting the store. Braamfontein was simply an undesirable area to work in or travel to. One of the main reasons for this development was the endless strikes in Braamfontein which always proceeded past the shop, affecting what was the main trading time – the lunch hour of the office workers. The economic climate of the mid-1990s in Braamfontein became unviable.  

By the early 1990s the Linden store was the only remaining outlet of the family enterprise. The Linden premises were situated in a relatively peaceful suburb and easily accessible to housewives. The management also changed the focus of the business slightly. Trading in clothing was gradually reduced to make way for specialised needlecraft and embroidery needs. The quality of sewing fabric remained exceptionally high, and new ranges of patterns and knitting yarns and wool were introduced.  

Arthur Bales bought a small school clothing supplier across the road in Linden. It was the local stockist of school clothes for Laerskool Louw Geldenhuyys and Hoërskool Linden. The shop also stocked fabrics and thus created a perfect opportunity for synergy. This acquisition was indicative of the extent to which the Arthur Bales store had embedded itself into the community in Linden. The two Afrikaans-medium schools in Linden were the two institutions to which the small shop had supplied school clothing. In acquiring that business, Arthur Bales could add the supply of school clothing to the other drapery and fabric merchandise in the draper store around the corner.

---

85  E-mail correspondence, L. Maritz/Jonathan Bales, 8 April 2009.
86  BFA, CD 1, various advertisements, 1920s and 1930s.
Management of the Family Draper’s Store

Since the Arthur Bales business was started as a survival strategy by Arthur Bales I, no conscious succession plan existed. There was much unpleasantness after the death of Arthur Bales I, as his brother had hoped to take over the business. This family split was never resolved. After the succession by Edith and her daughter Dorothy, joined after his apprenticeship by Arthur Bales II, siblings in the direct family have subsequently been involved or worked in the business. Jonathan Bales noted: “The business has always been part of the family, and has also partly defined who we are as a family.” 88 No other family disputes over the business are known. Arthur Bales II also did his apprenticeship in London, England. After the death of his father, he was expected to continue with the business. 89 Arthur Bales III did not know what he wanted to do, but ultimately ended up in the business. He knew the business was a success and being part of it was eventually a natural decision to take. 90 When the ‘daylight store’ was demolished in the late 1960s, the new store, built in 1969, was

---

88 E-mail correspondence, L Maritz/Jonathan Bales, 8 April 2009.
89 BFA, Family history document, undated.
managed by Arthur Bales III.  

Not all the direct family members were enthusiastic about becoming involved in the enterprise, because of the immense commitment required and time consumed by the business. Ownership of the business has remained in the Bales family and a member of the next generation has in each phase of succession taken control. The ‘Buddenbrooks effect’ (third-generation death of entrepreneurial skills resulting in the decline of the firm) has not manifested in the Bales family enterprise. The remarkable aspect of the Arthur Bales enterprise is that currently the fourth generation of Baleses is actively involved in the running of the business.

The management of the family firm was gradually strengthened by better and more appropriately qualified managers. From the first two generations of apprenticed drapers, invaluable experience was handed down to more business management-oriented managers. Both Arthur Bales III and Jonathan Bales studied commerce after school. Arthur Bales III completed a B.Com Accountancy degree at the University of the Witwatersrand and qualified as a Chartered Accountant, while his son Jonathan Bales (the fourth Bales generation) completed a B.Com Marketing degree and was later a post graduate student in Strategic Management at the Rand Afrikaans University (currently the University of Johannesburg). Jonathan Bales has joined the family firm since he perceived the family business as a part of the family and part of the community – he grew up in the shop. Arthur Bales III commented: “It is part of your life. You go home, just to carry on talking and planning.”

There is the saying that ‘you don’t own a business, it owns you’. This is true in respect of the Arthur Bales shop, since extensive hours have always been part of business practice.

The successful succession in the Arthur Bales family business can be ascribed to a number of factors. The business was kept in an environment where a strong personalised relationship with clientele could be maintained. In La Rochelle and Linden, the family established a close rapport with the community. Furthermore, each new generation learned a great deal from the former – each successor was in the shop with his father. Succession was made

---

91 BFA, Family History document, undated.
92 E-mail correspondence, I. Maritz/Jonathan Bales, 8 April 2009.
95 E-mail correspondence, I. Maritz/Jonathan Bales, 8 April 2009.
relatively simple through the intergenerational transfer of experience, know-
how and client rapport.96 Another contributing factor is the good and relaxed
relations in the family. Arthur Bales III could not identify any particular
‘recipe’ for successful succession in their family enterprise. He observed: “It
is the children’s choice whether they want to work in the shop and ultimately
own it. The way the children learn about the business comes from an early
age, with them learning it by performing small jobs, e.g. work at the till on
Saturdays”.97

Family involvement in the firm was also quite high. As observed by Colli
and Rose, “... families and their firms are hard to separate ... implying that
the family’s values, knowledge and reputation can be counted as intangible
assets of the business”.98 Arthur Bales and his wife Edith worked in the first
shop, and they were followed by Arthur Haylock Bales II, his wife Mary Bales
(a qualified nurse prior to her marriage to Arthur Bales II), his sister Dorothy
Bales, and Anne MacCallum (néé Bales). Currently the family members
involved in the family enterprise are Arthur John Bales (III), his wife Gaynor
Bales and their children Gina Bales, Jonathan Bales (IV) and Nicci Bales.99

The family firm has developed into the family employer, but the advantage
is that employment is secure. This security is the result of 107 years of good
relationships with the communities in which the enterprise had operated.100
The family had no conscious policy regarding employment of non-family
members. Members of the extended family have become an equally active part
of the enterprise. Only a relatively small number of non-family members have
been appointed as shop assistants. This proved to be a very stable workforce.
Employees have very long employment relations with the family firm. There
are current employees who have been part of the business for 20 years. No
special training programmes were introduced for non-family staff members,
since the very people-oriented business required close interaction with
customers and those skills were acquired in the shop. According to Arthur
Bales III, “they have to perfect their customer relations while they work. You
cannot teach that”.101 The disadvantage of the family managerial structure is
that a business such as this is very much a jail, says Arthur Bales III. “You are

96 E Venter, The succession process ..., p. 80.
98 A Colli, Family business, p. 212.
99 E-mail correspondence, Jonathan Bales, 29 September 2008.
100 Interview, Arthur Bales III and Jonathan Bales, 27 August 2008.
lucky when you get a week’s break. The children never get a proper holiday. You can never close the shop. You cannot really leave the shop in someone else’s hands, because you believe they cannot do the work like you can.”

Running the business

The start-up capital for the first Arthur Bales enterprise in Braamfontein was the personal savings Arthur Bales l accumulated from his photography. The success of the business provided further working capital to expand operations into new areas, such as the branch in La Rochelle. The business later returned to its core competency and kept its flagship store in Braamfontein, and either closed or sold the other branches.

The family firm was run as a close-knit enterprise. The owner was responsible for every aspect of the business – financial administration and planning, marketing, staff and selection and purchase of the product range. He had to do the tax, deal with the bank manager and deal with labour legislation-related matters. Arthur Bales l, as well as his successors, was a bearer of invaluable intangible assets in the firm. According to Colli and Rose, this is “... a major source of knowledge and expertise and his or her social networks represent important intangible assets.” The particular close-knit family structure of the business ensured optimal transfer of these assets within the firm. The firm was a private limited liability company and therefore not accessible to non-family members. The current annual turnover does not exceed R10 million. The firm is therefore regarded as a small enterprise and is exempt from stringent labour regulations.

In the earlier days wholesalers were also financiers. Suppliers generally offered extended credit terms, quite often over 200 days. This made cash-flow considerations easier for the Bales family during the establishment years. The first bankers to the family enterprise in the 1920s were Barclays Bank DC&O, which eventually became First National Bank (FNB). The Arthur Bales business essentially remained customers of FNB for between 80 and 90 years.

The early auditors were Stakesby Lewis, whose founder, Mr Stakesby, had been a longstanding friend of Arthur Bales l. In accordance with the characteristics

103 E-mail correspondence, Jonathan Bales, 29 September 2008.
of small family firms, this relationship continued over many years. When Arthur Bales III completed his accountancy articles, he was contracted to Stakesby Lewis. Several mergers occurred amongst auditing firms during the 1970s and 1980s. Stakesby Lewis was also absorbed into a much larger firm, resulting in Arthur Bales’s decision to switch its business to a smaller and independent auditing firm.

The business had kept itself quite small, especially after the closure of the Braamfontein branch. The store in Linden refined its focus to its core competencies. The establishment in Linden was initially in a relatively busy village-like environment with various retail department stores such as the clothing outlets Foschini and Truworths, grocery and general dealers such as OK Bazaars, Hugo Stores and Grey Smith, several banks and building societies such as Standard Bank, Barclays Bank DC&O – later First National Bank – United Building Society, small greengrocers, a shoe store and a stationer. These small shops and services brought the middle-class housewife and parent to Linden where they could do their business in relative peace and tranquillity. By the time Foschini and Truworths had opened their outlets, they did not pose unwanted competition to Arthur Bales, since the latter had returned to its core competency of fabrics, wool, embroidery supplies and dressmaking equipment. Later, in the 1970s, a shopping mall, Northcliff Plaza, was erected close by. It attracted many customers away from the shop, especially when grocery stores such as OK Bazaars and later a Spar opened there. For a period of about 20 years the shopping mall attracted clients, but could not replace the personalised family business environment Arthur Bales had provided uninterruptedly since the beginning of the century.

In the past decade new shops again opened for business within less than 100m from the Arthur Bales store in Linden, contributing to the revival of the earlier village atmosphere. These shops include four restaurants, a coffee shop, a delicatessen, a bakery, a hair salon, a beauty salon, a flower shop and a party props shop. Even though the Arthur Bales business is a destination business, this revived business environment has added significantly to the number of people calling for business at the shop. A destination business, in this instance, can be defined as a business or a store frequented because of specific needs and not just a “pop-in-and-have-a-look” store. The management

---

104 E-mail correspondence with Jonathan Bales, 8 April 2009.
105 E-mail correspondence, Jonathan Bales, 8 April 2009.
of Arthur Bales weathered the stormy business environment as the character of Linden changed somewhat, but succeeded in maintaining much of the family draper character. This management strategy, on the other hand, contributed to the revival of the village-like atmosphere in the suburb.

Arthur Bales terminated the publication of its marketing brochures and currently relies primarily on word-of-mouth and electronic advertisement. The business is renowned for impeccable service to customers as well as to the community. This includes maintaining close regular contact with their customers by distributing advertisements of special offers or new merchandise personally, speaking to customers and offering them what they desire. Their focus is on customer services and affordable quality goods. This focus of the business has remained unchanged to the present. In the early years, various novel extras were used to entice new customers and keep existing customers, such as insurance of goods, delivery, etc. Customer needs were noticed in subtle ways, which included recognising stock that did not move, products stocked by other suppliers and communicating face-to-face with customers. Nostalgia and very long family relationships with customers have established a strong sense of loyalty between the business and its customers.¹⁰⁷

The management has always focused on customer service, superior quality and the value of its offering to its customers. This has been a major strength of the business compared to many of its competitors over the years.¹⁰⁸ In 1906 the Arthur Bales Spring Catalogue stated: “The maxim of the world’s best businessmen was ‘People go where they’re invited,’ and this is our motto too. We cordially invite you to call and see the lovely productions we have now on view. ...”¹⁰⁹ A strong sense of reciprocity has existed with its customer base. When cheap imports from China entered the South African market, Arthur Bales persisted in importing superior quality fabrics, sewing and embroidery yarns as well as knitting wool. Adaptation to market conditions and opportunities remained in tandem with customer needs. These needs were relatively easily observed because of the direct interaction of the Bales family members in the shop with customers. Customers could communicate their preferences in the shop and one of the family managerial staff would respond. One such responsive change was the branching out into the supply of quilting-related goods. The Arthur Bales store became the central point

¹⁰⁷ E-mail correspondence, Jonathan Bales, 8 April 2009; also refer to BFA: Published advertisements of the establishment years.
¹⁰⁸ E-mail correspondence, Jonathan Bales, 8 April 2009.
¹⁰⁹ BFA, Spring Catalogue, 1906.
for the import and distribution of quilting requirements within the industry. This development displayed the keen adaptability of this family enterprise in the sector. According to Jonathan Bales “the responsiveness of management to customer needs has been a major strength of the business compared to many of its competitors over the years ... The new sectors that we have expanded into have become major parts of the business.”

Management strategy centered around superior service and community involvement. The business was a member of the Braamfontein Community Centre for many years, and supported various churches in the area. Arthur Bales I and his wife were active members of the Clifton Presbyterian church in Braamfontein even prior to the opening of the store and until his death.110 Edith Bales was a member of the Women’s Association of St. George’s Church as well as the Women’s Christian Temperance Union Movement.111 Currently, community service takes a more direct form: non-family staff is part of the community. Their remuneration is seen as a contribution towards the well-being of the community.

Figure 7: Bales Magazine, No. 1, 1911. Service to clients, best quality

110 E-mail correspondence, Jonathan Bales, 8 April 2009.
111 BFA, History of the Family Bales, 1982.
Arthur Bales III is a strong believer in face-to-face service. Recently a coffee shop was opened on the premises. This was done by the business not in order to enter into the restaurant industry, but to offer a convenient service to the customers who travel all the way to the shop. This adds to the personal touch. Arthur Bales coffee shop is now one of four coffee shops within a one kilometre radius of the shop. Furthermore, weekly knitting meetings were organised on Wednesdays to facilitate socialising and the practising of hobbies. The family store thus facilitates social connections and assists customers to stay in touch with their friends and people from the community in a safe and hospitable environment.112

Conclusion

Family businesses currently constitute a very important part of South Africa’s economy. In this respect the South African business environment is no different from that in the rest of the world. Family businesses have created a sustainable livelihood for a notable proportion of society since the onset of industrialisation. Through the creation of employment, family businesses have contributed to wealth-creation, community development and social cohesion. The Arthur Bales business is a family business which can best be described as the enterprise of a business family. The founder, Arthur Bales I, owned or possessed resources such as business expertise, knowledge and personal attributes such as commitment, habits, and connections which made the business a success. These ‘resources’ were partially transferred to his successor, but since his death was unexpected, full transfer was impossible. The family business was a tangible asset to transfer, but personal attributes were intangible and non-transferable. The involvement of many family members after his death functioned as a nurturing process to rebuild the business capacity in the enterprise. This was a period of asset restructuring and business perpetuation for the purpose of securing family subsistence. When Arthur Bales II returned from London, he participated with his mother and sister in reconstructing the entrepreneurial assets of the enterprise. By the next generation of Arthur Bales III, the business family had taken shape. Relationships in the family and in the business seemed calm and focused. Opportunities were left open to siblings to pursue careers inside or outside the family business, but generation three and four joined the enterprise voluntarily. This generation had a choice – pursue careers outside the family enterprise or join the family firm.

Opportunities existed outside the firm, but they were less attractive than the family enterprise. The history of the 107-year-old family business is a remarkable example of perpetual reinvestment of acquired family business assets in the firm, and this has secured the sustainability of the enterprise.

No evidence was found of serious differences in the Bales family about the strategy, direction or management of the firm. Management was almost always inclusive, roping many direct and non-direct family members into the enterprise. In the geographical location of the remaining shop, the enterprise has developed a strong identity and nurtured loyalty amongst customers, community and family. This family business is a good example of a complex interaction of family, business and society. Its longevity can be explained by the strong inclusiveness of the Bales family, as well as the freedom given to family members to choose their association.
Abstract

Over the past decades many countries experimented with the Outcomes-Based Education (OBE) model. OBE was often accepted as a curriculum alternative when international curriculum transformation took place in various parts of the world. One possible reason for adopting and phasing in an OBE-approach may be attributed to the fact that the traditional curriculum did not meet the demands of a post-modernist world. The twofold purpose of this article is firstly, to offer a synoptic international-historical perspective on the establishment and course of implementation of OBE in four of the foremost implementers thereof, namely the USA, England, Australia and New Zealand and secondly, to focus on the influence of OBE on the teaching and learning of History in these countries. In a follow-up article (as Part 2), the particular influence that these international OBE History curriculum frameworks had on the teaching and learning of History in South Africa, will be investigated. Furthermore the general impact that OBE had on History education in South Africa, will be examined.

One of the main conclusions with respect to this article is that, to a great extent, patterns of parallel similarities exist regarding the origin, establishment and impact of the OBE-model in all the countries discussed. For example, the quality of traditional education curricula had been questioned in most of these countries when doubt manifested in the ruling parties about the ability of the country to hold its own within a globally competitive economy. To ensure economic superiority a more competent and well trained labour force was
considered as indispensable. Education was considered the key to economic growth and it thus had to develop certain knowledge, competencies and skills in learners in order for them to be able to think and act in a creative and problem-solving manner. During the initial implementation phase of the OBE-curriculum there were also more visible similarities than differences among the above-mentioned countries. The idea of curriculum transformation was an acceptable education practice for most educators. Common implementation obstacles were also experienced by most educators. For example, the excessive emphasis on learning outcomes contributed to cumbersome, time consuming and complicated assessment practices. This greatly increased the workload of the educator who tried to implement the OBE-model despite a lack of both adequate in-service training and quality teaching and learning support material. Strong centralised government interference was another common denominator in most of the countries where OBE had been introduced and this posed a particular threat to the autonomy and future of History in the school curriculum.

**Keywords**: History teaching; Schools; OBE; International perspective; Curriculum; Post-modernism.

---

**Inleiding**

Oor die afgelope dekades heen het baie lande regoor die wêreld met die UGO-model geëksperimenteer. Dit is klaarblyklik as ‘n alternatief vir die tradisionele onderwyskurrikulum aanvaar wat nie meer aan die eise van die post-modernistiese wêreld voldoen het nie. Die post-modernisme word gekenmerk deur konstante mobiliteit en verandering en vereis van skoolverlaters om oor die kennis, bekwaamhede en vaardighede te beskik om kreatief en probleemoplossend te kan dink en doen deur voortdurend

---


toepaslike en nuttige kennis te rekonstrueer om by ‘n bepaalde situasie aan te pas.³

Die tweeledige doel met dié artikel is om eerstens ‘n beknopte internasionaal-historiese perspektief te bied op die ontstaan, verloop en gevolge van UGO in die VSA, Engeland, Australië en Nieu-Seeland, en tweedens kortliks te fokus op die gevolge wat UGO op die onderrig en leer van Geskiedenis in hierdie lande gehad het. In ‘n opvolgartikel⁴ sal die besonderse invloed wat die oorsese UGO-kurrikulumraamwerke op Geskiedenis ter plaatse gehad het, verder bespreek word en sal daar ook gefokus word op die uitwerking wat UGO op die onderrig en leer van Geskiedenis in SA gehad het.

Uitkomsgebaseerde Onderwys (UGO) in internasionale verband: ‘n Historiese oorsig

Oor die afgelope drie dekades heen is die UGO-model dikwels as ‘n universele alternatief voorgestel wanneer kurrikulumhervorming internasionaal plaasgevind het.⁵

Vervolgens sal kortliks gelet word op die gemeenskaplike redes wat daartoe aanleiding gegee het dat UGO in die lande van die VSA, Engeland, Australië, en Nieu-Seeland aangeneem is. Voorts sal op die implementering van hierdie model gewys word asook die gevolge wat dit daarna vir elke land afsonderlik ingehou het.

Die aanname van die UGO-model

Die oproep vir die herstrukturering van die tradisionele onderwyskuraakulum in die oorsese lande onder bespreek het almal reeds in die 1980’s begin toe kommer in nasionale onderwysverslae en -besprekingsdokumente uitgespreek

⁴ Kyk Deel Twee in New Contree, 59, Mei 2010.
is oor die algemene gehalte en relevantheid van hulle kurrikulums. Ten einde ekonomiese vordering te verseker, en om internasionaal selfgeland en mededingend te kan bly, is ‘n meer bekwame en beter opgeleide arbeidsmag vereis. Die kritiek wat teen die kurrikulum uitgespreek is, het daartoe bygedra dat druk op politici en beleidmakers in die onderskeie wêrelddele uitgeoefen is om op ‘n gereelde gronddag hervormingsinisiatiewe te loods om die administrasie en die kurrikulum van skoolonderwys te transformeer. Die gevolg hiervan was wetgewing wat sedert die laat tagtigerjare en vroeë negentigerjare aangeneem is, en nasionale beleidsdokumentasie wat verskyn het om struktuur te verleen aan die beginsels en praktyke van ‘n UGO-kurrikulumraamwerk.

In die VSA byvoorbeeld is die saadjie vir UGO alreeds in 1993 geplaat met die verskyning van die *Nation at Risk* verslag waarin kommer uitgespreek is oor die algemene gehalte van die onderwys. Dit is opgevolg met die *Goals 2000: Educate America Act* van 1994, die *Educational Excellence for all Children Act* van 1999, en later ook die *No Child Left Behind*-wetgewing van 2002 wat almal vormend ingewerk het op die uitbouing en vestiging van ‘n UGO-benadering. Die uitskerming het verskyn in Engeland en Wallis in September 1989. In Australië het die *National Statements en Profiles* wat in 1993 verskyn het, UGO ‘n praktiese

---


werklikheid in die skole gemaak. In Nieu-Seeland berus UGO op die Curriculum Framework wat in 1993 bekend gestel is en ooreenkomst met die kurrikulumraamwerke van Engeland en Wallis en Australië toon.

Van die UGO-model is verwag om nuwe lewe te blaas in ‘n uitgedieende onderwyskurrikulum. Dit het onder meer opvoedkundige doelwitte/uitkomste/standaarde gestel wat verbeterde leerresultate sou verseker. Die klem het geval op die bereiking van hoë akademiese prestasie-uitsette in kennis, vaardighede, houdings, begrip en waardes as die eindresultaat van leer. Demonstrasies van hierdie leeruitkomste sou ‘n meer bekwame en beter opgeleide arbeidsmag verseker wat op sy beurt weer ekonomiese groei en voortuitgang in ‘n sterk kompeteterende wêreldekonomie sou waarborg. In belang van kwaliteitsversekering is aanspreeklikheid van skole geëis in die sin dat hulle deur middel van toenemende statutêre nasionale assessoring bewys sal moet kan lewer van dit wat bereik is.

**Die implementering van die UGO-model**

Die aanvanklike implementering van die UGO-model het gemengde reaksie by die onderwysers, as die primêre implementeerders van die kurrikulum, uitgelok. Sommige het dit as ‘n positiewe stap in die regte rigting beskou omdat die voorskrifte van die kurrikulum in die algemeen beter verfyn en meer gedefinieer was. Dit is as voordelig beleef omdat dit bygedra

---


het tot ‘n gemeenskaplike en sistematiese benadering ten opsigte van die beplanning van leerprogramme en die rapportering van leerderprestatie. Verder is positief gerapporteer oor die groter mate van erkenning wat dit aan onderwyserprofessionaliteit verleen het asook die groter klem wat dit geplaas het op die erkenning van die individuele leerder wat toegelaat word om teen sy eie tempo te kan ontwikkel in die bereiking van die leeruitkomste.

Sommige onderwysers het hulle weer van UGO gedistansieer deur te weier om enige aanpassings te maak ten opsigte van hulle tradisionele manier van onderrig gee. Vir hierdie onderwysers was die impak van die kurrikulumhervorming buitengewoon radikaal. Alle kurrikulumdokumentasie het drasties verskil met betrekking tot fokus en formaat van dit waaraan hulle gewoond was. Nuwe terme soos leeruitkomste was vreemd en die eksterne assessoringswyse waardeur skole se spreeklikheid bepaal is met betrekking tot die mate waarin die leerresultate behaal is, was vir baie ‘n negatiewe ervaring wat as indoktrinerend en angsvol beleef is. Hierdie onderwysers was van mening dat die gedurige bewyslewering van hulle leerders se resultate hul professionele oordeel en autonomie aangetas het.

Die vernaamste kritiek van die onderwysers in die oorsese lande ter sprake teen die nuwe onderwysmodel, was:

- ‘n gebrek aan toereikende en deeglike opleiding om die kurrikulum in doeltreffende onderwyspraktyk te omskep;
- tydrowende en omslagtige assessoringsprosedures en -praktyke wat bygedra het


Uitkomsgebaseerde Onderwys (UGO) op Geskiedenis as skoolvak in Suid-Afrika

tot ’n verhoogde werklading;

• die gebrek aan genoegsame hoë gehalte onderrig- en leersteunmiddele wat kon meehelp om die kurrikulum doeltreffend af te lever;

• die oorbeklemtoning van die leeruitkomste wat ten alle koste geassesseer en bereik moet word.20

Benewens die onderwysers het akademici, opvoedkundiges, ouers en ander onderwysbelanghebbendes ook nie geskroom om die nuwe onderwysmodel te kritiseer nie.21 In Australië byvoorbeeld, het akademici gegrief gevoel omdat hulle nie in die kurrikulumhervormingsprosesse geken is nie. Hulle was van mening dat die onderwysowerhede nie geleenthede vir konsultasie en mede-inspraak geskep het nie. Om hierdie rede is die meriete van sommige van die onderwyshervormings wat deurgevoer is, bevraagteken en is die oortuiging uitgespreek dat UGO tot ’n verlaging van standaarde sou lei.22 Sommige opvoedkundiges het hierby aansluiting gevind en UGO as ’n “mile wide and inch deep” benadering beskryf wat nie werkelik daarin kon slaag om leerders in die basiese vaardighede van skoolonderwys te onderlê nie.23 In Engeland het die die verteenwoordigende ouerorganisasie genaamd die Campaign for State


Education (CASE) gereeld hulle stem in die debatte oor onderwyssake laat hoor. Op hulle beurt het die ouers in die staat van Nieu-Suid Wallis in Australië verklaar dat hulle oorwegig vol deur die taal en omvang van UGO wat veroorsaak het dat hulle dit moeilik vind om te verstaan wat hulle kinders werkelik geleer het wanneer die leerresultate gerapporteer word. In die VSA het fundamentalistiese Christen-groepe ook hulle belang by die nuwe onderwysmodel getoon. Hulle was bekommerd oor die moontlike indoktrinasie van leerders met sosiale, politieke en ekonomiese waardes wat in direkte teenstelling met die Christelike beginsels staan.

Die gevolge na die implementering van die UGO-model

Die teenstand wat opgevlam het na die aanvanklike implementering van die UGO-model, het daartoe bygedra dat dit deurlopend hersien is, of selfs helemaal laat vaar is.

UGO in Engeland het in 1993 ‘n eerste hersiening ondergaan wat blyk die algemene steun van beide diegene in die onderwysprofessie sowel as die ouers geniet het. In 2007, na konsultasie met onderwysers, ouers, akademici en ander onderwysroolspelers, is die kurrikulum weer eens hersien. Die hersiene kurrikulum, waarvan die besonderse aard en kenmerke in beginsel nie van die oorspronklike UGO-kurrikulumraamwerk verskil nie, is vanaf September 2008 in die sekondêre skole ingevoer. Hierdie kurrikulum wou meer geleenthede aan elke leerder voorsien om met die begeleiding en ondersteuning van die onderwyser na vermoëns te ontwikkel. Meer klem is gelê op die bereiking van doelwitte en die ontwikkeling van vaardighede. Aan onderwysers is ook meer vryheid gegee met betrekking tot die ontwerp

en aflowering van die kurrikulum ten einde voorsiening te maak vir die besonderse vermoëns en behoeftes van die leerders.\textsuperscript{30}

In die geval van Nieu-Seeland is die UGO-kurrikulum sedert 2003 op ’n sistematiese wyse aan hersiening onderwerp.\textsuperscript{31} Die voorgestelde hersienings is in ’n konsepdokument getiteld: \textit{The New Zealand Curriculum: Draft for Consultation 2006} vervat wat op 21 Julie van dieselfde jaar vrygestel is.\textsuperscript{32} Nadat die ingewagte kommentaar op hierdie dokument ontvang en verwerk is, is dit aan die einde van 2007 in wetgewing vangê. Van onderwysers word verwag om hierdie hersiene kurrikulum teen 2010 in hulle skole in te voer.\textsuperscript{33} Die hersiening van die kurrikulum het nie die oorspronklike UGO onderbou daarvan verander nie. Dit het eerder die kurrikulum vereenvoudig en meer gebruikersvriendelik vir die onderwysers gemaak wat nou, soos in die geval van Engeland, meer vryhede kon uitoefen wanneer hulle die kurrikulum sou implementeer.\textsuperscript{34}

Waar die implementering van UGO in die VSA aanvanklik vinnig veld gewen het in 1992-1993,\textsuperscript{35} is dit in 1994 in die invloedryke onderwystydskrif, \textit{The School Administrator}, as die “dirtiest word in school reform” afgemaak.\textsuperscript{36} In die plek daarvan is Standaardgebaseerde Onderwys (SBO)\textsuperscript{37} aangeneem

\begin{itemize}
  \item \textsuperscript{36} A Dykman, “Fighting Words”, \textit{Vocational Educational Journal}, 69(8), November/December 1994, pp. 36-39.
\end{itemize}
wat teen 2003 alreeds gevestig was in al die state van die VSA se openbare skole.38

In Australië is die nuutgestigte Nasionale Kurrikulumraad sedert die middel van 2008 in die proses om ‘n nasionale kurrikulum vir die ses state en twee gebiede te ontwerp. Dit is ‘n poging van die federale regering om meer sentrale beheer oor die kurrikulum te verkry. ‘n Nasionale kurrikulum sou nie net tot ‘n verbeterde kurrikulumkoherensie bydra nie, maar ook die state/gebiede se grondwetlike aanspraak dat skoolonderwys ‘n eie aangeleentheid is wat self bestuur mag word in ‘n groot mate inkort. Die nasionale kurrikulum, wat volgens sommige onderwyskundiges die SBO-model gaan navol, sal eers ontwerp word vir die vakke Engels, Wiskunde, Geskiedenis en Wetenskap waarna dit aan die begin van 2011 in die skole ingevoer sal word.39

Die uitwerking van UGO/SBO op die onderrig en leer van Geskiedenis

Die UGO/SBO-model het die onderrig en leer van Geskiedenis in elk van die oorsese lande onder bespreking op verskillende wyses beïnvloed.

Die VSA

In enkele van die 50 Amerikaanse state word Geskiedenis as ‘n aparte dissipline in veral die sekondêre skoolfase aangebied.40 In die meeste state vorm Geskiedenis deel van Sosiale Studies as ‘n multi-dissipline41 waar dit meestal as die dominante dissipline gerekend word.42 Geskiedenisonderwysers word aangemoedig om eers die standaarde van die kurrikulumraamwerk van die Sosiale Studies as ‘n riglyn te raadpleeg alvorens die Geskiedenisstandaarde

die meer gefokusde en gevorderde inhoudbesonderhede toevoeg.\textsuperscript{43} Vanweë die geïntegreerde verhouding met Sosiale Studies is dit dikwels moeilik om die uitwerking van die Geskiedenisstandaarde in die onderskeie state te beoordeel.\textsuperscript{44}

Gedurende die 1990’s is ‘n taakspan aangestel wat begin het met die ontwerp van nasionale standaarde vir Geskiedenis as deel van die Sosiale Studies dissipline.\textsuperscript{45} Van meet af was die nasionale standaarde vir Geskiedenis in groot omstredenheid gehul. Dit was as gevolg van verskille wat ontstaan het tussen die minderheidsgroepe aan die een kant en die konserwatiewes aan die ander kant oor presies watter inhoud daarin vervat moet word. Hierdie verskille het mettertyd na die politieke arena uitgekring waar die Senaat in Januarie 1995 ‘n resolusie aanvaar het wat die Geskiedenisstandaarde met 99 stemme teenoor een afgekeur het. Hierna is die nasionale standaarde tussen November 1995 en Februarie 1996 hersien en later in dieselfde jaar weer uitgereik.\textsuperscript{46}

Die kwaliteit van die hersiene nasionale standaarde het volgens sommige historici die onderrig en leer van Geskiedenis negatief beïnvloed. Hierdie historici het die afwesigheid van genoegsame historiese inhoud daarin veroordeel wat daartoe sou bydra dat onderwysers en leerders nie ‘n deeglike en deurdagte onderrig- en leerbenadering in Geskiedenis kon volg nie.\textsuperscript{47} Daarby was die nasionale standaarde vaag bewoord en het dit te veel inligting bevat wat meegebring het dat daar geen tyd oorbly om geskiedenisonderwerpe indringend te behandel nie.\textsuperscript{48} In die proses het nie net belangrike inhoudskennis


verlore gegaan nie, maar is die doeltreffende onderrig van sekere historiese vaardighede ook aan bande gelê.\textsuperscript{49}

Met die Nasionale Geskiedenisstandaarde as riglyn, is van elke Staat verwag om sy eie standaarde in Geskiedenis en die Sosiale Studies te ontwerp. In 2003 was daar reeds 32 state in die VSA wat Geskiedenis as dissipline erken het (hetsy as deel van die Sosiale Studies of as ‘n onafhanklike dissipline) en waarvoor daar inhoudstandaarde ontwerp is.\textsuperscript{50}

Soos in die geval met die nasionale standaarde, was die kwaliteit van die Geskiedenisstandaarde in die meeste van die state ook nie na wense nie. Tekortkominge binne die kurrikulumfokus met betrekking tot ‘n uitgebreide historiese inhoud, duidelikheid, opeenvolgende ontwikkeling, historiese ewewig en diepgang was aan die orde.\textsuperscript{51} Hierdie tekortkominge het daartoe aanleiding gegee dat historici en onderwysers die geskiedenisstandaarde in hulle betrokke state as negatief beleef het. Algaande was onder onderwysers die gevoel dat die standaarde te hoë verwagtinge skep; dit inhoudelike gebreke toon; oppervlakkig en vaag omskryf is en dat dit ook nie altyd prakties uitvoerbaar was nie. Gevolglik kon deur middel van hierdie standaarde nie daarin geslaag word om onderwysers en leerders toe te rus met die vaardighede wat vereis word om historiese samehang te verstaan asook om historiese denke te bemeester nie.\textsuperscript{52} Boonop is die effektiewe implementering van die geskiedenis-standaarde aan bande gelê deur ‘n groot aantal onderwysers (53\% in 1998) wat Geskiedenis in die sekondêre skole aangebied het, maar glad nie oor die kwalifikasies daarvoor beskik nie.\textsuperscript{53}

Die uitwerking van die \textit{No Child Left Behind}-wetgewing van 2002 waarna vroeër verwys is, het ook die assessoring van die Geskiedenisstandaarde

\begin{thebibliography}{9}
\item[{\textsuperscript{49}}] LC De Oliveira, “History Doesn't Count”: Challenges of Teaching History in California Schools”, \textit{History Teacher}, 41(3), May 2008, pp. 373-374.
\end{thebibliography}

194
Uitkomsgebaseerde Onderwys (UGO) op Geskiedenis as skoolvak in Suid-Afrika

onbewus negatief beïnvloed. Volgens hierdie Wet is state nie meer deur die federale regering verplig om die Geskiedenisstandaarde ekstern te laat assesseer nie. Dit het meegebring dat 'n aantal state die eksterne assessorings in Sosiale Studies afgeskaf het. Die feit dat die Geskiedenisstandaarde nie meer eksterm getoets is nie, het verder daartoe bygedra dat 'n beduidende aantal state sedert 2002 die tyd wat in die elementêre en middelste fase aan Sosiale Studies toebedeel is, ingekort het. Skole het besluit om eerder meer tyd aan daardie vakke af te staan wat ekstern geassesseer word omdat die resultate daarvan die aanspreeklikheid van hulle skole bepaal het.

Die afskaffing van die eksterne assessoringsprogram; die afskaling van klastyd en die swak kwalifikasies van onderwysers het alles daartoe bygedra dat die vrees ontstaan het dat dit tot 'n marginalisering van Geskiedenis en Sosiale Studies in die skoolkurrikulum kan lei. Hierdie vrees is in 'n groot mate besweer toe daar sedert 2001 verskillende inisiatiewe van regeringskant van stapel gestuur is om die inhoudstandaarde in Geskiedenis te verbeter. Een so 'n inisiatief was 'n groot geldelike inspuiting wat die Geskiedenisdepartement in die VSA van die federale regering ontvang het. Hierdie geld moes aangewend word om die onderrig en leer van die Amerikaanse geskiedenis te verbeter "not as a component of the social studies". Hierdie finansiële toegewings wat oor driejaar-periodes heen aan skole toegedeel is, moet gesien word teen die agtergrond van die toenemende kommer wat bestaan het oor die gebrekkige inhoud wat Amerikaanse leerders in die algemeen openbaar het ten opsigte van hul eie geskiedenis.

Sedert die einde van 2006 is ook na maniere gekyk van hoe die VSA meer gesentraliseer kan om die nasionale standaarde in elk van die 50 state se openbare skole te vestig. Dit mag beteken dat elke staat sy outonome reg sal verloor om, in ooreenstemming met die nasionale standaarde, sy eie standaarde te ontwerp. Uniforme nasionale Geskiedenisstandaarde in die

VSA behoort by te dra tot die verbetering in gehalte daarvan wat op sy beurt die onderrig en leer van Geskiedenis positief kan beïnvloed.

**Engeland**

In 1989 is 'n Geskiedeniswerkgroep vir Engeland en 'n Geskiedeniskomitee vir Wallis saamgestel om 'n nuwe nasionale uitkomsgebaseerde kurrikulum vir Geskiedenis te ontwerp. Met die bekendmaking van hulle interimverslae oor 'n voorgestelde Geskiedeniskurrikulum het dit meer debat in die media ontlok as enige ander vak in die Nasionale Kurrikulum. Die debatspunte het hoofsaaklik gehandel oor die inhoudsbenadering versus die vaardighedsbenadering en 'n oproep om 'n tipe geskiedenis daar te stel wat 'n meer nasionale "Britishness" sou voorstaan.60 Daar is ook op direkte wyse deur die regering, en spesifiek die Eerste Minister, mevrou Margaret Thatcher van die Konserwatiewe Party, ingemeng om te verseker dat inhoud sy regmatige deel in die kurrikulum sou verkry. Op hierdie wyse is verseker dat Geskiedenisleerders genoegsaam inhoudelike feitekennis van die Britse geskiedenis opdoen.61

Die finale verslae van die werkgroep en komitee is in 1990 gepubliseer62 en die daaropvolgende jaar vir die eerste keer as die uitkomsgebaseerde kurrikulum in die skole geïmplementeer.63 Dit blyk 'n positiewe uitwerking gehad het op die onderrig en leer van Geskiedenis soos bewys uit die redelike groot mate van gewildheid wat Geskiedenis as vak onder die leerders geniet het. Leerders in die ouderdomsgroepe 11-19 jaar het dit in 2005 byvoorbeeld sesde op die rangordelys van gewildheid geplaas. Van die redes wat aangevoer is waarom die vak soveel status geniet, staan in noue verband met die bepaalde UGO-metodologie van aktiwiteitgebaseerde onderrig. Ten opsigte hiervan het leerders gerapporteer dat hulle die "aktiewe" lesse geniet waar hulle toegelaat word om gesprekke te voer, voordragte te lever, groepwerk te doen en drama of rolspel op te voer. Die gebruik van leer- en onderrigsteunmiddele soos die video en Inligting- en Kommunikasietegnologie (IKT) is ook geïdentifiseer as

---


bykomende faktore wat Geskiedenis 'n genotvolle vak gemaak het.  

Benewens die positiwe tendense wat deur die leerders gerapporteer is, het die Geskiedenisonderwysers enkele hindernisse in die implementering van die UGO-model ervaar. Sommige van die onderwysers in die laer sekondêre skoolfase en vernaamlik in die sleutelfase 3-kurrikulum (ouderdom 11-14), het gevoel dat hulle nie genoegsame onderrigtyd gegun word om die leerprogramme af te handel nie. Dit word onder meer toegeskryf aan al hoe meer nuwe vakke wat begin het om deel van die kurrikulum uit te maak waarvoor daar plek en tyd op die skoolrooster ingeruim moes word.

Gepaard met aspekte soos historiese interpretasie en chronologiese begrip het van die onderwysers ook aangedui dat hulle dit moeilik gevind het om bepaalde tydspasifieke onderwerpe binne die leerprogramme te onderrig en te leer. Baie van die onderwysers het die leerprogramme nog as 'n sillabus hanteer, eerder as 'n kurrikulumraamwerk. In baie gevalle het dit daartoe bygedra dat die Geskiedeniskurrikulum verskraal is, met die gevolg dat die leerprogramme op 'n inkonsekwente wyse ingekort is. Dit is byvoorbeeld gedoen deur hoofsaaklik klem te lê op die ontwikkeling van leerders se in-diepte-kennis van spesifieke onderwerpe ten koste van 'n historiese oorsig wat aan leerders die geleentheid sou bied om koppelinge te maak tussen die verskillende historiese gebeure en periodes en hoe dit oor tyd heen verander het. As redes vir hierdie kleitrappery is onder andere aangevoer die gebrek aan vakkundigheid by onderwysers en onderrigtyd wat nie as genoegsaam beskou is nie.

Onderwysers het ook probleme ervaar met uitkomsgebaseerde assessering. Sommige het dit moeilik gevind om die vlakbeskrywers, wat die verwagte

---

leerderprestasie beskryf, te interpreteer en as werkbare assessoringskriteria te implementeer. Ander was weer van mening dat die vlakbeskrywers te moeilik vir die leerders was om te bereik. Om hierdie probleem hok te slaan het sommige skole dit herskryf. Die herskryf van die vlakbeskrywers en die onderverdeling daarvan in verdere subvlakke het meegebring dat die gehalte van die assessoring van skole onderling verskil het. Die onvermoë om historiese interpretasie en bronne-analise by leerders in die oudersgroep 14-19 deeglik te asseesseer, is ander probleme wat onderwysers teen 2005 ervaar het.

Die uitkomsgebaseerde aard van die Geskiedeniskurrikulum is ook in die Engelse media afgemaak as synde te eng en onsamehangend. Beswaardes was daarvan oortuig dat historiese vaardighede oorbeklemtoon word ten koste van 'n meer inhoudgerigte, feitelike kurrikulum waar die vertel- of verhaalmetode nie tot sy reg gekom het nie. Dit het die ou vete wat reeds sedert 1960 bestaan het tussen die aanhangers van die "nuwe" Geskiedenis in skole wat die vaardigheidsgebaseerde benadering ondersteun hou en die aanhangers van die "acts and facts" wat weer die feitelike benadering beklemtoon het, opnuut weer laat ontvlam.

In die naam van groter "buigsaamheid en samehang" is die nasionale kurrikulum vanaf 2007 aangepas. Hierdie veranderinge is sedert September 2008 op progressiewe wyse in die Geskiedenisklaskamers ingevoer en verlang onder meer dat 'n balans gehandhaaf moet word tussen die inhoudelike kennis

---

en prosesse wat daarop gemik is om historiese vaardighede te ontwikkel.77

Australië

Met die implementering van UGO in die laat 1980's in Australië is die status van Geskiedenis verander toe Sosiale Studies (waarvan Geskiedenis deel was) en Omgewingstudies gekonsolideer is in 'n enkele generiese kernleerarea wat algemeen bekend gestaan het as Samelewings- en Omgewingstudies. Hierdie leerarea het tot 200778 betrekking gehad op die verpligte skooljare (Jare 1-10) en sluit die dissiplines Geskiedenis, Geografie, Letterkunde, Staatkunde en ander vakke in die Geestes- en Sosiale Wetenskappe in.79 Samelewings- en Omgewingstudies is in al die state, behalwe in Nieu-Suid Wallis en Victoria ingevoer wat verkies het om 'n vakgebaseerde benadering in die sekondêre skole te volg.80

Die bykans nasionale aanneming van die kernleerarea Samelewings- en Omgewingstudies het aanleiding gegee tot groot ontevredenheid by Geskiedenisonderwysers, onderwysersverenigings en akademiese historici. Hulle het aangevoer dat die totstandkoming van hierdie leerarea verantwoordelik was vir die agteruitgang van Geskiedenis soos bewys in die afname van die getal leerders wat dit in die senior sekondêre fase as vak geneem het. Etlike beswaardes het geagiteer vir 'n nasionale regeringsondersoek na die stand van Geskiedenis in skole.81

Feitlik tien jaar na die implementering van UGO in Australië en die gevolglike totstandkoming van die kernleerarea Samelewings- en Omgewingstudies, het die federale regering in 1999 die National Inquiry into School History

78 Vergelyk die inhoud by voetnote 92 en 93.
afgekondig. Dit moes die status en aard van skoolgeskiedenis in Australië ondersoek. In 2000 is 'n verslag uitgebring wat as The Future of the Past bekend gestaan het.\(^{82}\)

Hierdie verslag het bevind dat in die onderrig en leer van Geskiedenis 'n diskrepansie bestaan tussen dit wat die onderwysdepartemente van onderwysers verwag om te onderrig (die voorgeskrewe kurrikulum), en dit wat werkelik deur die onderwysers in die klaskamer onderrig word. Dit het die assessoring van Geskiedenis in die besonder geraak. Waar onderwysers, veral in die geval van die leerarea, probleme met die aflowering van die voorgeskrewe kurrikulum ervaar het (soms as gevolg van die gebrek aan ondersteuning deur die onderwysdepartemente), het hulle op 'n ondermynende wyse teruggeval op dit wat hulle altyd onderrig het, of dit wat hulle wou onderrig. Spesifieke kurrikuluminstruksies word dus verontagsaam, wat beteken dat die assessoringsmeganismes wat moet bepaal of die leeruitkomste bereik is, nooit aandag geniet het nie.\(^{83}\)

Die doeltreffende uitvoer van UGO in die Geskiedenisklaskamer is ook gekortwiek deur die groot aantal onderwysers wat, ten spyte van die feit dat hulle nie oor die toereikende agtergrond of opleiding beskik het nie, steeds die vak in die leerarea Samelewing- en Omgewingstudies aangebied het. Besorgdheid het ook bestaan oor die gehalte van nuutopgelei de primêre en sekondêre onderwysers weens hulle klaarblyklike gebrekkige kennis van die vak Geskiedenis. Die probleme wat rondom die opleiding van Geskiedenisonderwysers ervaar is, het veroorsaak dat baie leerders hul primêre skole oningelig en onseker verlaat het ten opsigte van wat die werklike aard van Geskiedenis behels.\(^{84}\)

Benewens 'n gebrek aan volgehoue en uitgebreide professionele opleiding kon Geskiedenisonderwysers hulle ook nie instudeer oor nuwe ontwikkelinge

---


van die uitkomsgebaseerde onderrig- en leergebeure in die klaskamer nie. Deels as gevolg van die prominensie wat aan die leerarea Samelewing- en Omgewingstudies verleen is, is daar weinig debat gevoer of navorsing gedoen oor die onderrig en leer van skoolgeskiedenis in Australië. So is daar byvoorbeeld sedert 1977 tot 2001 nie 'n enkele boek gepubliseer wat oor die onderrig en leer van Geskiedenis gehandel het nie.85 'n Verdere faktor wat die doeltreffende aflowering van UGO in die Geskiedenisklas beperk het, was die gebrek aan opgedateerde onderrig- en leersteunmiddele.86

Die negatiewe impak wat UGO op die marginalisering en voortbestaan van Geskiedenis as 'n toekomstige vak gehad het toe dit deel van die leerarea Samelewing- en Omgewingstudies geword het, het daartoe bygedra dat eenstemmigheid in die meeste sekondêre skole bestaan het dat skoolgeskiedenis in 'n staat van beleg was en geleidelik besig was om uit die klaskamers te verdwyn.87

Soos in die geval van die VSA, het Geskiedenis se geleidelike afname sedert die 1990's op die gewildheidsleër van vakkeuses die aandag van die federale regering op direkte wyse betrek.88 Op 25 Januarie 2006 het die Australiese Eerste Minister, John Howard, 'n nasionale oproep gedoen vir 'n "root and branch" hernuwing in die onderrig en leer van Geskiedenis ten einde die kwynende belangstelling in die vak te stuit. Die Eerste Minister het sy kommer uitgespreek oor die feit dat slegs een uit elke vier senior sekondêre leerders Geskiedenis as vak geneem het en ook net 'n gedeelte van die kurrikuluminhoud oor die Australiese geskiedenis gehandel het.89 Ses maande later het die federale Minister van Onderwys, Wetenskap en Opleiding, me Julie Bishop, op die wekroep van Howard reageer deur vir 'n "renaissance" in die onderrig en leer van Geskiedenis in die primêre en sekondêre skole te bepleit. Sy het dit as noodsaklik beskou dat leerders oor uitgebreide historiese kennisinhoud moet beskik wat ryk aan datums, feite en gebeure is

waaruit leerders hul eie menings oor die verlede kon vorm. Chronologie en die verhaalmetode is ook deur haar as noodsaklike elemente in die onderrig en leer van Geskiedenis beskou.90

Die onderrig en leer van Geskiedenis in skole is op 'n spits gedryf toe 'n daglange beraad op 17 Augustus 2006 in Canberra gehou is. Dit is bygewoon deur vooraanstaande Australiese historici, sosiale kommentators, onderwysleiers, kurrikulum-kenners en onderwyser.91 Voortspruitend uit hierdie beraad is die *Australian History Curriculum Reference Group* in Junie 2007 aangewys. Aan hierdie groep is die opdrag gegee om 'n modelkurrikulum te ontwikkels vir die onderrig en leer van Geskiedenis vir die Jare 9 en 10.92 Op 11 Oktober het hierdie groep hulle taak voltooi en Eerste Minister Howard het die *Guide to the Teaching of Australian History in Years 9 and 10* vrygestel. Dit het die doelwitte wat met die onderrig en leer van Australiese Geskiedenis verbesonder asook die inhoud wat bestudeer moet word en die vaardighede wat ontwikkel moet word, gespesifiseer. Met die bekendstelling van hierdie handleiding het Geskiedenis nou die status van 'n selfstandige vak in die sekondêre skooljare 9 en 10 geniet. Dit het beteken dat dit nie meer deel van die leerarea Samelewing- en Omgewingstudies uitgemaak het nie.93

Aan die einde van 2007 het die Federale Arbeidersparty van Kevin Rudd die Howardregering vervang. Die Ruddregering volg 'n hoogs gesentraliseerde en бюrokratiese benadering teenoor onderwys in 'n poging om die state en gebiede se outonome beheer oor hulle onderwyssake te beëindig.94 Met minder as die helfte van die state en gebiede se inhoud wat ten opsigte van

---

die Australiese geskiedenis ooreengestem het.\textsuperscript{95} is daar in Augustus 2008 begin om aan 'n nasionale kurrikulum vir Geskiedenis te werk.\textsuperscript{96}

Die nasionale konsepkurrikulum vir Geskiedenis sal teen die begin van 2010 vrygestel word vir openbare kommentaar vir beoogde implementering aan die begin van 2011.\textsuperscript{97}

\section*{Nieu-Seeland}

Soos in die geval van die VSA, het Geskiedenisonderrig in Nieu-Seeland, jare lank deel uitgemaak van die Sosiale Studies-kurrikulum. In die nuwe UGO \textit{Curriculum Framework} van 1993 is Sosiale Wetenskappe (en nie Sosiale Studies nie) as een van die sewe kernleerareas gespesifiseer.\textsuperscript{98} Die Sosiale Studies kurrikulum, wat in 1997 gepubliseer is, het egter in die primêre en junior sekondêre fase (Jare 1-10) bly voortleef binne die sambreelleerarea Sosiale Wetenskappe.\textsuperscript{99} In die senior sekondêre fase (Jare 11-13) geniet Sosiale Studies sedert 2003 selfstandige status\textsuperscript{100} en is 'n opsie wat saam met Geskiedenis, Geografie en Ekonomie in hierdie fase uitgeoefen kan word.\textsuperscript{101}

Die uitwerking van die UGO-kurrikulum binne die raamwerk van die Sosiale Studies is op positiewe wyse deur die onderwysers beleef waar hulle die ontwikkeling van leeraktiwiteite rondom kurrikulumaspekte soos prestatiesdoelwitte/-standaarde, leeruitkomste en vaardighede as 'n uitdaging gesien het. Dit het na hul mening die onderwerpe wat behandel is relevant, interessant en betekenisvol gemaak.

Ten spyte van hierdie positiewe ingesteldheid was daar ook probleme wat die doeltreffende implementering van die nuwe kurrikulum aan bande gelê het.

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{98} H Lee, “Outcomes-Based Education...”, \textit{Education, Research and Perspectives}, 30(2), 2003, pp. 82-83.
\end{itemize}
In 2003 het baie onderwysers gekla dat hulle nie genoegsame tyd kon vind om alles wat in die kurrikulumverklaring van die Sosiale Studies aangedui is, te behandel nie. Ook het hulle gerapporteer dat daar 'n tekort aan leer- en onderrigsteunmiddele was, en in die besonder geskrewe bronne.102

Die UGO assesseringspraktyke is ook as problematies beleef. Die insameling van UGO-gerigte assesseringsdata van elke leerder was vir baie van die onderwysers 'n moeilike taak. Die meeste van hierdie onderwysers het slegs die leerders se kennis en begrip geassesseer. Min van hulle het werkelik die vermoë van die leerders geassesseer om hierdie kennis en die prosesvaardigheid wat geleer is, op ander/nuwe kontekste van toepassing te maak. Waar assesseringsinligting wel ingesamel is, was dit ook nie genoeg om die leerder se vordering teen die prestasiestandaarde te asesseer nie. Daar is nie op die bereiking van bepaalde vaardighede by die leerder gefokus nie – eerder op dít wat leerders van 'n besondere onderwerp kan onthou.

Die assesseringsinligting wat ingesamel is, was ook nie genoegsaam om onderwysers te ondersteun in hul beplanning en onderrig ten einde te verseker dat daar voortgebou word op die bestaande vaardighede en kennis van die leerders nie.

Ook was baie onderwysers nie bekwaam genoeg om leerderassesseringsinligting vir die assesser van hul eie klaskamerprogramme aan te wend nie. Formatiewe assessorings het ook nie tot sy reg gekom nie. Dikwels het mondelinge en skriftelike konstruktiewe kommentaar ontbreek wat noodsaaklik was vir die identifisering van opeenvolgende leerstappe ten einde leerdervordering te verseker.

By self- en maatassessering het baie onderwysers ook nie duidelike kriteria verstrek waarteen die assessorings moet plaasvind nie. Min leerders was ook bewus van die vordering wat hulle gemaak het, veral ten opsigte van die prosesvaardigheid. Op dié manier is lewenslange leer nooit werklik aangemoedig nie. Verslaggewing aan ouers oor die aard van die leerprogramme in Sosiale Studies; die mate van vordering wat hulle kinders gemaak het en die verwagtinge ten opsigte van die prestasie wat gelewer moet word, was ander aspekte van die kurrikulum waarin die onderwyser meer leiding nodig gehad het.

Minder as die helfte van die onderwyers was by professionele ontwikkelings-programme vir Sosiale Studies ingeskakel. Dit kan moontlik as 'n rede dien waarom baie van hulle nie oor die vermoe beskik het om programme van hoë gehalte te lever en toepaslike assessoringspraktyke te ontwikkel nie.\(^\text{103}\)

Die geskiedenisonderwyers van die senior sekondêre skoolfase (Jare 11-13) het ook probleme ervaar met die uitwerking van die UGO kurrikulum. Hulle was byvoorbeeld onseker oor watter inhoud in die eksterne eksamens geassesseer gaan word. Die kurrikulumbeleid wat veronderstel was om voorskrifte in hierdie verband te gee, het geblek ook nie aan die verwagtinge te voldoen nie. In 2006 is dit as 'n "baie dun dokument" beskryf wat bitter min inligting verstrekg het oor spesifiek watter geskiedenisinhoud onderrig moes word.

In die assessering van die eksterne eksamens van 2006 het sommige Geskiedenisonderwyers ook beswaard gevoel oor die onnodige hoë verwagtinge wat die prestasiestandaarde gestel het met die beantwoording van die opsteltipevrae. Diegene was ook van mening dat die vrae te eng met betrekking tot inhoud gefokus was. Kommer is uitgespreek oor die "oor-intellektualisering" van Geskiedenis waar die inhoudelike verhaalmetode nie sy regmatige plek teenoor die vaardigheidsbenadering verkry nie. 'n Pleidooi is gelewer dat daar by assessoring altyd gepoog moet word om 'n balans te handhaaf tussen inhoud en vaardigheid.\(^\text{104}\)

Die probleme wat in die algemeen rakende inhoud en die assessoringspraktyke ondervind is, het daartoe bygedra dat die Ministerie van Onderwys 'n Geskiedenisskryfgroep aan die einde van Maart 2007 in die lewe geroep het. Hierdie groep moes aanbevelings doen ten opsigte van hoe te werk gegaan kon word om die prestasiestandaarde in die sekondêre skoolfase aan te pas en te verfyn. Onderwyers sou ook die geleentheid gegee word om kommentaar te lever oor die toepaslikheid en inhoud van die voorgestelde aanbevelings vir die finalisering en implementering daarvan af 2008.\(^\text{105}\)

---


ook belyn met die hersiening van die nasionale UGO-kurrikulum, wat reeds na 2002 begin het, en waarvan die aanbevelings sedert 2007 op progressiewe wyse tot Februarie 2010 in die skole ingevoer sal word.106

_Samevatting_

Met hierdie bespreking is patrone van parallelle ooreenkomste uitgewys rakende die herkoms, vestiging en impak van die UGO-model wat vir die eerste keer vanaf die laat 1980’s in die vier ontwikkelde lande (VSA, Engeland, Australië, en Nieu-Seeland) ingevoer is.

Alhoewel die politieke en sosiale konteks waarbinne onderwyshervorming plaasvind eiesoortig van aard in elke land was, was dit veral ekonomiese oorwegings, oftewel ‘n veranderde ekonomiese visie wat as stukrag gedien het om met hervormings te begin. Hierdie hervormings het ten doel gehad om die administrasie en die kurrikulum van skoolonderwys in hierdie lande te transformeer omdat gemeen is dat die teorie sinvoller met die praktiek aanklank moet vind. Die gehalte en relevansie van die traditionele onderwys is gevolglik sondermeer bevaarsgeke wanneer twyfel by die regerende partye ontstaan het oor die vermoë van sy land om selfgeldend binne ‘n globale kompeteterende ekonomie te kon optree. As ‘n vereiste vir ekonomiese superioriteit, is ‘n meer bekwaam en beter opgeleide arbeidsmag vereis. Die onderwys is as die sleutel tot ekonomiese groei beskou, waar leerders as ‘n hulpbron bestuur moes word om by die wereldekonomie aan te pas. Dit het vereis dat ‘n meer doeltreffende arbeidsmag met betrekking tot vaardighede en vermoëns opgelei moes word om meer effektief en dus meer produktief te kon funksioneer vir oorlewing in ‘n snel veranderende globale wereldmark. Die regerings het oor die algemeen voorkeur gegee aan ‘n gesentraliseerde onderwysstelsel ten einde groter aanspreeklikheid van die skole te eis en sodoende gehalte-onderwys te verseker.

By die aanvanklike implementering van ‘n UGO-kurrikulum is daar ook baie meer ooreenkomste as verskille tussen die onderskeie lande bespeur. Dit wil in die eerste plek voorkom of die idee van kurrikulumhervorming aanvanklik

---

Uitkomsgebaseerde Onderwys (UGO) op Geskiedenis as skoolvak in Suid-Afrika

vir die meeste onderwysers 'n aanvaarbare gedagte was. Onderwysers het byvoorbeeld aanvanklik positief rapporteer oor die eenvormige struktuur van die UGO-kurrikulum wat hulle in staat sou stel om meer doelgerig en spesifiek te kon werk ten opsigte van die beplanning van leerprogramme en die rapportering oor leerderprestasie. By al die lande ter sprake was daar ook ander groeperinge soos akademici, opvoedkundiges en ouers wat deurgaans kommentaar (dikwels negatief) oor die UGO-model gelewer het.

Voorts is in al vier die vermelde lande gemeenskaplike hindernisse ervaar wat die doeltreffende implementering van UGO in alle vakke, waaronder ook Geskiedenis, belemmer het. Die verabsolutering van die leeruitkomste het daartoe bygedra dat die assesseringsprosedures en-praktyke omslagtig, tydrowend en as kompleks ervaar is. Dit het die onderwyser se werklas aansienlik vergroot en onderwysers moes ondanks die gebrek aan toereikende indiensopleiding en kwaliteit onderrig-en leersteunmiddele probeer om reg te laat geskied aan die implementering van die UGO-model.

Die ontwerp en toepassing van die UGO-Geskiedeniskurrikulums het opnuut die oeroue debat tussen ondersteuners van die feitelike chronologiese inhoudsbenadering en diegene wat die vaardigheidgebaseerde benadering ondersteun het, laat ontvlam. Waar die UGO-model daartoe bygedra het dat Geskiedenis 'n onderdeel van 'n ander multidissiplinêre leerarea uitgemaak het, het dit nie net die vrees laat onstaan vir die marginalisering en voortbestaan van die vak nie, maar het dit ook bygedra tot leerders se onkundigheid oor hulle nasionale geskiedenis. In die geval van die VSA, Brittanie en Australië was daar byvoorbeeld sterk gesentraliseerde regeringsinmenging om te verseker dat die nasionale Geskiedenis sy regmatige plek in die skoolkurrikulum behou.

In Deel Twee van die artikel107 sal die besonderse invloed wat die oorsese UGO-kurrikulumraamwerke op Geskiedenis ter plaatse gehad het, verder bespreek word en sal daar ook gefokus word op die uitwerking wat UGO op die onderrig en leer van Geskiedenis in SA gehad het.

---

107 Kyk in Deel Twee in New Contree, 59, Mei 2010.
Indeed a very catchy title for a rather serious and – most of times – a time consuming and energizing process of doing and facilitating research in water from many disciplinary angles. The WaterNet funded the publication of this book in which five authors contributed, namely Lewis Jonker (zoologist and educationist at the University of the Western Cape), Emmanuel Mazungu (a research associate from the Netherlands working in Zimbabwe), Lorna Holtman (a post graduate of the University of the Western Cape), Innocent Nhapi (from the Faculty of Applied Sciences in Rwanda) and Hubert Savenuey (representing the Water Resources section of the Delft University of Technology & Unesco). WaterNet promotes Integrated Water Resources Management (IWRM) to support the process of developing research guidelines and aids that compliments a variety of discipline’s way of doing research and a drawing of conclusions. The Playing the Water Dance was such an effort by the leading authors Jonker and Manzungu.

A key concern as motivation for the development of Playing the Water Dance was the need for a systematic research process in the relation of water to people among researchers of different academic backgrounds doing water research together under the banner of an interdisciplinary methodology. The authors also expressed the hope that Playing the Water Dance will also be used by policy makers, planners and members of society. However, it will probably mainly be the academic researcher that should benefit the most. This “broader” utility focus is wining somewhat when the authors, on p. xvi, turn the discussion into another direction by stating that: “The idea of this guide was not to produce a treatise on conducting research in this wide and interesting field.
Rather the guide provides important hints on how to undertake research”. The “how” in so far then as research in water focused themes is concerned as viewed from an interdisciplinary angle becomes a second priority in the publication. Therefore most Chapters of Parts 1, 2 and 3 (accept for Chapters 4 and 7) can be seen as familiar texts to every post graduate student in all institutions dealing with research.

Two key differences that distinguishes this “guide” from the ordinary post graduate research guide are the easy going way in which it is written and secondly the more expansive and valuable Chapter 4 that explicitly focuses on important aspects of dealing with water as an interdisciplinary research theme in the field. However, the authors fail to be more specific about “interdisciplinary” other than the short section 1.4 in which the interdisciplinary approach is boosted. Critique is expressed by the authors against past “interdisciplinary” and “multidisciplinary” studies because these works express a so-called lack of understanding of the “intricacies involved in relation to how people use water”. Young researchers finding their way into interdisciplinary research and representing different disciplines and pre graduate training would certainly want to know how their discipline could contribute to Playing the Water Dance. Obviously it can become a daunting task to describe research possibilities in a specific theme such as water in all disciplines. An effort to acknowledge the variety and to describe their key utility worth within a theme such as water could provide a solid backing for a continuation of this discussion guide on how to deal with interdisciplinary research. Also the constraints between all disciplines regarding an accepted methodology, and an accommodation of methodology not familiar to your research repertoire as challenges, should be taken note of. A lack thereof are part and parcel of the reasons why some past “interdisciplinary efforts” have failed.

In Chapter 1 of Playing the Water Dance the interdisciplinary possibility is totally absent. It rather reflects well-known current trends in all disciplines, namely a focus on research in eg water based themes with a subject focus angle. It does not provide guidelines for that specific interdisciplinary touch to a theme. To not devote some sufficient space to some theory, and an impression on concepts and the theory of interdisciplinary research (according to the author’s statement on p. 9), do not suffice. This “guideline” or “reader” is precisely the correct platform for just doing that rather than going into detail into basic content that most post graduate researchers are perhaps familiar
with when writing a research proposal.

If “better research practice in institutionalizing interdisciplinary research”, according to *Playing the Water Dance*, is to be the focus (p. xvi) “to be developed fully” (p. 8), then theory and practice must be equally valued in a publication of this nature. It simply is not possible to understand and apply the one without the other. As a result the following questions, as examples of questions by young post graduate researchers and their promoters/facilitators on Chapters 2 to 6 may be expected because of vague and incomplete explanations or/and information:

- How do I develop a notion of interdisciplinary consideration into my research proposal. As it stands in the publication it reflects the subject only;

- Why do you call a topic “interdisciplinary research” but states that “Interdisciplinary research does not mean that all disciplines need to be included” (p. 8). Does it mean a few can be included or nothing at all when you deal with a theme outside the boundaries of your subject but at least focus on people??

- The methodology of all disciplines/major science groupings in certain Faculty boundaries don’t appear in Chapter 4. Neither in Chapter 3 (p. 28 top as example), nor as a possibility of a newly created combined design that may fit all shoes doing interdisciplinary research on the same theme but from various angles. The problem reflects itself in Chapters 4 and 5 where methodology applications only relate to some disciplines. The question then is how do you go about with research content that for example deals with the human side in research themes or deals with trends and historical events rather than models and theories (compare for example Section 5.6)?

To have insight in a “problem related water issue” is not going to be solved by existing and new theory only but rather through an efficient methodological approach accepted by all faculties to marry research on for example a specific topic in an integrated way. Whether the authors regard is as feasible or not, it was and is necessary to guide researchers through the methodology by providing some fundamental background on exactly what is perceived by “Interdisciplinary” and how/why it can (is said to be able to) accommodate all disciplines in the research design structure. Especially those in the Historical and Human Sciences. After all is said and done with, it *Playing the Water*
Dance definitely serves as a newly created basis from which the conducting of interdisciplinary research in water resources management can be done with the intention to debate, improve and eventually constructively build on these first valuable strides taken.